

EVALUATION REPORT

EV560

ASSOCIATION DES CAISSES D'EPARGNE ET DE CREDIT EN OUDALAN(ACECO)OUDALAN PROVINCE BURKINA FASO

BY

**The Joint ODA / Christian Aid Evaluation Team
May - June 1993**

CONTENTS

[GLOSSARY-EXECUTIVE SUMMARY-PROJECT BACKGROUND-PROJECT OBJECTIVES-ACTIVITIES
AND OBJECTIVES-ACTIVITIES AND NEEDS-REPRESENTATION-COSTS](#)

ANNEXES

[TERMS OF REFERENCE-SOURCES OF INFORMATION ON COSTS-FWY PROJECT ACTIVITIES:
BUDGETS AND EXPENDITURES.](#)

ABBREVIATIONS AND GLOSSARY

BD Bureau Departmental

BE Bureau Executif

BGV Bureau Groupement du Village

BSONG Bureau de Suivi des ONG

CFA CommunautJ FinanciJre Africaine (Financial Community of Africa)

CGV ComitJ de Gestion du Village

CTP Comite Technique du Programme

departement administrative area, including a number of villages

diguette A line of stones place along a contour, a soil and water conservation measure.

FCD SolidaritJ Socialiste-Fonds de Cooperation au Developpement

FWY Federation Wend-Yam

GA General Assembly

PRA Participatory Rural Appraisal

SPONG

TOR Terms of Reference

quartier Smallest administrative subdivision, within a village

Exchange Rate

UK,1 = CFA 395

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. The evaluation of Federation Wend-Yam (FWY) was carried out over a period of nine days, by a team including representatives from FWY, Christian Aid, ODA and two independent consultants. An emphasis was placed on the use of participatory methods of inquiry and analysis, including PRA methods. Field visits were concentrated on two villages, representing established projects funded by Christian Aid, and which were seen as being "successful" by FWY.

2. The report is structured around five of the evaluation objectives, and addresses issues of:

- a. the attainability of objectives;
- b. the appropriateness of project activities;
- c. the extent to which peoples needs are being met;
- d. the process of representation;
- e. project costs in relationship to benefits.

In the TORs specific recommendations are called for on each of these issues.

OBJECTIVES

3. The goals of the specific activities of FWY and those of the federation as an organisation as a whole should be distinguished. The formal overall goal of FWY is "to help farmers to do activities which will eradicate poverty". In practice, the primary role of FWY as a whole appears to be to act as a broker, gaining access to outside resources for peasant farmers in the province. FWY has not been involved in advocacy work on behalf of its members with other institutions in Burkina Faso. Growth in village membership and increased financial self-sustainability are also evidently important goals for FWY as an organisation. The goals for the lower level structures within FWY, the Bureau Departmental (BD) and Bureau Groupement Villageois (BGV) have not been formally stated, but their members see their function almost wholly as communication channels between the members and the Bureau Executif (BE) and, in the case of the BGV, as managers of projects funded by the FWY.

4. The objectives of the livestock and market-gardening projects were seen by FWY staff members in similar terms: increased dry season income, and, secondarily, increased food production for their own use. The objective of the literacy activities was formally seen as improved functioning of the FWY committees, but in practice most members and office-holders saw it as the education of their children.

5. The focus of Christian Aid project documentation is on the details of project activities rather than intermediate goals or the organisational development of FWY. Although there are no explicitly-stated organisational objectives for the FWY, informally there is evidently a strong concern for the development of an organisation that is representative of peasants views and interests. Unlike FWY documents, Christian Aid project documents refer explicitly to income-generation, particularly for women, as an objective in the case of the livestock project.

6. A major constraint on the operations of FWY would appear to be the project centred funding provided by the nine or so donors supporting FWY, which has resulted in FWY juggling around 20 bank accounts, each of which has its own cash accounts relating to different financial years. FWY staff have identified widespread illiteracy as a constraint on the efficiency of the office-holders at all levels of the federation, as well as on the informed participation of its membership. Action to remedy this problem has also been constrained by attitudes in the community, which are more in favour of children, rather than adults, gaining access to education.

7. It is recommended that more specific objectives for FWY as an organisation should be defined, particularly concerning its performance in its two brokering roles: providing access to credit and access to grant assistance (including technical advice). Repayment rates and growth of capital associated with lending operations, and speed of procurement of grant aid could be used as indicators of achievement. Improved performance in credit management will require the setting up of proper accounting systems which reflect the importance of this function within FWY.

8. At the level of specific project activities, donors such as Christian Aid need to establish, in dialogue with FWY, the extent to which equity of access between villages and within villages to credit and grant assistance should be of major concern to FWY. At present the lack of common and clear criteria determining who gains access suggests that equity of access is a low priority issue for the federation.

ACTIVITIES IN RELATION TO OBJECTIVES

9. The problem of unpaid membership fees had been recognised by the President of FWY and raised at the General Assembly (GA). With widespread non-payment of fees (estimated at 40%), FWY's potential for financial self-sustainability is limited, and claims of a membership of more than 6,500 members have little meaning, undermining the FWY's claims to be a significant peasant organisation. Responses proposed are linking grants of assistance to adequate payments of fees at the village level, and systematisation of fee collection at central and GV levels.

10. The President has already taken action to seek untied funding for the development of FWY. This could be complemented by existing donors focusing their future funding agreements on key aspects of institutional development, rather than the details of specific development activities.

11. Technical support available to villages involved in development-specific activities is limited in quality, and

this in turn is affected by low rates of pay, a problem recognised by the BE. It is recommended that donor funding should be sought for a base level of funding, to be matched by additional payments from the GV when they use the services of animators.

12. FWY staff have identified marketing and veterinary services as significant problems facing the livestock projects. Recommended responses are involvement in advocacy work by the FWY with the government to improve its members' access to government veterinary services and donor funding for specialist market research work, involving FWY staff.

13. The management of credit was cited by FWY (market-garden animator) as a problem area. The evaluation team's major concern was the poor level of knowledge, both at the level of beneficiaries and within FWY, about the mechanism by which Flex Faso, and FWY (through revolving funds) itself were involved in the credit provision. These problems could be addressed by clarification of FWY's goals in relationship to credit and its credit management procedures, referred to above.

14. Services, such as livestock and market-garden assistance have been provided to only a small proportion of the existing village membership of FWY. Bureaux Departmentals that were contacted report that the majority of their requests for assistance have not yet been met. Under those circumstances, and given problems of non-payment of membership fees, it is recommended that FWY should suspend further expansion of its village membership and concentrate its resources on improving services to existing members.

15. Criteria for the allocation of assistance between villages and within villages have not yet been clearly established, although members' opinions when canvassed seemed to be in favour of access according to ability to effectively use resources, rather than equity. It is recommended that, at each GA meeting, members should be informed of the distribution to date of all project assistance, by village and by value, so that they are then in a position to lobby the FWY BE for what they think is a fair distribution. At the village level, FWY staff should improve members' access to information about different allocation practices, so they can make more informed choices.

NEEDS AND ACTIVITIES

16. Within Loumbila Natenga and Godin, access to livestock and market-gardening project benefits was not concentrated amongst the wealthier households, but spread across most income groups (except the very poorest in Godin). Access was concentrated almost solely amongst adult families, in contrast with literacy assistance, which in practice mainly benefitted older children.

17. The majority of women gained access to livestock and market-gardening through their husbands, although there were limited measures taken in both cases to ensure that women received benefits specifically in their own name. Although men dominate bean production, women in Natenga were adamant that they received a fair share of the income produced, because their labour was critical during the harvesting period. Women in Godin undertook most of the work of caring for the sheep, but did not seem to have as assured access to the benefits from their sale.

18. Livestock assistance was not the highest priority of people in Godin, falling behind a primary school, a well, a dispensary and a cereal bank. Of the services provided associated with animal fattening, those that overcame the problems of distance, purchasing and marketing by FWY on behalf of the members, appeared to be most appreciated. Within the assistance provided to the market-gardeners, the most valued assistance was that provided earliest in the project's history, with recent training- focused assistance being least valued.

19. Benefits in terms of cash income from sheep fattening have fallen in the past two years, and other ostensible benefits such as manure have been given more prominence by both men and women, possibly to ensure continued donor confidence. However, demand for access to sheep loans still seems to exceed supply, and this demand is expressed by both men and women.

20. Benefits women associated with the market-garden development were the reduced labour required in watering compared with that required to water older lakeside plots by bucket, and the negotiating power that

joint participation in the harvest with their husbands gave them.

REPRESENTATION

21. Despite references to statutes and by-laws in many FWY documents, and the FWY president's public declarations, no formal provisions could be found in the current FWY statutes and by-laws concerning the system of representation and decision-making structures. At the very least, this situation makes it extremely difficult for the members to hold office-holders accountable for their behaviour. At worst, this is a dangerous loophole, which provides opportunities for unscrupulous office-holders to manipulate decisions in the name of unspecified statutes and by-laws. It is recommended that the FWY should propose to the GA, for its discussion and approval, detailed formal statutes and by-laws covering the different structures making up the FWY, representation on those bodies, their expected functions, and criteria for eligibility of the office-holders and members of those bodies.

22. The present procedures for representation of GV at the GA do not ensure fair representation of the different GV and are open to abuse. The unlimited number of voting participants allowed from each GV overcrowd the meeting and do not allow for constructive participation of those that do attend. It is recommended that the FWY should establish procedures for participation and voting which make ensure democratic representation in spirit and in practice. Those procedures should detail the maximum number of voting representatives that can be sent by each GV, the process of their selection, and the rights of observers versus those of voting participants. It is also suggested that the time allocated for the GA be increased to two days in order to allow more thorough debates on the policy and practices of the FWY.

23. At present, the Kulkinka members of the FWY dominate the BE, ostensibly because asking more distant members to participate in BE meetings is not practical. It has been recommended that broader participation in the BE could be achieved by:

- a. facilitating transportation for BE members coming from far, for example, by payments of transport costs;
- b. reducing the frequency of meetings to once a month;
- c. rotating the location of meetings, so that the burden of cost and time involved in attending meetings is shared more equitably.

Donors' assistance in the form of extra vehicles would be of limited value until the FWY has reorganised representation in the BE on a more equitable basis than exists at present.

24. The roles of paid staff member, and volunteer BE member with the responsibility of supervising FWY staff have been confused by assignment of BE members to specific tasks such as livestock animation, along with payment for their services. In the interests of improved efficiency and accountability to members, it is recommended that the FWY should separate the functions of voluntary elected office-holders and paid appointed staff, the latter being excluded from participation on the BE.

25. At present the role of the Bureau Departmental (BD) seems quite limited, to that of being a conduit between BGV and the BE. The creation of BD bears no relationship to the numbers of BGV that exist in their vicinity, some having one or two only and others having 20 or more. If the rationale for creating the BD has been to facilitate decentralized management, then their roles vis a vis the BGV, the BE and the technical committees need to be clarified; there should be consolidation of those BD with small constituencies, and the provision of appropriate resources, especially training, to enable the BD to carry out their functions.

26. Women are modestly represented within the BE, and on the BGV and CGV of two of the villages visited. However, the BE does not appear to have given much consideration to the role women members could play in the Bureau. The present incumbents, two organisers and Assistant Treasurer, do not play an active role in policy-making or advising on project formulation, and one seems to have been appointed with little consideration to the experience she should bring to the position.

27. Members' access to information about the functioning of the federation appears to be poor. No annual

reports on the federation's finances are presented to members at the GA or by any other means (or to donors). Discussion on the federation's activities in the last GA seemed limited. Individual GVs no longer have the opportunity to present their own reports to the AGM. At the level of individual GV, such as Loumbila Natenga, knowledge amongst members about matters which should have been of direct concern to them, such as funding available for seed purchase or pump repair, was lacking.

28. Judging from the growth in GV village membership the FWY appears to be a highly popular organisation which many groups want to join. This is an achievement which gives a positive image of the organisation. However, although the FWY is presented as a peasants' organisation, an instrument for the promotion of their interests, at present this does not go beyond mobilisation of external resources for the use of local groups. It does not address such issues as representation on behalf of peasants within government for access to credits, better marketing facilities for their produce, better extension and technical support, etc. The FWY works rather as a local intermediary NGO, and not as a representative of peasants as a socio-economic category. At the same time, there is no evidence that the member GVs feel a substantial sense of ownership in the organisation.

COSTS

29. For the majority of group members at Natenga, market-gardening on the initial site was clearly a profitable activity. Gross annual revenue in 1991/92 was almost CFA 1,700,000, despite partial failure of the second crop. The budgeted capital cost of this site exceeds CFA 6,388,845, though its actual cost appears somewhat lower. Over the next ten to twelve years it would appear that a positive benefit cost ratio should be established.

30. If some bold assumptions are made concerning future yields (approaching those of the comparably located Natenga site), annual revenues at Pousghin might approach CFA 6,500,000. Capital costs at Pousghin were budgeted at CFA 5,341,600, less than 80% of unit costs at the Natenga site, and are apparently considerably lower than budgeted. The Pousghin site appears to have a more positive benefit cost ratio than the Natenga site.

31. In Godin, the cost to farmers in financial terms of one sheep is around CFA 10,800 (excluding donor funded costs of animation and project administration). Although there was unwillingness to provide details on selling prices or weights, "profit" on the sale of the sheep in the past two seasons was said to range from CFA 500 to CFA 5,000, and average sale values in the last season were around CFA 12,000. This was said to compare with between CFA 14,500 and CFA 17,000 in the first season.

32. The continued demand for animals indicates that this level of return on a cash deposit of CFA 650 to 900, plus FWY membership fee, is attractive to many villagers. However, it was clear to the evaluation team that few participants appreciated the level of risk associated with these returns.

33. If expenditure on the literacy programme went according to budget the cost per beneficiary (50) per year would have been CFA 99,775. It seems quite likely that, had the same sum of money been given to the GV themselves to manage, rather than the FWY executive, then they could have substantially extended the numbers of people who could have been taught at that cost. In lieu of such a move, the decentralisation of literacy training, especially the elimination of food and accommodation costs, has the potential to reduce costs per head by 25%. Project accounts now need to be developed to the stage where the relative efficiency of different approaches can be analysed by FWY staff and members themselves.

34. The development of FWY's accounting procedures has not kept pace with the expansion in size and complexity of the operations it has become involved in. During this evaluation a number of problems were identified, along with some positive responses, in relation to: budget contents, management of revolving funds, use of advances, authorisation to make purchases, the use of financial data, management of cash-flow problems, auditing, asset management, and management of village accounts.

35. Major recommendations have been made concerning:

a. the use of external specialist advice in improving accounting systems and provision of staff training;

- b. separation of internal auditing and expenditure authorisation functions;
- c. transferral of management of revolving funds to the GVs, with appropriate external assistance;
- d. further investigation of market-gardening and literacy accounts with a view to identifying further training needs and revision of procedures;
- e. more attention by Christian Aid in future funding relationships to the development of partners' financial management capacities.

1. INTRODUCTION

PROJECT BACKGROUND

1.1 Christian Aid has worked with groups in Burkina Faso since the early seventies, initially responding to appeals for aid arising from the Sahelian drought. It now funds a variety of projects through twelve different partner organisations, including Federation Wend-Yam (FWY). Christian Aid's overall financial commitment in Burkina Faso for 1992-93 totalled ,160,000 and is one of their largest programmes in West Africa.

1.2 FWY dates back to 1985 when Kulkina village established a livestock project with the assistance of a Belgian NGO, Solidarite Socialiste-Fonds de Cooperation au Developpment (FCD). By 1993 the federation had expanded to incorporate more than 50 village associations (Groupements Villageois), and claimed a membership of around 11,500 people. The executive of the federation has twelve members, under the presidency of pasteur Wengoudy Zoungrana, the founder of Wend-Yam. FWY is registered with the relevant national bodies, BSONG and SPONG, having been registered as an official NGO since 1991. In addition to the projects currently being evaluated (livestock, market-gardening and adult literacy), FWY has diversified its activities to include grain mills, grain stores, credit, animal traction, apiculture, credit provision, afforestation, soil and water conservation.

1.3 The FWY statutes and by-laws do not give any details about the processes of representation. However, other documents produced by FWY state that FWY has a three-tier structure. For practical reasons, that structure is organised in parallel with the government administrative structures in the Ourbitenga Province, as shown in Table 1.

1.4 FWY is operational in villages throughout the Oubritenga Province, which lies immediately north-east of Ouagadougou. The capital of the province is Ziniare, though the hub of FWY's activities is the village of Kulkinka. FWY benefits from good road access to markets and supplies in Ouagadougou, with both Ziniare and Kulkinka lying close to the main Ouagadougou-Kaya-Dori tarmac road. The local economy is based largely on sedentary agriculture. Most of the population are Mossi and FWY activities are conducted largely in the Mossi language, More.

Table 1: FWY Organisational Structure

Government Administrative Structure	FWY Organisational Structure:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Representative b. Technical <p>bodies bodies</p>
---	-------------------------------	--

Province	Assembly General (GA) Bureau ExJcutif (BE)	ComitJ Technique par Programme (CTP)
Department	Bureau DJpartmental (BD)	
Village	Assembly General (GA) Bureau Groupement du Village (BGV)	ComitJ de gestion du Village (CGV)

1.5 Two FWY market-garden projects, funded by Christian Aid, are on two adjacent sites near the main Ouaga-Kaya road and depend on the Loumbila Dam for water supply. The two-hectare Loumbila Natenga garden was established in 1991, and has now been extended to include a further four hectares. A further six hectares have been fenced and prepared at the Loumbila Pousghin site. The principal crop being cultivated is green beans, which are exported to France through an export agency, Flex Faso. Christian Aid have agreed to fund the project for three years, providing a total of ,46,177.02 in three tranches.

1.6 A four-year literacy programme was drawn up by FWY for 1991-94 and is financed principally by Christian Aid. Approximately ,42,576.00 is being provided over the four-year period. The programme draws on the experience of Burkina's national literacy support services, and is to consist of two levels of teaching. The first focuses on basic literacy, and the second on follow-up application of literacy skills to increase proficiency, and to learn new technical skills. These courses were initially held in Kulkinka, for groups of 50 people who come to study for 60 days, usually during the dry season. This assistance is complemented by a short-term training programme aiming at staff and bureau members with some advanced level of schooling, to enable them to acquire some practical skills in the areas of management and organisation, funded by the World Council of Churches' Sahel programme.

1.7 The livestock project arose from a federation initiative in 1985 which hoped to capitalise on Kulkinka's proximity to the Ouagadougou market, where there was a ready demand for pigs. The project shifted its focus to sheep fattening in 1989 because of stagnating prices for pigs. Lambs are bought by FWY from Peuhl pastoralists in the north and sold, for fattening, to members, who are assisted by FWY with credit, initial veterinary care, feedstock, and reselling. Christian Aid has provided funding support to the value of ,15,000 during 1990 and 1991. As with literacy and market-gardening, the livestock fattening is planned as a dry season activity.

1.8 Christian Aid's rationale for the selection of the two organisations to be involved in the evaluation was stated as follows: "Apart from benefitting from ODA/JFS funding, Christian Aid judged that the two organisations had reached a crucial stage in their development and thus needed to be subjected to a rigorous assessment in order to help determine the nature of future cooperation between Christian Aid and these organisations." (AH, 11.11.1993:3)

TERMS OF REFERENCE

1.9 The full Terms of Reference (TORs), specifying the evaluation objectives, are given in Annex A. These were drawn up by a consultant to Christian Aid, Dr Alice Welbourn, and were agreed to by ODA and by FWY. They were taken to apply at two levels, to FWY as an organisation, and to three individual project activities (livestock, literacy and market-gardening) managed by FWY which have been specifically funded by Christian Aid. In summary, the TORs require that the evaluation examine six areas, as follows:

Project Objectives

To what extent are the project and/or organisations(') objectives attainable within the current economic, social and political context of the area?

Project Activities

To what extent are the activities being undertaken by the partner project and/or organisation helping them to meet their original objectives?

Needs

To what extent do the project and/or organisations(') objectives encompass the needs of different sections of the communities concerned...? Do the activities meet some of these needs, even if the objectives may not? What precisely is the relevance of the projects for the livelihood of the participating members?

Representation

To what extent does the project and/or organisations(') current management and administrative structure enable different groups to be represented?

Costs

To what extent do different community sections and project staff consider that direct and indirect costs... of the project are worth benefits?

Future

What perspectives do leaders as well as members and others have of the organisation and its future?

1.10 The description of these objectives was supplemented by a suggested research strategy, and by a request for recommendations in relationship to each of the six areas.

1.11 In addition to the above evaluation objectives, three other areas of specific concern to FWY were identified:

- a solution to the questions about remuneration for animators;
- how best it should accommodate its recent rapid growth within the necessary institutional constraints;
- possible ways and means of establishing its future independence from external agencies.

1.12 It was subsequently pointed out by Christian Aid that there were additional more implicit objectives held by Christian Aid and ODA, which were only partly addressed by the formal objectives. These included a concern for gender issues by both Christian Aid and the ODA, and the adequacy of marketing and rural credit issues, in the case of Christian Aid.

THE EVALUATION PROCESS

1.13 The evaluation was carried out over a period of nine days, from 14 to 22 May 1993. This period was preceded by a four-day workshop held in Ouagadougou at which participants (including representatives from FWY, ACECO, the evaluation team, and interpreters) discussed and practised Participatory Rural Appraisal (PRA) methods of inquiry which could be used during the evaluation. The evaluation ended with a one-day end-of-evaluation workshop (restitution) with FWY members and officials, at which issues identified during the evaluation were fed back to the FWY participants for comment and analysis.

1.14 During the evaluation, two-day visits were made to two villages, Loumbila Natenga and Godin. Shorter visits were also made to Kulkinka, Nagreongo, Pousghin and Sadba. Godin was selected from a set of 14 villages that have participated in the livestock fattening projects. All villages were ranked in terms of success in livestock fattening by the President of FWY. Godin ranked second out of nine ranks, and was selected because unlike the most successful (a Peuhl village), it was a Mossi village and thus more representative of the area in which FWY was operating. Loumbila Natenga was selected from the two market-gardening villages because production had not yet started at Pousghin at the time of the evaluation. Literacy activities were evaluated during the visit to Godin, but within the evaluation as whole they were given less attention than the livestock and market-gardening activities.

1.15 The first five individual TORs objectives were allocated to individual evaluation team members. In the case of objectives relating to representation and needs, the perspectives of women (as beneficiaries, non-beneficiaries and office-holders) were specifically examined by one team member. Because of the departure of one team member, Dr Chris Athayde, due to illness, the sixth objective, concerning future perspectives, was not considered independently but as part of each team member's own work on the evaluation objectives relating to objectives, activities, needs, representation and costs. This was consistent with the fact that the TORs specifically called for recommendations to be made by the evaluation team in each of these areas.

1.16 A full review of the evaluation process is given in Appendix C of the main report summarising the findings of the evaluations of FWY and ACECO.

The Evaluation Team

1.17 The evaluation team was made up of the following members:

Rick Davies Abiy Hailu

Team Leader Desk Officer

Centre for Development Studies (West and Central Africa)

Swansea Christian Aid

London

Elizabeth Wade-Brown Daniel Thieba

Economist Consultant

Evaluation Department GREFCO

ODA Ouagadougou

London

Lynn Muller Juliette Compaore

Independent Consultant Animatrice

London Federation Wend-Yam

Kulkienka

Burkina Faso

Gaston Ouedraogo Jacki Repila

Animateur Project Assistant

Federation Wend-Yam (West and Central Africa)

Kulkienka Christian Aid

Burkina Faso London

Marie Michella Some

Interpreter

AFRICOM

Ouagadougou

--o0o--

2. PROJECT OBJECTIVES

FEDERATION WEND-YAM'S VIEWS

Introduction

2.1 Within FWY it is possible to distinguish two types of objectives. Firstly, there are the objectives of specific activities such as animal fattening, market-gardening, etc. In an interview with Haly Ibrahim, ChargJs de Programmes, at least nine different types of activities were identified. These are managed by the Bureau de Gestion at the village level, and to a lesser extent by Technical Committees at the FWY level. Secondly, there are what could be called organisational objectives, the objectives of the various management structures located at different echelons within FWY: the BE and FWY staff, the BD, and the BGVs (see Table 1).

Organisational Objectives

Federation Wend-Yam and the Bureau Executif

2.2 In an interview with its President, the objectives of the FWY were broadly defined as (paraphrased)

"To help farmers to do activities which will eradicate poverty...To help farmers to be better-off...There are some activities people can do without Federation Wend-Yam. Others need money, materials, equipment. We look for partners to help with these".

Here, and in interviews with members of other committees, it appeared that FWY's purpose was widely seen to be as a broker, enabling the Groupements Villageois (GVs) to make contact with and gain access to resources from donor organisations, especially those based overseas.

2.3 According to the ChargJ de Programmes, a specific concern of FWY's Four-Year Plan is to ensure access to FWY project benefits by a wider section of the FWY membership.

2.4 FWY has been expanding its association membership continuously since 1986 after three initial years of stable membership. According to the President, in 1992 membership was increased by an additional 15 associations to a total of 56 associations, a 36% increase in one year. Growth in membership would seem to be an immediate objective of FWY. The objectives served by membership growth were not given by FWY staff but may include:

- a. wider access by farmers to FWY services;

b. enhanced legitimacy of FWY as an important peasant organisation in the eyes of other organisations that it has to negotiate with.

2.5 In an interview, the President distinguished FWY from other federations by the fact that FWY was set up by farmers themselves, not by whites or by educated urban Burkinabe with political connections. In that sense, one objective of FWY appears to be as an authentic voice of farmers. To what end, however? There was no visible evidence that FWY saw itself as having any advocacy role through lobbying other organisations in Burkina Faso on behalf of its members. An alternative view would be simply that such apparent authenticity helps FWY in its broker role, gaining access to resources from outsiders who have to choose what type of organisation they want to support.

Financial Self-Sufficiency

2.6 Over the past three years the FWY has been attempting to develop a four year plan. According to Haly Ibrahim, Chargé de Programmes, this plan is different from past plans in that substantial emphasis has been given to the goal of financial self-sufficiency. In the plan there is a proposal for the establishment of a training centre which will generate income for FWY by selling training services to people and institutions outside FWY. This is a two-year project that FWY is now seeking donor support for. It is expected that production activities undertaken as part of training will also generate income for FWY. FWY's desire, reflected in the TORs, that this evaluation look at "possible ways and means of establishing its future independence from external agencies" are also indicative of their objectives in this area. This is a markedly different approach compared with the past, in that, instead of mobilising funds in favour and on behalf of village groups, FWY is planning to own projects itself, with the aim of generating income for its structures.

The Bureau Departmental

2.7 BD are intermediary structures between the GVs and the BE. The number of GVs under individual BD varies greatly, from one in Dapelago (Godin) to 22 under Zitenga BD. In the reconstruction of the history of the Godin BD it seemed that its members saw their purpose as a Bureau being almost solely to act as a channel through which GVs could send requests for assistance to the BE. Asked why the GVs could not do that directly, they referred to the statutes of FWY, which specified that GVs must communicate to the BE through BD, and by implication that there could only be one BD per department. When asked about the differences between FWY and other associations, the only distinctions made were with the type of assistance that the others provided, that is, that FWY provides all types of assistance, whereas one other (Taab-Yinga) only does literacy.

The Bureau Groupement Villageois

2.8 In interviews with the GV at Natenga and Godin, the committees there appeared to have two objectives: management of specific activities, through management subcommittees, and communication with the BE about the villages' needs. It did not appear that the GV had any more general development objectives, or any specific local functions of its own.

2.9 In Natenga the Groupement Villageois distinguished FWY from other associations by the fact that it provided multiple rather than single sectoral assistance. This was, however, in the context of a conversation where they were visibly reluctant to make any distinctions between different groups and organisations.

Objectives of Specific Activities

All Activities Compared

2.10 In an interview, the President has identified diguettes as the most successful of all the activities that FWY had been involved in. The criterion of success was the fact that diguettes, through the retention of water on the land, had increased production of millet and sorghum, a commodity which he regarded as of the most basic importance in Burkina Faso.

Livestock

2.11 In the above-mentioned discussion of the relative success of different activities, the President identified livestock fattening as the second most successful activity. The reason given was that livestock provided an alternative source of income in a time of the year which is normally without income-earning opportunities (the dry season). A success ranking of the 14 villages involved in livestock fattening identified other more specifically-expressed objectives of this activity. They included:

- a. growth in numbers of sheep owned;
- b. accumulated knowledge about livestock;
- c. retention of profits from sales for further investment in animals;
- d willingness to use advice from FWY.

In an interview with Boukouno Noufou, a member of the livestock technical committee and the FWY Bureau, improved maize production as a result of manure application was identified as just as important, if not more so, than the cash earned from animal sales. However, the impression given was that this was an unintended, rather than intentional, objective of the project.

Market-gardening

2.12 The most widely reported general objective of the market-garden was the generation of dry season income. The President was also reported as saying that the production of food for consumption, and gifts was also important, but evidence from beneficiaries at Natenga suggested that they viewed these as secondary benefits rather than serious collective objectives.

Literacy

2.13 According to Juliet Compaore, the literacy animator, the primary objective of the literacy programme is the provision of literacy to members of the ComitJ de Gestion and other committee members at the village level, so they can carry out their responsibilities more effectively. The provision of literacy to beneficiaries of the projects, such as those taking animal loans, was also mentioned as an intended benefit. However, in success rankings of different villages' participation in the literacy programme, carried out by the animator and the President, the criterion of success which they used to rank villages was exam performance. In the absence of exam performance they were unable to judge the success of the literacy programme in a village.

DONORS' VIEWS OF OBJECTIVES

2.14 It appears that in recent years FWY has been supported by at least nine donors. They are, in approximate (diminishing) order of size of funding support: FCD, Oxfam Belgique, World Council of Churches, Christian Aid, Afrique Deux Milles, Band Aid, Cathwell (CRS), Cooperation Suisse and LVIA.

Christian Aid's Perspective

2.15 The project history document, based on Christian Aid's files on FWY, does not make any statements about the overall objectives of FWY as a federation.

2.16 In the descriptions of the individual project activities funded by Christian Aid, specific aims are described. In the case of market-gardening:

- a. "the principal aim of the programme is increased access to irrigated land for families in Natenga (57 families) and Pousghin (72)";
- b. "an agricultural extension worker aims to improve market-gardening skills".

2.17 The literacy programme drawn up for FWY for 1991-1994 is described as "essentially for FWY members engaged in project management". These are described as leaders of the village groups, members of the FWY

management committees, FWY staff members, and some members of the FWY Bureau. The overall aim of the project: "is to increase the educational capabilities of the members of FWY, particularly those actively involved in the administration of the federation".

2.18 The main aim of the livestock fattening project is described as "income-generation, particularly for women members of the federation, using local resources". There was also "a secondary aim of restructuring of the peasant federation, allowing better evaluation of existing FWY projects whilst increasing the commercial potential of projects..". A third aim is implied in that "the project also encourages the use and management of rural credit facilities for productive activities".

2.19 Project Memos, which are the means of securing funding approval within Christian Aid, provide an account of the activities being funded and the project holder as an organisation. However, the memos concerning FWY's market-gardening, literacy and livestock projects do not contain a clear statement of the objectives of these activities, either at the level of individual beneficiaries or at the level of the organisation in which they are participating. Nor do they suggest any indicators which would help identification of the achievement of those objectives, beyond the completion of the funded activities as described.

Oxfam's and FCD's Perspectives

2.20 These were not obtained during the evaluation. However, it is hoped that in their response to the draft of the evaluation report they will provide information on their views of FWY project and organisational objectives.

CONSTRAINTS ON THE ACHIEVEMENT OF OBJECTIVES

2.21 The following section is concerned with the problems of a complexity and breadth such as to suggest the need for changes in objectives. More specific problems that could be overcome by a change in activities rather than objectives are dealt with in Chapter 3.

Constraints Identified by FWY

On Literacy

2.22 Illiteracy is recognised by FWY staff, and some members, as a constraint on the functioning of FWY at two levels:

- a. the efficiency of the elected office-holders, especially GV treasurers and BE members;
- b. the informed participation of the broader membership, in GA meetings, and village-level meetings.

Information gathered in Godin suggests that there are major attitudinal constraints which will limit the participation of adult FWY members in any literacy programmes designed to improve the functioning of FWY. Popular views were that those who could best benefit from the literacy programmes on offer were the young. While some of these attitudes may be a reflection on the appropriateness of the content and method of the literacy programme, there was a clear impression given that it was simply not expected that the "old" could or should learn.

Constraints Identified by the Evaluation Team

On Brokering Access to Development Funds

2.23 A major constraint of the operation of FWY is the means by which it is funded by its various donors. All funding is tied to specific activities, which are detailed in advance of receipt of funding. There do not even seem to be budget allocations for overhead costs associated with individual projects, let alone for the central organisation as a whole, independent of particular projects. This has implications both at the central federation level and at the local association level. As is detailed in Chapter 6, one consequence at the federation level is that complex arrangements of borrowing of funds from different project accounts are needed just to provide liquidity. Other less acceptable uses of funds from different project accounts, also documented, seem to flow from this constricted funding arrangement. At the association level, the consequence of tied funding is that

there are long delays, of up to two to three years, between requests for assistance and the provision of that assistance. This is a cumulative result of the need to accumulate and pool requests into common proposals to donors, the delays involved in sending off and waiting for replies to proposals, and finally delays in implementation.

To Help Farmers to be Better Off

2.24 Selling services to non-members (under the proposed four year plan) will mean that FWY will have two constituencies (members and non-members), rather than one. It is possible that those who are paying the most for services will receive the most attention from FWY, and that members of FWY, who expect assistance in the form of grants or loans, will be given secondary consideration.

Access to Benefits by a Wider Section of the FWY Membership

2.25 FWY funds and provides technical support to a growing range of project activities. By necessity these have to be managed on a decentralised basis, by the GVs and the associated ComitJ de Gestion. Under these conditions it is very difficult for the BE, and its staff, to ensure that there is any degree of equity in access to benefits at the village level.

MODIFICATION OF OBJECTIVES

Recommendations by the Evaluation Team

2.26 The specific objectives of the federation as an organisation (as distinct from the individual activities it assists) need to be elaborated in more detail, before either members or staff will have any possibility of judging the performance of the federation against its objectives. The role of broker could be broken into two types of functions, and performance targets, or at least measures, could be set for both. In practice, FWY brokers access to two types of resources: assistance in grant form, and assistance in the form of credit. In the former group can be included both technical advisory services as well as grants of material assistance.

2.27 Given the considerable scale on which FWY is already involved in the management of various revolving funds, there is a serious need to set up accounting and other record systems which reflect the fact that this is a major function of the federation, not simply an incidental means by which its assistance gets to people. If done properly this should facilitate their broader objective of increased financial self-sufficiency and allow them to pursue (existing?) objectives of efficient and accountable use of resources. If these objectives are taken seriously, it will be necessary for **members and staff** to have access to information on the volume and total of loans disbursed in any period and the volume and value of overdue loans. This is not the case at present.

2.28 In the case of granted assistance one possible measure of performance may be the speed with which the FWY responds to a request, either indicating that no assistance is available, or if it is, the prompt delivery of same. Although the BD have argued that many of the delays experienced are due to donors' slow deliberations, it is most unlikely that there are no means by which FWY itself could not also shorten the response times involved. A simple recording system could be set up to help staff and members monitor performance. If the objective of quick delivery of service was formally adopted, the FWY would need to look seriously at the possibility of greater decentralisation of planning and management to the GV level. It may also lead FWY into the role of brokering access to other technical services rather than always being the provider of those services itself.

2.29 In the case of the literacy programme as it currently exists, it should be recognised by both FWY and Christian Aid that the formal objectives, described above, are not being pursued. Evidence from Godin and elsewhere suggests that the main users of the literacy programme are young people, not FWY committee members. Formal objectives should be re-formulated therefore, to recognise that fact. In doing so, however, it

would be useful to explore in discussions with the members at the GV level, what other measures of performance, apart from exam success, would be meaningful to them. If the skills and literacy of the committee members of FWY are still of concern, then separate measures should be considered, apart from the existing literacy programme (see Chapter 2).

2.30 Equity of access to Federation Wend Yam benefits within villages has not been explicitly mentioned as a sub-objective of FWY. Equity of access between villages was implicit in the ChargJ de Programme's interest in making benefits "widely available" but no more. Information provided in the restitution suggests that members are ambivalent on the importance of equity, and perhaps on balance favour access being determined by merit or capacity to utilise the assistance concerned. Donors such as Christian Aid need to identify what their own position is in regard to equity as a specific objective within FWY. Christian Aid's current view on this issue is that "there should be objective and transparent criteria for the allocation of resources to members or village groups." (AH, 11.11.1993:4)

3. ACTIVITIES AND OBJECTIVES

INTRODUCTION

3.1 The central focus of the following section is on those activities which are problematic in terms of achievement of their goals, rather than those which are not. The discussions are centred on particular activities, the apparent objectives of those activities, the problems associated with the activities and possible responses, in accordance with the TORs of this evaluation.

PROBLEMS IDENTIFIED BY WEND-YAM STAFF, REPRESENTATIVES AND MEMBERS

Collection of Membership Fees

3.2 According to the President, these are CFA 1000 per person per annum. Of this, CFA 500 is kept by the GV and CFA 500 is kept by FWY. The possible goals of this activity are increased financial autonomy for FWY, and more tentatively, identification of member satisfaction with services. The actual goals at present are not clear.

3.3 The minutes of the most recent GA indicated that the issue of unpaid membership dues has been raised as an issue of concern by the Bureau. In an interview, the President has estimated that approximately 60% of the members have been paying their fees. One criterion for his choice of Kulkinka as the most successful of the GVs was the fact that the members had paid their membership fees in full.

3.4 The evaluation team was concerned that membership fees are not being collected. In Godin, committee members of the GV reported that members there had only paid fees in three of the last six years. Male beneficiaries of sheep loans in the same village separately reported that they had not paid any fees, "but now that they had seen the benefits they would pay"! From inspection of the FWY's financial records, there appears to be no systematic attempt to record membership payments and arrears. Since there appears to be no integrated annual financial statement for the FWY as a whole, it has not been possible to identify the total amount of membership fees collected by the FWY; however, their receipt may have been recorded. To claim a membership of more than 6,500 has little meaning if people can become members of FWY at no cost.

3.5 According to the FWY staff, it was suggested in the GA that receipt of external assistance by individual GVs should be delayed until overdue fees have been paid. The evaluation team's view was that FWY should set up a membership fee recording system, based primarily at the GV level, but supervised by Federation staff. Individual GV statistics should then be aggregated into a total, reflecting membership income and growth in the Federation as a whole. Up-to-date information on the numbers of paid-up members should be presented in annual reports to the GA and to donors. This would give more meaningful information about the membership, in that only those who had paid their membership fees would have a right to claim services from FWY. Donors should also seek this information and treat it as one indicator of the value placed on the FWY by its members.

Obtaining Funds from Donors

3.6 The implicit goal of this activity is assumed to be to meet a wide range of specific needs of different GVs, on a timely basis. Most donor funds which are available are tied to specific project proposals. According to FWY staff, individual applications can take years to be developed, sent off and responded to. During this period people's needs may have changed, or may already have been met. Other GVs may then have to be sought to utilise the funds when they do become available. Supply then chases needs, as now appears to be the case with the apiculture animators employed by FWY. In addition, donor funds tied to specific activities often come associated with different specific accounting and reporting requirements.

3.7 According to the President, FWY is already involved, along with other peasant associations, in negotiations with a group of donors to establish a common fund for support of peasant associations in Burkina Faso. This may provide FWY with untied or less-tied funds, which can be lent to GVs for a range of purposes.

3.8 The evaluation team has suggested to donors to FWY, such as Christian Aid, that they should reconsider the basis on which they are funding FWY. Agreements reached about the use of grants should be concerned with features of FWY's institutional development, rather than focus on the objectives of specific project activities.

Provision of Technical Support to Specific Projects

3.9 At present this is done by through the work of animators, and the members of the Technical Committees at the FWY level. The implicit goal is assumed to be to enable FWY farmers to increase their incomes. The FWY identified lack of payment for animators, and the associated difficulty of recruiting and holding experienced animators, as a problem that should be addressed by the evaluation team.

3.10 The evaluation team was concerned that elected representatives on the BE are being paid as animators, making it unlikely that either function (elected representative or technical adviser) will be carried out properly. As FWY expands its services to its members there may be an increasing demand for a wider range of technical services. There is already a lack of technical expertise in the technical committees.

3.11 The evaluation team's view was that FWY should seek donor funding for a minimal salary level for each animator, to be paid by the Federation. This should be complemented, by agreement of the GVs with the BE, that they would pay a service fee directly to the animator, for the time he/she spends on their behalf. In return, the animators should be seen as being responsible to the GVs for the quality and appropriateness of the service they provide. The role of technical committees should be limited to that of liaison with Bureaux de Gestion on the overall quality of the technical and material services being provided.

Provision of Assistance for Livestock Fattening

3.12 The implicit goal is assumed to be increased incomes for farmers. Three problems were identified by the Livestock Technical Committee: first, the difficulty of selling the fattened animals for an acceptable price, particularly with last year's animals; second, the unavailability of the government veterinary service for treatment of animal health problems; and, last, farmers often do not understand the implications of buying with credit extended by FWY.

3.13 Three other problems were identified by the evaluation team:

- a. some farmers have had access to animals (loans in kind) when their first loans have not been repaid;
- b. there was evidence of unequal access to credit among the GV members (see below);
- c. it was not clear whether at present the livestock fattening is enabling people to make a net profit, when all costs are considered (see Chapter 6).

3.14 Although current methods of selling are recognised by members as unsatisfactory, no alternative solutions have been identified by FWY staff or members. No immediate solutions were identified by the evaluation team, either. It was clear, however, that there is a need for a systematic investigation of possible markets. This should include examination of the relative merits of producing different qualities of fattened

animals for local versus distant markets.

3.15 The problems relating to government veterinary health services would seem to be one area where FWY would have a strong mandate to take on an advocacy role, representing its members' interests *en masse* to the relevant authorities in charge of veterinary services.

3.16 According to Boukougou Noufou, a member of the Livestock Technical Committee, FWY animators and technical committee staff already invest a substantial amount of time in explaining the nature and limitations of the credit that is available. However, this education does not appear to be backed up by serious monitoring of loan performance or group level sanctions for bad repayment performance. If one of FWY's goals is to expand access to its services, such as livestock fattening, then action should be taken on both.

Provision of Assistance to Members Involved in Market-gardening

3.17 The main implicit goal is assumed to be increased incomes for FWY members. Another, seen at least by Christian Aid, is "income generation for women". Three problem areas were identified by the market-gardening animator (who is also a member of the FWY Executive Bureau):

- a. the need to spend a lot of time explaining credit arrangements to members;
- b. the need to ensure that credit that has been given out is repaid;
- c. the need to find market outlets for market-garden produce.

3.18 It appears that credit was being provided both by Flex-Faso, the marketing agent, and by FWY. Inputs were being provided by FlexFaso at no initial charge and the cost of these inputs was deducted from the eventual payments received after the harvest. In addition, according to the project documents some initial inputs provided by FWY were expected to be repaid and the money placed in a revolving fund to finance other development inputs. The evaluations team's main concern was that there was insufficient knowledge both at the village and FWY level about the way in which credit was being provided and managed through both mechanisms within the market-garden programme.

3.19 To the evaluation team, the need to find market outlets for market-garden produce did not seem to be a problem at present, although with continually expanding production of green beans there is some likelihood of a market collapse at some stage in the future. Concern about marketing may reflect some dissatisfaction with the terms of the contract, and this in turn may be linked to insufficient knowledge about the nature of the credit provisions built into the marketing arrangement, which seem quite favourable.

3.20 In addition to these problems, the evaluation team noted that land allocated for "women's plots" had not been developed: irrigation channels had not been constructed, nor had the land been cultivated. However, interviews with women who were the wives of male holders of plots which were in cultivation indicated that they felt they were getting fair access to the income generated, because both husbands and wives knew that the labour of women as well as of men was essential during harvest time. The impression gained by the evaluation team was that the "women's plots" were developed largely in response to donor concern about women's access to benefits. In theory, the land that now lies undeveloped could have been allocated to additional families, raising the number of families benefiting from 53 to 62, if allocated on the same basis as other plots.

3.21 Two responses to the above problems were identified by the evaluation team. First, as already mentioned, a more professional approach needs to be taken to the delivery of credit services by FWY. Second, if any market reserach is to be carried out its provision should be linked into a strategic vision of how FWY's services should be developed. Provision of appropriately scaled marketing advice to the members of FWY involved in various agricultural and livestock activities could become a major service, one where FWY could establish itself as having a significant comparative advantage. Development in this direction could be aided by training of FWY animators to develop basic market research skills.

3.22 The third problem, of under-utilised land ostensibly available as "womens plots", could in theory be

responded to by donor provision of further assistance for the development of such land, specifically for widowed or single women. The pursuit of this option, however, begs the question of to what extent FWY itself as an organisation wants to be concerned with equity of access at the intra-village level. If they do have such concern, then the adoption of internal FWY policy guidelines for allocation of assistance would be preferable to donor-led initiatives.

Membership Participation in FWY Meetings

3.23 The implicit goal is assumed to be the maintenance of FWY as a genuine peasants' organisation. The FWY members who participated in the Restitution recognised the problem of poor level of participation of members beyond Kulkinka and Ziniare, in as much as they proposed a solution that could be provided by further donor assistance. The evaluation team's main concern was that participation and representation in the BE is heavily biased, the majority of members coming from Kulkinka.

3.24 The FWY members have proposed that donors should provide transport to FWY to enable distant members to attend meetings. They have also proposed that meetings of the BE and other committees should be held on a moving basis, at a different location each time. The extent to which the latter proposal is acted upon in future by FWY may be indicative of how seriously the FWY executive takes the question of limited participation. (See Chapter 5 for a more detailed discussion of this issue.)

PROBLEMS IDENTIFIED BY THE EVALUATION TEAM

Accounting Procedures Currently Used by FWY

3.25 The implicit goals are assumed to be the efficient use of FWY resources, and increased independence from donors. The major problem noted was that there is no single coherent system for recording expenditure and income. Instead, there are separate systems of accounting for funds from different donors, and funds are transferred on an irregular basis between these accounts. FWY are likely to lose the confidence of donors if this situation is not remedied. The existing arrangements for monitoring the performance of all loan activities appears to be fragmented and disorganised. (See Chapter 6 for further details.)

3.26 Since this evaluation mission, FWY have already held meetings to consider how deficiencies in the accounting systems can be overcome, which have produced useful recommendations, whose implementation should be monitored. Dialogue should continue between Christian Aid and FWY, and hopefully other donors such as Oxfam, on their expectations of an adequate accounting system.

Expansion in the Number of Associations who are Members of FWY

3.27 There has been a continuous growth in membership for the last eight years. Membership increased by 36% in 1992 alone. The implicit goals are assumed to be increased access to services provided by FWY, and enhanced legitimacy of FWY in the eyes of donors and other parties FWY has to negotiate with.

3.28 From interviews with two BD, FWY is clearly meeting only a very small proportion of the expressed needs of the GVs. In Godin and Natenga, committees have reported waiting years for different forms of assistance they have requested. Poor levels of payment of membership fees also suggest low levels of satisfaction with FWY's services. Under such circumstances, legitimacy in the eyes of others achieved through growth will be a fragile achievement. FCD, a major donor, has announced a major cutback in funding in early 1993. The evaluation team recommends that FWY suspends further growth in association membership and concentrates its resources on providing better services to existing members.

Selection of Villages Eligible for Specific Forms of FWY Assistance

3.29 The implicit goal of this activity could be either equity of access to benefits amongst FWY villages or efficient use of the limited resources available to FWY. These two goals require different criteria of selection of villages and of beneficiaries within villages. It was not clear to the evaluation team what criteria were being used, in practice. In some areas equity was of some concern; in other areas (Godin) ability to make good use of FWY aid seemed to be of greater concern.

3.30 In the Restitution the majority of suggestions made by FWY members on how allocation should be made between villages favoured allocation by personal capacity. Comments included:

- "select those where animal fattening techniques are best known. This is better than giving to everyone, when everyone does not have the right skills";
- "groupement villageois must not have big problems, it must have sufficient resources. They must have information and understand the (sheep) credit scheme and its responsibilities";
- "the technical committee should make an assessment, look at the quality of fodder available in different villages".

3.31 Given these views, the evaluation team recommends that the FWY executive should make public information on the distribution of all project activities, by village and by value, possibly at each meeting of the GA. Members themselves may then be in a position to lobby for what they think is "fair" access to the range of assistance offered by FWY. The same information should also be provided in the annual reports to donors, even though those donors may see themselves as funding one or two activities in specific areas.

Selection of Individuals Within Groupements Villageoises for Specific Forms of Assistance

3.32 The implicit goals could be either of those mentioned above, equity amongst villages or efficient use of limited resources. The evaluation team noted that in Godin a number of families had gained repeated access to animal loans, while many others wanting loans had not gained access at all. Access to loans seems, according to reports from beneficiaries, to have been biased against younger males. In all villages associated with the livestock programme, men were deliberately given rights to more loans than women. In the Natenga market-garden, some families had up to three plots, in contrast with the majority, who had only one, and others were still seeking access to plots.

3.33 In the Restitution there were a range of solutions offered by FWY members as to how assistance should be allocated within the villages. These involved criteria of capacity, need and appropriateness. For example:

"can afford to buy skinny animals. If people start on skinny animals then they can afford to sell them easier on the local markets";

"loans should only go to those who manage the sheep best, support the best ones only. Find alternate economic activities for those not selected";

"prevent some (market-garden) producers from cultivating in more than one area (market-garden?)";

"allocate plots in accordance to size of families".

3.34 The recommendation of the evaluation team is that, with the assistance of the animators, Wend-Yam should review the procedures actually being used (as a distinct from the policy, if any) by the different GVs. FWY, and its donors, then face a choice as to whether they encourage the adoption of a specific policy across all GVs, or whether they allow such policy decisions to be made locally, by the members of each GV. If the latter is the case, then the FWY executive should at least ensure, possibly through a series of workshops on the issue, that local members are aware of the different approaches that are possible.

Provision of Literacy Training for Members of FWY

3.35 The assumed goal of this activity is improved competence of those who are holding positions in FWY

committees, and possibly, broadened access by members to elected positions of responsibility. At present, levels of involvement of illiterate committee members in the literacy programme are low. Measures of achievement cited by the President (passing of exams) have no clear relationship to the above goals. No indicators of impact on performance at committee level have been identified.

3.36 One possible response is that the FWY could establish and enforce conditions of participation in committees based on literacy levels. These would have to recognise that current standards are low, but set expectations of improvement. Such a recommendation assumes that the FWY sees the problem of committee member illiteracy as a significant one, and that there are sufficient potential committee members (literate and illiterate) around to enable FWY to discriminate on such a basis. Given the low levels of adult literacy nationally, this may not be the case in many villages.

4. ACTIVITIES AND NEEDS

ACCESS TO PROJECT BENEFITS

Between Villages

4.1 The proportion of the villages in the province who are members of the FWY groups was estimated at a maximum of 15%. At present there are approximately 55 GVs. Of these, the participation of those in the project activities examined during this evaluation was as follows:

Activity Groupement Villageois

Number Percentage

Animal Fattening 15 27%

Literacy 12 22%

Market-gardening 2(5) 4(9)%

Although there are only two market-gardens, approximately 25% of the members of the Loumbila Natenga market-garden group come from four other villages.

4.2 It was not possible to identify any explicit selection criteria used by the FWY to identify which village groups would become beneficiaries for which activities. From conversations with staff and from comments made in the Restitution it seems likely that expressed interest, and "capacity" were factors taken into account. But how competing expressions of interest and claims of capacity were resolved remains unclear, as was the way in which villages were informed of what options were available in the first instance.

4.3 In the case of animal fattening, the distribution of access between GVs appears to be very unequal, with those in the Ziniare department having disproportionately good access (Table 2).

4.4 Analysis of the significance of this distribution is complicated by the fact that new GVs have been admitted in varying numbers from most departments over the past few years when the livestock programme has been in operation. Over 25% of the current member villages have joined in the last two years (1992-93). The same difficulty applies to the analysis of the overall level of coverage achieved by the three project activities detailed above.

Table 2: Distribution of Access to Animal Fattening Project Benefits

Departement	% Of All GVs*	% Of All GV Doing Animal Fattening*

Ziniare	28% (15)	42% (6)
Zitenga	40% (22)	21% (3)
Absouye	16% (9)	21% (3)
Dapelago	4% (2)	7% (1)
Loumbila	4% (2)	7% (1)
Manin	5% (3)	0
Sourgoubila	2% (1)	0
Toughin	2% (1)	0

* Rounded off to the nearest whole number

4.5 The population of the province in which FWY is located is relatively homogeneous in ethnic terms. The majority of the people are Mossi, but there are a small number of Peulh villages. One of the 15 villages involved in animal fattening is a Peulh village. The relative proportions of different ethnic groups in the 55 different GVs were not identified during the evaluation.

Within the Villages

4.6 As with allocations of access between villages, criteria of access to the animal fattening project activities were difficult to identify (with the exception of access for men versus women, noted below). Being up-to-date with payment of FWY membership fees was not a criterion since beneficiaries identified in Godin either had not paid any or were some years behind. Cases were also found where loans had been given for additional sheep when the loan taken for the first sheep had not yet been paid off. There was no apparent limitation or rationing of access to loans per family, since some families had obtained repeated access to loans over a period of years, while other families had obtained none.

By Location

4.7 At Loumbila Natenga information on representation of the different quarters of the village in the market-garden was not obtained. Approximately 25% of the members came from other villages. In Godin the members of the GV came from within four of the six quarters, and within those, 62.5% of the livestock beneficiaries were concentrated within one quartier (Kinsi). Those participating in the literacy programme were more evenly distributed amongst the quarters.

4.8 Godin men explained the differences in the distribution of livestock beneficiaries as being due to where the programme first started (in Kinsi quartier), the fact that many people did not want to take risks until they saw what happened with others who did, and the slow spread of information through the quarters. They denied that such risk-taking was simply related to wealth, and stressed that success and failure was very dependent on the individual.

By Age Group

4.9 In Godin 95% of the loans for animal fattening that went to men, went to those that were married. Reasons given by some male beneficiaries for loans not going to young (unmarried) men, were that the young men are not settled in their way of life, and that they might emigrate to the cities and other countries in search of employment or trading opportunities. In the case of the literacy programme, more than 75% of the beneficiaries were young unmarried (male and female) members of the community.

By Membership of the GV

4.10 In the case of the literacy programme in Godin, the majority of those participating were not members (or members of families which were members) of the GV. In the case of the animal fattening programme in the same village, 80% of the committee members were beneficiaries versus 69% of the other members, - not a very substantial difference.

By Economic Class

4.11 In Natenga Loumbila a wealth ranking was carried out, with the assistance of a local male informant, using the names of 80 families from the village, including both FWY members and others. The categories of wealth/poverty which were identified, and the features that differentiated them, were as follows:

Group A (wealthiest). "They can solve problems of money amounting to CFA 50,000 and more If you visit them, you'll leave with a gift." (5% of households)

Group B. "They have liquidity. In the case of necessity, they don't need any help. They never sell their millet. They own substantial livestock."

Group C. "They possess small livestock and poultry that can be sold when necessary. They are not permanent borrowers".

Group D. "They are in constant shortage of food. They are not able to sell animals or something else to buy food. They ask the help of the richest group, but they are reluctant to help because of the difficulty of getting their money back. This group are permanent borrowers Although some families in this group have a lot of millet, they also have a lot of members to feed". (75% of households)

4.12 The informant commented in relationship to this ranking that:

a. In each of the four categories, there are people who do market-gardening. It is not the preserve of any economic class within the village.

b. Those who are economically successful in the village are those who manage to diversify their income earning activities. Even if they are market-gardeners, they also have other activities such as livestock. Market-gardening is not enough by itself to ensure economic mobility.

4.13 In Loumbila Natenga the allocation of plots between families and its relation to the size of the family and available labour would have merited further study, since some families have three plots and others only one. According to Flex Faso, the export agency, a man and his wife can cultivate three-six ares (preparation, sowing, watering), but four-six people are required for the harvest, even if children are working. Apparently, none of the families having market-garden plots hire labour during the harvest.

4.14 In Godin a wealth ranking of 45 households was carried out by a female informant, and led to the identification of four groups of households, which were classified by the wealth of the **women** in the household.

Table 3: Households Ranked According to the Wealth of Women

Members		
Household Groups	Distribution	% Having Sheep Loans

The Well-Off	13%	0
The Average	51%	56%
Those Who "Get By"	31%	36%
Those Beyond Assistance	5%	0

4.15 In the second group, out of 23 women, there were 11 whose husbands had a Wend-Yam sheep, ten where neither husband nor wife had a sheep, and two where the woman had her own sheep. In the third, less prosperous group, no woman had sheep, but five of the husbands did. No women in either the well-off or the very poorest group had Wend-Yam sheep.

Access for Women

Market-gardens

4.16 Looking at the original objectives of the project, there was no specific aim to target women individually as beneficiaries. Fifty-seven families were the proposed beneficiaries. In 1992, 24 women were allocated their own plots, which are half the size of the men's plots, and are also not irrigated. There are 50 men in the project, some of whom have up to three plots, but only 24 women, all but three of whom are wives of male members. On first reflection it seems as if women have been treated unequally: there are only half as many women beneficiaries as men, and their plots are smaller. Moreover, they cannot cultivate this land until it is irrigated.

4.17 There is no evidence, however, that women were negotiating to have their own plots, although they are happy and optimistic about this decision. In the time-line ranking, they ranked the allocation of their plots second (out of six) in importance.

4.18 According to the women themselves, the men suggested giving them the land, and organised a lucky dip for the allocation of each plot last July. The 24 women were chosen above the others because of their experience in handling the green bean crop. The explanation given by the animator, Juliette Campaore, was that in More culture the women could not have decided for themselves. They could not have demanded access to their own plots. But the event indicates perhaps that women nonetheless have means of communicating their wishes. It is likely that donor pressure too may have been a factor. In his visit in November 1992, the Christian Aid project officer asked the project management committee what they were doing for women, and indicated his wish to see plots allocated to women.

4.19 Given that the benefits appear to be shared between husband and wife according to family needs, the question is raised as to what the effect will be of women having their own plots. Additionally, it should be considered that, if women had not been allocated individual plots, they could have been allocated to a further nine families, raising the number of families benefitting from 53 to 62. This experience as a whole suggests that the role of gender-concerned donors in promoting change is a complex one, with potential ramifications that need careful consideration.

Livestock

4.20 At the village level the members of FWY did have an explicit policy on access for men versus women to credit for animal fattening. Men were allowed loans for up to five sheep each, whereas women were allowed loans for one sheep only. In Godin, out of the group of 40 women interviewed, about half were practising animal fattening, and the husbands of the others were doing so. The women in Godin saw the selection criteria for having an animal as being previous experience in raising animals, the ability to prepare a stock of fodder, and a shelter for inspection by the Committee. One woman said: "Mon mari a un mouton. A la fin de la saison, je prepare un stock de forage, dans l'espoir que le responsable va me donner un mouton". However, the first 12 women were certainly selected by virtue of having been involved in the formation of the GV, as well.

Literacy

4.21 According to the project history, in 1990-91, 50% of the people training in Kilkinka were women. The proportion in Sadba was not given. Within Godin women made up 17% of all those taking part in the literacy programme, this proportion being almost the same in each quartier.

PERCEPTION OF BENEFITS

By Male Beneficiaries and Members of the GV

Market-gardening

4.22 The main benefit perceived by all participants was the opportunity to generate cash income. Whilst market-garden produce can be used for immediate home consumption, this is only done when Flex Faso rejects the quality of goods delivered, although income from the sale of beans is used to buy cereals and other food items when there is a food shortage.

Livestock Fattening

4.23 The main benefit perceived by all participants was cash income, while considerable emphasis was also placed on the effects of the manure produced on soil fertility. This perspective seemed to be linked to the fact that prices of meat per kilogram (before slaughtering) were reported to have dropped from CFA 400 to CFA 250 in the last two years.

4.24 Although male beneficiaries in Godin reported that the numbers of people seeking loans for sheep fattening had increased from 17 in the first year to 30 the next, the figures for the last two years were not obtained. If possible, these figures should be sought from FWY for each village participating in the livestock programme, being in effect people's own judgement of the success of the animal fattening project up to now.

Literacy

4.25 The following views of the benefits of literacy were reported:

- a. literacy enables the elected representatives and members of technical committees (at the central level and at the village-group level) to read, to calculate, to take notes and to draw up reports;
- b. literacy enables adults to have better control of the modern techniques because literacy programmes are associated with technical training;
- c. literacy allows the youth to solve "several practical problems of the family"; it allows people to keep the memory and to gather knowledge. "If you are illiterate, it is as if you are in the dark".

4.26 These views are largely "normative": they are the benefits that the literacy programme might be **expected** to have, but not necessarily those actually taking place. In practice, the majority of those who have participated in literacy classes have been younger people and it is the heads of families who send young people to the literacy programmes.

4.27 When a mixed meeting of men in Godin were asked why it was that very few adults have taken part in the literacy programme, the answer given was (paraphrased):

"They are old, heads of families, they have not time available, so they will send the children, the older children. They want the young people to take over when they die".

4.28 Critical comments made by people in Godin about the literacy programme included:

- a. the villagers themselves buy the school stationery and they find it expensive;
- b. because there is no easy access to water in Godin women spend a substantial amount of time collecting water. This is one constraint on their ability to take part in literacy classes;

c. some people pointed out that if they miss a class there is no "remedial" class or other way in which they can catch up.

4.29 In Sadba the literacy programme was closed as a result of there being insufficient numbers of students. The number had dropped after the provision of food to the centre by FWY was terminated.

Ranking of Preferences

4.30 In Godin, over a period of years, the members of the BD have sent in requests for assistance to FWY for seven different activities: a school, a dispensary, a tube well, the repair of a dam, a teacher for a literacy centre, carts and ploughs, and a corn mill. The livestock programme was the first activity of all, and seemed to have been introduced to the village by the BE, leading to the establishment of the GV and BD. When asked to identify which of these requested developments had the highest priority, the BD identified the school and the bore hole.

4.31 In separate meetings with Godin GV members, it appeared that the cereal bank was also given a higher priority by the GV members when compared to animal fattening. One indicator of its perceived importance may be the fact that the secretary of the grain bank had been sent by its management committee to the literacy classes, whereas none of those associated with the management of the livestock programmes, including those involved in purchasing and selling, had been sent for training of any sort.

Livestock

4.32 The FWY livestock programme animator identified six forms of assistance which FWY provided. His ranking of these services in order of their importance was as follows:

- a. buying, because the markets are far away and FWY can look after all the documentation that is involved;
- b. medical care, because it reduces the risk of the animal dying before it provides a return to the farmer;
- c. credit, because without it people cannot afford the investment;
- d. selling;
- e. taking care of money collected for new animal purchases and credit repayments;
- f. advice to local livestock committees.

4.33 When asked to rank the same services in order of importance as the members of FWY might see them, he ordered them as follows:

- a. selling;
- b. credit and medical care, because if they get this they don't need any other assistance;
- c. taking care of credit repayments and money advanced for purchases of animals;
- d. buying;
- e. advice to livestock committees.

4.34 In meetings with beneficiaries in Godin, group purchase and selling of livestock were both appreciated because they overcame the problem of individual farmers having to find a means of travelling long distances, which in any case would be at their own expense. In one case, group purchase was seen as a substantial benefit because "he is too old and can't go by bike and cannot afford alternatives".

Animal Feed

4.35 In Godin families were faced with different ways of feeding their sheep: bran from husking, crop residues, and feed stock sold by FWY. The latter was least preferred because of the distance that had to be travelled to get it, whereas the rest were available on-site or nearby from other farmers.

4.36 Penned sheep were favoured over free range goats because of the higher levels of profit and the fact that their manure is collectable and therefore usable.

Market-gardening

4.37 At least twelve forms of assistance have been received by the Loumbila Natenga GV from the FWY: a pump house and pump, wire netting and pipes for fence posts, pump mechanic training, training in bean growing, food for workers building irrigation canals, the hire costs for machinery used to clear the land, benches, spades, picks, wheelbarrows, cement for canal construction, management training and training in tree planting.

4.38 When their relative importance (identified by a ranking exercise carried out by male plot holders) was compared against time when they received that assistance, the results indicated that the assistance that was valued most was that provided in the earliest stage of the development of the market (eg the pump house and pump, wire netting and fence posts). The least-valued assistance was training in tree planting, and management training.

By Female Beneficiaries and Members of the GV

Loumbila Natenga

4.39 The women beneficiaries of the market-garden project were unanimous in their assertion that the project had improved their lives and their family income. Whilst some indicators of "inequality" were noted, which might cause problems in the future, these were not perceived as such by the women themselves.

4.40 The introduction of the project has wrought changes in labour patterns. Before the project, women cultivated small plots allocated to them by their husband from the main plot; each woman had a place even if it was small. She cultivated a wide variety of vegetables, both for family use and sale. There were great difficulties in watering, from hand-dug wells, so the success of the crop depended on the physical strength of the woman. Even if fertiliser was purchased, the crop could fail for want of watering.

4.41 Although women were not involved in the inception of the project, they were fully informed by their husbands as negotiations progressed. They continued cultivating their own plots until their labour was required full-time during the season. Women contributed equally in terms of labour, but particularly mentioned watering and harvesting. Because of this they have abandoned their former plots along the lake shore; they have no time to cultivate them.

4.42 The women judged these changes positively, for the following reasons:

- a. before, most of their time was spent in watering, often with poor results;
- b. on the current crop, watering is much easier, because of the irrigation and the pump;
- c. during harvest, women have to spend all day in the field, picking the beans (to meet the precise delivery schedule of the exporter, Flex Faso), but they only have to do this every second day, so they have every other day when they can do the washing, cooking, etc;
- d. the crooked beans, or ones with holes are put to one side by the women. They can then cook them for the family, or sell them to buy relish;
- e. they are much less tired than when they worked their own plots;
- f. working alongside the men, seeing the beans weighed, the women have a good idea of what their husbands earn. They know when they can ask for money, so there are fewer arguments!

4.43 Since women themselves have discussed the benefits very much in family terms, their own plots should perhaps be seen as enabling them to contribute to family income rather than developing an independent source of income. We were rebuked for pursuing this line of questioning. "In the past, when you had money,

you would prepare food. It's not like in town, where you wait for the man to provide. Here, men and women cooperate. When you cannot prepare the food, the man knows it is his turn."

4.44 Given the labour patterns that have emerged so far, the only way women will be able to cultivate those plots is if the men prepare the irrigation channels, and also contribute their labour. There is no evidence of paid or non-family labour being used so far. The three women who were allocated plots, but whose husbands were not, had worked on the crop, receiving only reject beans in return. Will men have time to work on women's plots?

Godin

4.45 It was clear that finding the cash deposit is not a barrier for many women who want to do animal fattening. Many had come to the meeting with the evaluation team to give voice to their wish to have an animal of their own. Discussions with the animal fattening animator led to the conclusion that popular demand exceeds Wend-Yam's capacity to service both the loans and the supply/marketing of animals.

4.46 The resale prices in 1991 were lower than before, but, despite the decrease in price, women still judged animal fattening to be a worthwhile activity. The sale takes place during the "dead season" when family income is at its lowest, so it provides income for the purchase of food at a critical time. In the last sale, some women made no financial gain, but they judged the provision of compost from the animals to make a significant increase in the yield of family fields, and therefore family nutritional status. This they regard as a benefit almost equal to the cash income.

4.47 The women explained in great detail about the preparation before the sheep arrived, and the care of the sheep, which men did not mention. This suggests that women are principally involved in the care of animals being fattened, whether or not they own them. One informant mentioned the importance of having daughters-in-law to assist in the care of the animals and to provide bran from pounding the rice, which is used as animal feed.

4.48 The credit system allows women to keep their own money for other purchases or emergencies: "I never bought a sheep before the project. The credit permits me to keep some money aside for the unexpected, which I would not otherwise be able to do. The fact that I have taken credit makes me work hard to be sure that I can repay it."

4.49 Wend-Yam takes care of the purchase and sale of the animals. Although this reduced beneficiaries' control of the enterprise, there was no indication that they were unhappy with this arrangement. In remote areas it is doubtful whether women could participate in the activity without this support. Although they could fatten local animals, the benefit would be less, because Wend-Yam animals, imported from the North, are a better breed for fattening.

4.50 It would not be fair to judge FWY's policy on women exclusively on the two Christian Aid funded projects examined during this evaluation, since these are not necessarily representative of all FWY's projects and their effects on women. Grinding mills and borehole projects may have a more direct impact on women members' lives.

5. REPRESENTATION

FORMAL PROVISIONS

Provisions for Representation

5.1 The structure of FWY is outlined in Chapter 1. The GA meets twice a year. In principle, it is the highest decision- and policy-making body and its membership is made up of representatives from all of the GVs. The BE (or the Provincial Bureau) is composed of 12 members elected by the GA for a term of two years, renewable once. The BD is composed of 12 members elected by all the GV belonging to the same departement. The BV is also composed of 12 members elected by the members of the GV in its own general

assembly. In theory the village GA takes place every two months.

5.2 The technical committees are expected to support the BE and the BGV in their running of particular activities, such as animal fattening, cereal banks, market-gardening. According to the President, the CTP is composed of "the amateurs of the programme and resource persons chosen by the Federation and who accept to serve their peasant brethren". It is unclear, however, how many people and how the resource persons are selected. In CTPs such as literacy they are composed of representatives from each village having a literacy centre, a few members of the BE and the FWY literacy animators.

5.3 The CGV has also the role of liaising between the CTP and the direct beneficiaries. The composition and the criteria for membership to CGV is unclear. It is technically supported by the FWY amateurs, who assisted the members through training, in the running of their activities, along with other BGV members (cf proposals for FWY literacy programmes, 1990).

Formal Functions

5.4 According to FCD reports, the functions of the BE, BD and BGV are supposed to be as follows:

- a. The BE implements the decisions of the GA, develops projects and programmes, is responsible for their financial management and monitors progress. The BE meets once a week and members of the BE provide their services to FWY free of charge.
- b. The BD liaises between the BE and the village committees, it supervises activities developed by FWY in the area, it reflects the opinions and concerns of the GV to the BE and looks for solutions. The BD meets once a week and it meets the BE each last Thursday of the month at Kulkinka, the location of the Federation's headquarters.
- c. The BGV organises activities on the village level with the support of the CGV.

5.5 The role of the BD appears to have been downgraded in recent years. In the past, the BD itself had a technical wing, and the role of the BD was given greater emphasis. A report written by the Belgian volunteer from FCD, who helped with the restructuring of the FWY as a peasant organisation, insisted on the importance of the BD for the FWY, in that they:

- a. assure the link between the project administration and the beneficiaries of the programme;
- b. organise groups and channel the aspirations of their members;
- c. control credits and rolling funds provided.

5.6 At present it appears that there are two links between the BE and the individual GVs. One is through the BD, the elected intermediary body. The other, which bypasses the BD, is through the two technical committees (CTP and CGV), which are in contact with each other, and whose members are nominated rather than elected. It is unclear on what statutory basis the change on the organogram has been made and why the BD has lost its original importance. The report by P J Laurent indicates that the logic behind emulating the government administrative set-up by the Federation (i.e. having an intermediate or BD level) has been to keep the distance of members from decision-making bodies to within 50km from their villages.

5.7 At present it appears, from conversations with BD members in Loumbila Natenga and Godin, that the BD functions solely as a channel for passing information, mainly requests for assistance, upwards to the BE. The BD did not seem to have any managerial functions which set it apart from the BGV. Since there appears to be a substantial overlap between BGV and BD membership, even the role of communicating requests to the BE does not seem to be uniquely that of the BD. In fact, the BGVs have direct access to the BE. Communication concerning problems of existing activities appears to be dealt with through the technical committees, and has nothing to do with the BD. Under these circumstances, the rationale for the continued existence of BD seems very unclear.

Recommendations

5.8 Despite references to statutes and by-laws in many FWY documents and the FWY president's public declarations, no formal provisions could be found in the current FWY statutes and by-laws as regards the system of representation and decision-making structures. At the very least, this makes it extremely difficult for the members to hold office-holders accountable for their behaviour. At worst, this is a dangerous loophole which provides opportunities for unscrupulous office-holders to manipulate decisions in the name of unspecified statutes and by-laws. It is recommended that the FWY should propose to the GA, for its discussion and approval, detailed formal statutes and by-laws covering the different structures making up the FWY, representation on those bodies, their expected functions, and criteria for eligibility of the office-holders and members of those bodies.

REPRESENTATION IN PRACTICE

The General Assembly

5.9 The status of those who participate in GA meetings appears confused. The GA is composed of delegates coming from the GVs which are federated to the FWY. Although it is the GVs as such who become members of the Federation, it is in fact individuals who participate at the GA. According to the FWY President, "An individual may be a member of the FWY, although he cannot be a 'groupement'!"

5.10 In the last GA, GVs were asked to send at least 15 delegates each to the GA. This is well above the maximum number of bureaux members of the GV. In fact, according to informants at Loumbila Natenga, there is no actual requirement that BGV members participate in the GA. If all the GVs had responded positively, this would have meant that at least 825 people (representing the 55+ GV members of the FWY) would have participated in the GA.

5.11 It is unclear what the rationale is behind having such a large gathering take place at Kulkinka twice a year. In theory, one objective could be facilitating direct participation for all members at the highest decision-making body. In practice this would be extremely difficult. Such large gatherings will give the chance only for the more dominating and influential members to address the meeting, while the vast majority would have to be passive listeners, and at worst, the GA will only serve as resolution-passing machinery. During a discussion with the BD of Loumbila, most participants at the GA were unable to recount what was discussed and decided at the GA. When asked why they do not recall what was said, the answer was "There was no loudspeaker and the people sitting far away missed what was being said. Anyway, people would only recall something if it directly concerns their GV".

5.12 An alternative explanation may be that such large meetings enable the BE to put on a demonstration of force of numbers, which helps confirm its legitimacy in front of the provincial authorities and those donor representatives invited to attend the GA as observers.

5.13 Apart from the problem of effective participation in mass meetings, the existing policy on representation is simply inequitable. To the extent that "one person one vote" is guaranteed to all participants, the villages who manage to send more people will have greater representation in votes compared to the GVs with fewer participants at the GA, not to mention those with none. In the 1989 GA, 29% of the 52 participants were from Kulkinka. In 1992, 15% of the 485 participants were from Kulkinka, although their GV was only one of 55.

5.14 The problem of open participation and voting described above is also replicated at the BD level. Participation in meetings held to elect people to the BD is completely open.

Recommendations

5.15 The procedures for representation of GV at the GA do not ensure fair representation of the different GV and are open to abuse. The unlimited number of participants overcrowd the meeting and do not allow for constructive participation of those that do attend. It is recommended that the FWY should establish procedures for participation and voting which ensure democratic representation in spirit and in practice. Those procedures should detail the maximum number of voting representatives that can be sent by each GV, the process of their selection, and the rights of observers versus those of voting participants. It is also suggested that the time

allocated for the GA be increased to two days, in order to allow more thorough debates on the policy and practices of the FWY, and also to give participants a chance to get to know one another better.

The Bureau Executif

5.16 According to President, at the last GA, a 'novel' system of representation was adopted to fill up the offices of the BE. Notably, the Kulkinka GV was made to assume the role of the BE of the FWY. This was justified by the fact that the increased frequency of meetings required for the BE members (statutes reportedly require meetings every Thursday, but the General Secretary says they happen every day). As a result, distances and problems of transportation would make it impractical to involve elected members from distant villages.

5.17 The President said that they system has been devised to bring the BE closer to the BD and to the villages. Each member of this newly-constituted BE will have responsibility for supervising and re-dynamising the various BD by paying three visits per month, one of which would include participation at the monthly BD meetings. The visits are also intended to make BD members more aware of FWY's philosophy and thus it is hoped they would in turn become better supervisors of the GV. During the Restitution, one of the three sub-groups, mainly constituted of women, supported the idea that the BE should be composed of people from the Kulkinka area, on the grounds that they were the most dynamic members.

5.18 This development should be of concern to both members and donors. First, it excludes 73% of GVs from participation in the BE, since GVs within the Ziniare Departement represent only 27% of the GV membership. This imbalance was openly admitted at the Restitution by the President, who recognised that it needed redress.

5.19 Second, despite the fact that this proposal has been accepted by the GA (according to the President), the minutes of the GA do not give any account of the GA's decision to concentrate office-holders at the BE from the Kulkinka area only.

5.20 Third, the allocation of supervision workloads to the BE members is inequitable, and, at best, likely to be inefficient in practice. Zitenga Department, with 23 GVs, and Loumbila Department, with two GVs, are both given equal supervision, by one BE member each. Some of those BE members also have other tasks, as the animators of specific activities, which give them responsibilities across a number of Departments.

5.21 Even if the proposal is accepted for its stated intention, the problem of transport, which reportedly prevents distant GV members from attending frequent BE meetings, still remains one which the BE members themselves will have to resolve if they are serious about doing three supervisory visits to BD meetings per month. Concentration of membership of the BE in one Departement simply moves the location of the problem.

Other Issues Concerning the Bureau Executif

5.22 As indicated above, a number of members of the BE are not only elected representatives of the members of FWY but are also paid staff members of FWY. As employers, they are responsible for voluntarily supervising the work of the paid FWY staff, while being one of those staff themselves. Such a combination of roles is in practice untenable, and weakens the accountability of the organisation to its members. The evaluation team noted one example of an animator who had a poor knowledge of the area he was responsible for, and who was also a member of the BE and therefore not easily criticised by other FWY staff, or supervised by the BE as a whole.

5.23 The statutes of FWY state that the BE should be renewed every two years and that the same people may hold office for a maximum of two terms. In theory, the limitation on re-appointment could cause the FWY to lose access to the accumulated experience held by committee members. In practice, this does not appear to be a problem, since provisions for renewal of committee membership do not seem to have been followed. There was a four- year gap between the last two elections held for the BE (1989, 1993). At the level of the BGV, it appears that there are very rarely any renewals of committee membership.

Recommendations

5.24 The FWY BE should reflect seriously, as promised at the workshop, on how all Departements may participate in the BE, regardless of distance. This could be achieved by:

- a. facilitating transportation for BE members coming from afar, for example, by payments of transport costs;
- b. reducing the frequency of meetings to, say, once a month;
- c. rotating the location of meetings, so that the burden of cost and time involved in attending meetings was shared more equitably.

5.25 Donors should not provide assistance in the form of extra vehicles unless and until the FWY has reorganised representation in the BE on a more equitable basis than exists at present.

5.26 The FWY should separate the functions of voluntary, elected office-holders and paid appointed staff, the latter being excluded from participation on the BE. The members of the BE currently holding regularly-paid jobs should give up their elected mandate, or their jobs. The members of the BE should serve their organisation without payment, but the expenses incurred on duty should be paid by the FWY. All situations leading towards the dependence of elected members on the organisation for their livelihood should be avoided.

5.27 The logic of the current BD structures should be reviewed, especially that of having one BD per government Departement, regardless of the numbers of GVs in that Departement. The alternative is to merge a number of BD with few GV members into one BD until their GV membership grows large enough to warrant separate representation. If the rationale for creating the BD has been to facilitate decentralized management, then their roles vis B vis the BGV, the BE and the technical committees need to be clarified, and appropriate resources, especially training, provided. This analysis could be carried out with the help of facilitators with expertise in peasant organisations, such as GREFCO.

Table 4: Representation of Women on FWY Structures

Administrative body	Women	Men
	3	9
WY Bureau Executif	3	12
Salaried staff	6	12
Loumbila Natenga GV Bureau	0	3
Loumbila Natenga CGV		
Godin GV Bureau		
Godin CGV	2	9
	3	3

Women's representation

5.28 Representation of women on the various FWY structures was identified, as shown in Table 4. The BE does not appear to have given much consideration to the role women members could play in the Bureau. The present incumbents, two organisers and an Assistant Treasurer, do not play an active role in policy-making or giving advice on project formulation. In particular, the wisdom of the "election" of a school leaver with no previous work-experience to the position of Assistant Treasurer could be queried. In an elected body it would be expected that the members could act in an advisory capacity, by virtue of their age and life experience. At present, the Assistant Treasurer has an implementing rather than an advisory or surveillance role, and should therefore be re-appointed therefore, as a member of the salaried staff.

5.29 In Loumbila Natenga the women GV committee members meet separately from the men, because their daily timetable is different, so they are not free at the same time. The purpose of their meetings seems to be to give advice rather than make decisions. They did meet well before the haricot bean project started, to get to know each other. The women's committee has a president, treasurer, commissaire aux comptes, secretary, two organisers, and a work-organiser for the green bean cultivation.

5.30 In Godin, the president of the women's section of the association reported that the women had worked for 12 years to get the association started. Since she was a formative member, she had every opportunity to see how people participate; she felt this helped her to have the courage to apply for a sheep and also to be able to speak in meetings. Many people were unwilling to participate: they thought it would be a lot of work. Only after seeing the programme in practice did more people apply for sheep credit. Women see that, when the sheep is sold, that family has some money left over for buying a few things.

Recommendations

5.31 FWY should undertake affirmative action to ensure that more suitable women eventually join the Bureau Executif. It is suggested that the equivalent of pre-election awareness training, for potential female candidates, should be included in the general awareness training for women, which is conducted by the animatrices.

5.32 If women's interests are to be safeguarded, project proposals should explicitly include information on which women will benefit, in what way, and how those benefits will be ensured. This has not been the case so far with project proposals that have been sent to Christian Aid. Assistance in doing so, and in providing the awareness training mentioned above, could be obtained by establishing a link with women's organisations in Burkina Faso, perhaps complemented by the creation of a women's cell, with staff specially appointed to address these issues.

5.33 FWY should consider whether women should be in sole charge of the selection of women beneficiaries, and whether the strategy of a women-only committee could improve women's participation. This strategy may not work for all projects, but it could be tested, for example, in animal fattening. Giving women more responsibility via women-only committees could equip them for a more participatory role in integrated committees later.

Access to Information

5.34 In the last GA the BE did not present a statement of the state of the federation's finances. If the members are not given such information, it is not possible for them to hold the BE or the paid staff accountable for their actions, or to take part in decisions about the future of the organisation, in an informed manner.

5.35 While information was presented on the activities of the federation, this report was not made the subject of an open discussion by members. In the past, the GA has been an occasion where the individual GVs presented information on their own project activities and heard those presented by others. Obviously the rapid expansion of FWY through recruitment of new member GVs may make it impractical to compress reports from member GVs into a one-day GA, but other ways, such as using the BD to provide reports on their areas, could be explored.

5.36 Judging from the minutes of recent GA meetings, the information that does flow through the FWY structure appears to be limited to vertical communication between FWY and its constituent parts. It appears that a substantial period of time during the GA is allocated for speeches and matters of protocol. The equally, if not more, important horizontal communication among the GVs - sharing of their experience and discussion of common problems - seems to have been neglected by FWY.

5.37 Access to information by ordinary members of the GV, about matters discussed at the GA level, is likely to be very limited if the representatives from the GVs attending the GA cannot themselves recall what was discussed and decided. This appeared to be the case in Loumbila Natenga.

5.38 In the same village, even the members of the BGV appeared to be poorly informed about matters which should have been of direct concern to them. They did not know that rotating funds were available for the

purchase of seeds, fuel, fertilizers etc, for the market-garden. Although they believed that they were having an unfavourable deal from Flex-Faso (who supplies these inputs and retains its dues at source from the export of their beans), they thought that they were confined to Flex Faso, owing to their inability to raise their own funds for these costs.

5.39 Furthermore, no clear-cut arrangements appear to have been made between themselves and FWY regarding responsibility for repairs and maintenance of water-pumps. Small repairs have been paid for by the market-gardening group's savings of CFA 500 per member per year. Bigger repairs, such as replacement of a piston costing CFA 80,000, have been paid by FWY. Despite these events, the members could not identify any guidelines as to when expenses were to be borne by FWY and when by themselves. Lack of clear guidelines on the responsibility of each party creates uncertainty on the part of the GVs as regards their rights and responsibility and will increase their dependence on FWY.

Ownership

5.40 Judging from the growth in GV village membership, the FWY appears to be a highly popular organisation which many groups want to join. This is an achievement which gives a positive image of the organisation. Of importance for the consolidation of the organisation, however, is the level of commitment of the existing members to FWY, and this in turn depends on how they see their relationship to the organisation. To the question of whether the Federation belonged to them, the BD both at Loumbila and Godin answered in the affirmative. According to the Loumbila BD:

"The Federation is a union of all the GVs and not only that of Kulkinka. The Federation is as advantageous for them as they are advantageous to the Federation. For when the Federation requests donors on their name, donors will have confidence in it. From the project's implementation, the Federation gains benefits, this would increase its prestige." (Paraphrased).

5.41 One reason given, in Godin, for joining the Federation was as follows (Paraphrased):

"One village cannot do everything on its own; many villages together would be able to do better for they exchange and learn from other's experience. By associating with others would enable us to face problems better. By being together we would have mutual confidence and when we put request to donors they would have confidence in us."

5.42 Not all members have such an idealistic view of the advantages to be had from solidarity between one another. It was rather the utilitarian aspects of having benefits from FWY which appeared to be the overriding attraction of the FWY. According to the BD of Zitenga at Sadba (Paraphrased):

"Many GVs are attracted to FWY to obtain experience and to work better for their villages. For instance, when we want to construct anti-erosion contours, transporting stones by truck is easier than doing it by bicycles as it would reduce workload. The Federation has opened the eyes of the peasants; it supports them in many ways. When they face difficulties with hard work during the lean season, the Federation helps them with food. Besides, peasants would not even have enough money of their own to buy four donkey carts, which they can now, thanks to the Federation. There you see the building: it is the literacy centre that we got thanks to the Federation. In Batenga, they got a cereal bank and a literacy centre. At Sadba we obtained anti-erosion contours and a tree-nursery; others have received donkey carts and ploughs. And then each year we benefit from food aid. We also obtained sheep loans for fattening."

5.43 In the above, the Federation is mainly seen as a charitable organisation or as a donor, and not as a result of their joint efforts to work together in solidarity to overcome their common problems. This perception of the FWY as a donor and not as their own organisation appears to have decreased the motivation of the Sadba GV to work for their own self-reliance. For instance, the Sadba literacy centre that the president of the BD so proudly pointed out to us during the discussion was actually closed down by FWY as only five people out of the 30 originally starting were attending class. The reason for the loss of interest in literacy was because FWY did not provide food for students as it had the year before.

5.44 The level of payment of FWY membership fees may also be indicative of the level of commitment felt by members to the development of FWY, as distinct from simply gaining access to the assistance FWY provides at any moment. Although the Godin GV has been a member of the FWY for six years, it has only paid its membership dues three times. If the Federation has 11,000 members, as it claims, then payment of the annual membership fee of CFA 1000 per member would provide a major source of funds for the development of FWY services. However, as acknowledged by the President in the GA and in interviews, there are major problems with the willingness of members to pay their dues. The decision by the GA to exclude GVs not paying their membership fee from benefitting from project resources is a positive move. Members who do pay their due regularly will not feel disadvantaged. If compulsory payment is associated with significant voting rights and opportunities for participation, then members may feel that they have a stake in the organisation, which they should defend.

Conclusions

5.45 Although the FWY is presented as a peasants' organisation, an instrument for the promotion of their interest, at present this does not go beyond mobilisation of external resources for the use of local groups. It does not address such issues as representation of peasants within government for access to credits, better marketing facilities for their produce, better extension and technical support, etc. The FWY works rather as a local intermediary NGO and not as a representative of peasants as a socio-economic category. At the same time, there is no evidence that the member GVs feel a substantial sense of ownership of the organisation.

6. COSTS

MARKET-GARDENING

Benefits and Beneficiaries

BENEFICIARIES

6.1 There were 32 plot holders on the initial Natenga site in 1991/92: 18 men had two plots and the remainder each had one crop from shared plots (total 25 plots). The group had expanded from the initial 25 members who had constructed the first site in 1988/89. A total of 53 people were said to have worked on the new site, mainly men. Additional plots were laid out for women in March 1993, after the first harvest. The women's plots do not have direct access to irrigation water, which will have to be carried from the secondary canal by hand.

HARVESTS

6.2 Delays in project implementation, initially in receipt of funds but compounded by the onset of the rainy season, meant that the Natenga site was not completed until July 1992. At the time of the evaluation, only one crop of haricot beans had been harvested from the new, 4ha Natenga site (cultivated area 2.075ha) and none from Pousghin, which was not ready for operation until after the prescribed planting date in January 1993.

6.3 The programme envisages two crops of haricot beans (F1 variety) in each dry season for each new site, harvested just before Christmas and Easter for the European market. There should also be concurrent harvests from the initial, 2ha Natenga site on the perimeter of the Loumbila reservoir.

YIELDS

6.4 Production from the new Natenga site was 3,560kg, 1,715kg per hectare cultivated. This compares with second-crop production of over 2,750kg per hectare from the first year on the initial, 2ha site (estimated cultivated area of 1.75ha). The crop was marketed by export agents Flex Faso, through whom the Natenga market-gardening group had already sold the beans produced on their first site. Flex Faso advise that with continued work-generating improvements to soil texture and a build up of soil nutrients, yields on the new site will improve.

CROPS

6.5 Plot holders plant rain-fed maize on their plots in the rainy season, to help prevent grass and weed growth. This crop does not constitute a project benefit, as it would quite likely have been grown in such an area anyway, had there not been an irrigation project.

INCOME BENEFITS

6.6 Members of the management committee at Natenga said that the main benefit from market-gardening was income received, and, secondarily, food for the family. They said that by working hard it was possible to pay off the cost of the loans and still have enough money to buy a Yamaha. Net receipts per plot holder from both crops in the 1991/92 season (the first site having higher yields) ranged from a maximum of CFA 79,500 to an outstanding loan of CFA 7,240. For seven men out of 32 that year, cash receipts failed to meet credit received (in kind), and one other made insufficient money to pay the CFA 3,000 per parcel FWY charge. With lower initial yields on the new site, net receipts will be correspondingly lower. It is likely to be several years before a group member will have saved enough from the new site to buy a motorcycle, at CFA 402,000 in 1991.

CONSUMPTION BENEFITS

6.7 Although the provision of food for the family was mentioned as a benefit from the project, this should be qualified by the fact that all produce other than second-grade produce is sold to the agents. Whilst in theory it should be possible to leave some second-grade beans on the plants, to mature for later harvest as dry beans, this would be incompatible with planting the second crop. Similarly, there is no practical way of storing second-grade green beans in this environment, other than salting, which no one reported.

FUTURE PROSPECTS

6.8 Given the information and time available to the team it has not proved possible to generate a reliable future income-stream from market-gardening. Projected benefits were not estimated in the project proposal.

6.9 Flex Faso has a very close working relationship with their 20 or so producer groups. They have a detailed production plan, such that each perimeter sown is destined for a particular client in Europe. Although they have established their niche in the European market, it is not elastic and quality has to be maintained at the lowest price. As well as their field operations manager, they rely on a master farmer in each group to lead the way. Previously Flex Faso has exported 400-500 tonnes and hopes to reach 600 next season. Flex Faso regards Loumbila as one of its top five groups according to the two criteria of quality/yield/grading and group cohesion.

Costs Budgeted and Incurred by FWY

6.10 A breakdown of the market-garden budget, in terms of five categories (construction; equipment; revolving funds; running costs; and personnel), in some cases by village, is given in Annex C.

6.11 The Natenga site covers 4ha, subdivided into 57 plots; the Pousghin site was to be developed in two phases, each of 3ha subdivided into 36 plots, making a total of 72 plots in all. Budgeted capital cost (construction plus equipment plus itemised construction personnel) per plot was CFA 112,085 in Natenga and CFA 89,340 at Pousghin. Construction and equipment costs were equal to 54% of the total project budget. They included pumps, pump shelters, perimeter fencing, plastic piping, bulldozer and grader hire, donkey carts, labour costs, and a small motorcycle.

6.12 The budget envisaged four revolving funds, two per village. In each village, pump operating costs would be met from one such fund (initial donor input of CFA 358,500); and costs of seed, fertiliser, pesticides etc would be met from a second (an initial donor input of CFA 23,050 per plot). These funds were equal to 17% of the total project budget. It is understood that written project proposals did not give any detail on the working of these revolving funds.

6.13 Running costs, which cannot be broken down by village, made up 11% of the total project budget. Fuel

for the motorcycle was included in the running costs budget, but not repairs and maintenance. Other running costs were intended to allow for: animation expenses; a training programme for villagers to explain the system of credit and the organisation of FWY; management costs of the programme and credit system; and supervision of construction on site.

6.14 Personnel costs made up 18% of the total project budget. The personnel budget for both villages included topographical surveys and masons, an animator and a part-time programme manager (48 days each year).

6.15 An estimated breakdown of actual expenditure is given in Annex C, Table 2, along with a commentary on minor variations (omissions and additions) from the budget.

6.16 It should be noted that no expenditure has been itemised under any of the revolving funds. From interviews with the FWY Treasurer and bookkeeper it would appear that a formal revolving fund has not been set up for Natenga, although group members said that they were paying FWY an annual sum of CFA 3,000 per plot, which they understood included CFA 500 for pump operation. When interviewed in Ziniare, the market-garden animator did not provide the team with any information on revolving funds. If the information provided by Natenga group members is correct, the total sum available each year should be sufficient to meet fuel costs, but is unlikely to cover the cost of pump repair and maintenance (which is not covered by any other budget line). Neither will it make sufficient provision for a replacement pump, or for depreciation. The issue of revolving fund management is taken up in more detail in para 66 below.

6.17 Given that seeds, fertiliser, and insecticides have so far all been provided by the purchaser at no initial charge, it is clear that there has been no need to set up a revolving fund for inputs as yet. Now that the purchasing agents are aware of revolving funds earmarked for inputs, the situation may change in the future. The balance at May 1993 shows that money for these funds and for other costs envisaged for the third year is still available in the market-garden account.

6.18 The budget has proved to be a fairly accurate reflection of actual overall expenditure to date. Though personnel and running costs are higher than anticipated, this has been offset by lower construction costs (and the use of lighter earth-moving equipment).

6.19 Although only one statement of expenditure was found on Christian Aid files available to the team in Burkina Faso, (despatched on 10 January 1992), Christian Aid have stated that it was not their practice to transmit funds to a project without prior receipt of a statement of previous expenditure. Their explanation of the missing report was that was most likely due to mis-filing, since no negotiation took place with FWY to allow due further funding without reporting on past expenditure. When it was noted that the third tranche of funds had been received by FWY when a considerable balance still remained from the second tranche, Christian Aid pointed out that this was consistent with their policy of "empowering partners instead of making life difficult for them by putting unnecessary constraints on their operation." (AH,11.11.1993:6).

Costs Incurred by Beneficiaries

6.20 A substantial economic cost to the market-garden group at Natenga was the value of production foregone from their initial site whilst preparing and planting the second 1992/93 crop on the new site. Figures for the second harvest in 1990/91 on the first site suggest the value of the crop might have been around CFA 840,000 (4,800kg @ CFA 175), less cost of inputs at around CFA 400,000 (half the 1991/92 input cost). Figures for 1991/92 have not been used to estimate crop value, because poor germination resulted in a bad second harvest that season. Estimated economic cost of harvest foregone is CFA 440,000.

6.21 It was not possible to make a reliable estimate of the economic cost to group members of site preparation at Natenga or at Pousghin. Preparation at Natenga took over four months, partly due to setbacks in the provision of a tractor.

6.22 The opportunity cost of family labour during the dry season is low, though, as mentioned above, costs may increase for families operating more than two plots.

Benefits in Relation to Costs

6.23 As mentioned above, for the majority of group members at Natenga, market-gardening on the initial site was clearly a profitable activity. Gross annual revenue in 1991/92 was almost CFA 1,700,000, despite partial failure of the second crop. Budgeted capital cost of this site exceeds CFA 6,388,845, though actual cost appears somewhat lower. As has been said earlier, it is not yet possible to generate reliable figures for a future- income stream on the new site.

6.24 If yields remain low, maximum annual gross revenue from the new site will not exceed CFA 1,425,000, partly due to the relatively small net cultivable area within the perimeter fence (estimated at 2.075 ha out of 4ha). A fifty percent increase in yield would generate annual gross revenues of CFA 2,136,000. It is not clear whether such an increase in yield could happen without a substantial increase in fertiliser applications and hence in costs. Nevertheless, it should be possible to establish a positive benefit/cost ratio over the next ten or twelve years.

6.25 If some bold assumptions are made concerning future yields (approaching those of the comparably located Natenga site) and net cultivable area (estimated at 5.72ha from 6ha gross, 143 plots each 140my) annual revenues at Pousghin might approach CFA 6,500,000, though flooding and waterlogged soils on part of the site might reduce first crop production and the sandy soil construction of tertiary canals may give higher water loss through seepage. Capital costs at Pousghin were budgeted at CFA 5,341,600, less than 80% of unit costs at the Natenga site, and actual costs are considerably lower than budgeted for. The Pousghin site appears to have a larger positive benefit/cost ratio than the Christian Aid funded Natenga site.

ANIMAL FATTENING (SHEEP)

Benefits and Beneficiaries

BENEFICIARIES

6.26 FWY reports to Christian Aid indicate that in 1989/90, 119 people (63 women and 56 men) received credits worth CFA 2,700,000 in the form of 314 sheep. The programme expanded with credits totalling CFA 5m in 1990/91 and CFA 6.7m in 1991/92. In 1991/92 a total of 1,200 animals were distributed to 15 villages. Christian Aid funding was only received in 1990 and 1991. Subsequently, FCD (EC co-financed) made funds available, and continued to do so until recently. FWY annual reports are not consistent in the information they provide on the beneficiaries.

WOMEN

6.27 According to the proposal made to Christian Aid the animal fattening programme was intended to provide dry season income for women in particular. In the first year of the programme in Godin, 35 sheep were distributed to 12 women and 5 men. In terms of the number of animals each received, the main beneficiaries were the men, with four or five animals each. 150 animals were distributed in Godin in the 1991/92 season and 130 in the current season. Although, after the first year, some women received more than one animal, the actual number and gender of beneficiaries was not ascertained.

TRAINING

6.28 When the programme started, some GU members from the village went to Kulinka and received training, free of charge, on animal fattening: types of feedstuff, feed and water requirements, animal hygiene and shelter. However, none of the committee members are fully literate. One of the members of the Comite de Gestion is responsible for travelling to Kulinka to seek advice on animal health and husbandry. With the departure of the FCD volunteer there is now less technical expertise available in Kulinka and FWY should address this problem.

SELLING PRICES

6.29 The sale price of the animals has varied. In the first year participants in Godin received CFA 400 per kilogramme but in the second year they only got CFA 250 per kilo. At the time of the evaluation team's visit, marketing in Abidjan and in Ougadougou was being investigated by FWY hence prices for the third year

were not yet known. The villagers have no control over the FWY purchase or sale prices, other than the option of trading on their own account. Whilst some villagers are now fattening local animals themselves no mention was made of anyone selling an FWY sheep (which is markedly superior to local animals) on their own account. It was stated that "noone comes to buy".

6.30 When the initial costings were made for the animal fattening programme, a sale price of CFA 550 per kilo was assumed. This now appears to be optimistic, although lower sale prices are to some extent associated with lower purchase prices.

MORTALITY

6.31 Full benefits can only be realised on the sale of the animals and one problem raised by a member of the Comite de Gestion was that of sheep which fall sick and die. Information provided by the committee indicated that the annual mortality rate of animals in Godin was between 5% and 10% over the past three seasons. Committee members and other beneficiaries were uncertain of the causes of animal mortality.

NET PROFITS

6.32 Beneficiaries reported that the proceeds from the first sale enabled them to repay their loan, put money aside to purchase a sheep the following year and to have between CFA 4,000 and CFA 5,000 left over for their own needs. These needs were described as: to tide them over lean periods (especially at the beginning of the wet season); to buy shoes and clothing; and to meet marriage or funeral expenses. Nothing remains after these expenses have been met. Not everyone made enough from the second year to put the full amount of money aside for next year's deposit or to meet their own needs, after repaying the loan.

TIMING OF BENEFITS

6.33 A benefit mentioned by the women, and recognised by FWY members and staff, was that cash from the sale was received during the "lean season", a period at the end of dry season when there is little to eat.

INCIDENTAL BENEFITS

6.34 After the poor financial experience of the last season, many beneficiaries in Godin ranked the manure by-product more highly than the cash they had received from the sale of the animals. The initial project plan did not make any mention of such expected benefits.

Costs Incurred by Beneficiaries

6.35 Every participant in the animal fattening programme is required to produce a deposit, which according to the animator is 10% of the animal's value. However, women beneficiaries in Godin, reported paying a deposit of CFA 1,000 in the first year and received CFA 100 back, when the average purchase price of a sheep was said to be CFA 6,500.

6.36 When the unit cost per sheep was estimated in 1989/90 by the FCD volunteer the estimated costs were almost twice the above. The details of the costing were as follows:

CFA

Purchase price of sheep 9,000

Market fees etc 500

Transport to Kulkinka 800

Veterinary supplies 140

Rock salt 125

Feed rations 1,650

Transport of feedstuff 250

Transport to final sale 250

Total 12,715

The difference in costing may be partly a reflection of the difference in quality of animal purchased.

6.37 Credit is charged at 9% against the value of the animal (which is weighed on arrival at the village) and includes cost of transport, sanitary precautions and treatment against parasites. The cost of credit was not included in the unit cost calculations given above.

6.38 Supplementary feed is available from FWY at the beginning of the season, also on credit. Some villagers consider it advisable to take one bag per animal (CFA 1,650 per bag) to provide additional feed at the end of the season when crop residues (millet stems and groundnut foliage) are nearly exhausted.

Before the animals arrive at the village the women have to prepare the "hangars" and ensure an adequate supply of crop residues is available. Without these preparations neither they nor their husbands will receive a sheep.

6.39 Once the animals have arrived it is usually the women's responsibility to ensure that there is adequate drinking water available for them. Collecting water is generally a woman's job, though the better off can purchase a "barique" full of water (a 200 litre oil drum) for CFA 100. Male beneficiaries said that sheep should receive water three to five times a day during the hot, dry season.

Benefits in Relation to Costs

PROFITS

6.40 In financial terms, the cost of one sheep is around CFA 10,800 (this assumes a purchase price of CFA 6,500 and includes the cost of credit in addition to costs listed above). "Profit" on the sale of the sheep in the past two seasons was said to range from CFA 500 to CFA 5,000. As committee members and male beneficiaries were unwilling to provide actual information on weight gains or on the sale value of animals, it was not possible to clarify with certainty the villagers' concept of "profit". Female beneficiaries said that not everyone made a profit last season, on an average sale value of CFA 12,000. This was said to compare with between CFA 14,500 and CFA 17,000 in the first season.

6.41 In the time available to the evaluation team economist, and given the problems identified with analysis of FWY expenditure (see Section 5) it was not possible to estimate the full financial cost per sheep (including donor funded costs of animation and project administration). Thus the team were not in a position to ask beneficiaries whether they considered that the full financial cost of the sheep justified the benefits received.

DEMAND

6.42 The demand for animals indicates that this level of return on a cash deposit of CFA 650 to 900 (plus FWY membership fee) is attractive to many villagers. However, it was clear to the evaluation team that while some expressed dismay at the possibility of having to sell their animals at the same price they had paid for them, few participants appreciated the level of risk associated with these returns.

6.43 In economic terms, the time taken to construct the shelter and to fetch water and feedstuff, as well as the increased grain yield from manuring, are already taken into the equation. The continued participation of both

women and men implies that the value they place on the benefits they obtain exceeds the opportunity costs. The women, in particular, indicated that, with the exception of trading in comestibles, they had no other opportunity to earn income during the dry season.

TURNOVER

6.44 The Christian Aid Project Officer has pointed out that in a similar programme funded by CA in Senegal there is a turnover of animals four times a year versus once in the FWY project.

6.45 Animal fattening as currently practised by FWY is purely a dry season activity which in practice aims to supply fattened sheep specifically for the annual Tabaski festival - at which every family throughout the Sahel region slaughters a sheep. Attempts to sell FWY sheep earlier have not been successful so far. It is not obvious that sizeable markets for sheep exist within the geographical scope of FWY villagers, other than at Tabaski. Prices reported from Abidjan in the Ivory Coast before Tabaski this year would mean loss-making sales at this market after allowing for cost of transport, customs, etc.

FUTURE PROSPECTS

6.46 The date of the Tabaski festival is determined according to the lunar calendar, 10 days after the new moon has been sighted. This allows a convenient period in which to sell the animals in bulk to a livestock trader, after around six months fattening, in 1992. It also means that if the festival moves forward by approximately four weeks each year, the time available in the dry season to fatten the animals will be successively reduced to zero by 1999.

LITERACY

Benefits and Beneficiaries

6.47 Because priority was given during the evaluation to examination of the livestock and market gardening projects, relatively little information was collected on the literacy activities.

6.48 In 1990-91, 90 people benefited from the literacy programmes, of whom 60 were from Kulkinka (30 women, 30 men) and 30 from Sadba. In Kulkinka 45 passed their exams (15 women, 30 men) and in Sadba 19 passed (gender difference unknown). The budget for the four year programme is sufficient to provide training for 50 people, for 60 days each year. It should be pointed out that literacy/primary education level education was being provided at a number of other villages which were members of the FWY, but with funds from sources other than Christian Aid, including the government.

6.49 In Nagreongo GU nine of the thirty members of the GU had undertaken literacy training but only five individuals amongst the 21 committee members (of FWY literacy, sheep and cereal bank groups) were reported to be able to read and write well. A further eight committee members were partially literate. At Godin, one member of the animal fattening comite de gestion had received literacy training, but said he was unable to read and write. All committee members said that although they could read the dial on the scale when animals were weighed they were unable to read or to write other records, which was a great handicap.

6.50 As mentioned in Chapter 4, the vast majority of those who have received literacy training have been children, rather than adults.

Costs Incurred by FWY

6.51 The total budgeted cost for the four year literacy programme funded by Christian Aid is CFA 19,955,000. This was allocated on the following basis: training and seminars (43%); personnel (40%); transport for animators (13%); and construction (4%) (See Annex C for the detailed budget).

6.52 As with the other FWY activities, a breakdown of expenditure at the village level is not available. The breakdown of costs between the Kulkinka centre, with classrooms and accommodation for residential students of metal-roofed, rendered block construction and other, more modest village centres is not clear from the four year budget (See Annex C), or from the 1991 Activity report. Thus, it is not possible to estimate the respective unit costs of these very different methods of supplying literacy training.

6.53 In order to ascertain financial unit costs we would need to know costs per village, per year of training and also numbers enrolled in each year, numbers graduating and numbers repeating a course. Information that was available indicates that the graduation rate from the initial year's course varies between villages and for men and women. Of 11 women who commenced the course at Godin in 1992 only one graduates to the second year whilst at Kulkinka in 1991 the graduation rate was said to be 50% for women and 100% for men. Comprehensive information on enrolment, repetition and graduation numbers for all FWY villages was not available.

Costs incurred by Beneficiaries

6.54 At the village literacy centre at Nagreongo the villagers themselves had provided simple shelter for an open-air classroom, using matting and grass-woven hurdles on a frame made from tree trunks. Estimated time to construct a similar "hangar" in Gorom was two people for ten days, including time taken to collect materials.

6.55 The villagers were also responsible for the teacher's food and lodging whilst he stayed in the village. At Kulkinka, FWY provided the residential students with food and accommodation. The students themselves were responsible for travel to and from the centre at the beginning and end of the 10 week course and for any home visits made during the course.

6.56 Opportunity costs for men seemed likely to be modest since the literacy programme was run during the dry season, when income earning opportunities were limited. Opportunity costs for women were not identified.

Benefits in Relation to Costs

6.57 If expenditure on the literacy programme went according to budget the cost per head of beneficiary (50) per year would have been CFA 99,775. If the extra participants from Sadba were taken into account costs would be reduced to CFA 55,430. In either case the costs appear high. It seems quite likely that had the same sum of money been given to the GU themselves to manage, they could have substantially extended the numbers of beneficiaries and/or improved the quality of teaching that was available.

6.58 Putting aside this major reservation, it is important that, in future, FWY separate the costs for the residential centre from those for other centres. If food and accommodation are not provided under this more decentralised approach costs per head could be reduced by 25% or more.

ACCOUNTING PROCEDURES

6.59 If the members of FWY, their elected representatives, the appointed staff, or its supporting donors, are to be able to make any assessment of the operations of FWY there is a need for accurate and appropriate financial information. The section that follows identifies areas of the present system of accounting procedures that need attention, and suggests action that could be taken.

6.60 FWY has responsibility for income from three different sources: individual village membership subscriptions; donated funds from northern partners and revenues from village income-generating activities. Fifty percent of the membership fees are retained and managed by the BD, the other half are forwarded to the central office and incorporated into the main budget of FWY. Accounting procedures for village income-generating activities and for village revolving funds are the joint responsibility of the FWY animator and the bureau of the GU.

6.61 A common accounting system is used by FWY for all cash accounts. Each activity has its own bank account (non-interest bearing) for each donor, to which FWY officials and the bookkeeper are signatories. Separate cash accounts are prepared for each tranche of funds. The evaluation team estimate that there are

around twenty FWY/donor/activity bank accounts, each of which may have two or more sets of cash accounts relating to different budget years. This complex system is a direct result of the manner in which donors have chosen to fund FWY, by individual projects, rather than as an organisation as a whole.

6.62 The Federation does not have a formal financial year. Each donor/activity has its own financial year which depends on when the donor funding was provided. The Treasurer stated that cash accounts are photocopied and sent to donors every six months. It was noted that there were no copies of market gardening accounts on the Christian Aid files available to the team in Burkina, though there were some photocopies for other activities. There are no annual income and expenditure statements or balance sheets for the FWY as a whole, and FWY does not have a policy of having an external audit.

6.63 Purchases are generally made by cash, not cheques. Each cash account sheet has provision for an analysis of expenditure under five headings, four of which are commonly used for equipment, construction, running costs and personnel. These categories are used for all project activities. Their usefulness for the analysis of project costs is limited.

6.64 Internal checks on donors' cash accounts are carried out by either the President or the Secretary General of FWY each month and by the Treasurer every three or six months. It would appear that these checks focus primarily on arithmetical accuracy and the overall budget situation; but there are no written reports to substantiate this.

FWY Accounting Problems

BUDGET CONTENT

6.65 It is understood that the budget procedures have been revised since the market garden project budget was drawn up. Nevertheless, it is appropriate to consider some budget inadequacies that have given the FWY bookkeeper problems or may do so in future:

a No provision was made in the budget for inflation. While

the inflation rate remain low (and some of the unit costs used are generous) this is a potential rather than an actual problem. Nevertheless, a budget line should be provided for inflation.

b The budget line for the salary of the animator accommodates payments to the FWY Treasurer and part of the salary of the budget officer (Charge de Programmes). Additionally, the FWY phone bill, photocopying, stationery and other expenses have been met from market garden operating costs (which were meant to cover revolving loans and extension/training costs). While it is accepted that there may be a need to meet FWY project-related overheads these costs could be clearly and openly budgeted for, and given their own budget line. They should not be confused with other direct project costs.

c Essential running costs of heavy machinery hired to prepare the market garden were not budgeted for. Similarly, there is no budget line for maintenance and repair of the animator's motorcycle.

d There is no budget line for contingencies.

REVOLVING FUNDS

6.66 The management of revolving funds has been confused. The four revolving funds envisaged in the market garden budget were itemised under equipment and running costs, and expenditure has been accounted for as such, not under a separate "revolving funds" heading. The bookkeeper was not even aware that two such funds had been envisaged for each village (one for pump running- costs and one for inputs such as seeds, fertiliser and pesticides). In practice, inputs have been supplied to villagers in Natenga by the export agency on interest-free terms, while costs for fuel and parts for both pumps have been met and paid for direct from the Christian Aid account by FWY.

ADVANCES

6.67 Under the present system the duration of each advance cannot be monitored adequately. At the time of the evaluation there was no system to enforce reimbursement or accounting for advances within any given time period. FWY have subsequently initiated action on this point. Corresponding advances and reimbursements cannot be identified in the cash accounts. The system for recording advances does not provide sufficient information on the nature of each advance. There is no statement for each advance indicating the actual cost of purchase(s) and any cash balance remaining from the original advance.

AUTHORITY TO PURCHASE

6.68 Although authorisation for purchases is supposed to be given by FWY officials (members of the Executive Bureau), in the market garden project the animator for this project is both a FWY official as well as being a member of staff. Purchase decisions are not always made in the light of budgeted expenditure; an example is the recent purchase of market garden tools, an item budgeted for as being the villagers' contribution. Given the position of the animator as a BE member, the bookkeeper and Treasurer are not always in a position to refuse cash advances for items of expenditure that are not in the budget.

USE OF FINANCIAL DATA - UNIT COSTS

6.69 The financial system was designed with simplicity in mind, so it is not surprising that it is not possible to identify expenditure by village from the accounts. Nevertheless, for purposes of self-evaluation, it might be appropriate for FWY to consider the wider uses of financial records, enabling FWY, for example, to assess the unit costs of different projects, village by village, or by project component.

USE OF FINANCIAL DATA - REPORTING

6.70 Problems with the use of financial data for reporting purposes are compounded by the lack of regular summary statements of accounts. It was not possible to reconcile the cash account analyses with the expenditure data provided by FWY in the report to Christian Aid (undated but despatched 10 January 1992). It appears that FWY adjusted the report so that the early purchase of two motor pumps was not disclosed. During the course of the evaluation, the President of FWY was advised of Christian Aid's concern that accounts and reporting should be transparent in all respects.

FWY - CASH-FLOW PROBLEMS

6.71 Cash-flow difficulties in the past resulted in viring funds between Christian Aid activity accounts (for example, the use of market-gardening funds to purchase sheep for animal fattening). More recent FWY cash-flow problems have led to funds being vired between the Christian Aid market-garden account and other donor/activity accounts. At the time of the evaluation, some of these recent "loans" were still outstanding.

CHECKS ON ACCOUNTS

6.72 The officials responsible for internal checking do not have sufficient training and experience to recognise shortcomings in systems and procedures. Recently some donors have requested external audits of their activity accounts.

ASSETS

6.73 FWY do not keep an asset register, neither do they make provision for depreciation or asset replacement. It was pointed out during the course of the evaluation that there were practical reasons for maintaining a record of major assets such as motor pumps, e.g. for identification purposes in the event of theft.

VILLAGE ACCOUNTS

6.74 Each income-generating activity in each village has a separate National Savings Account (Caisse National d'Epargne), to which the two signatories are the President and Secretary-General of FWY.

6.75 The most recent village balance sheet available for the market-gardening project was for the 1991/92

season. The account was more akin to a schedule than a balance sheet, listing for each plot holder the amount received from sale of beans, the cost of inputs received on credit from the export agents, the annual plot charge, the FWY subscription and the balance of receipts remaining after deducting all these costs. Seven of the 32 beneficiaries in 1991/92 (with nine plots between them) were in deficit and unable to meet payments for credit inputs, let alone any FWY fees and charges.

6.76 There are a number of problems associated with this schedule and the attached receipts:

- a. The most obvious problem was that there was virtually no correspondence between the figures listed in the schedule and the sums on the receipts. The nature of these receipts had to be deduced jointly by the Treasurer, the bookkeeper and the evaluator.
- b. FWY subscription receipts appear to be held in the same savings account as revolving fund receipts and not in the FWY general account.
- c. Another problem relates to discrepancies between the reported figures for annual plot charges, which could not be accounted for.
- d. There is no proper accounting system for the revolving fund itself. Ideally, this should be the responsibility of the treasurer of the GV but, in this instance, thought needs to be given to designing an accounting system which the treasurer will be able to operate in the future.

Recommendations

6.77 It is recommended that FWY seek external advice and assistance to improve accounting systems and procedures for all sources of income and expenditure. Where still necessary, the budget system should also be improved. In-service training should be provided to elected officials with responsibility for accounts. Additional, practical items of equipment should be purchased.

6.78 It is recommended that FWY responsibility for internal checks on donor/activity accounts should be independent from the responsibility to authorise expenditure. The President of FWY has played a dual role. He was responsible both for authorising large items of expenditure and for confirming the validity of the activity accounts.

6.79 It is recommended that, where possible, responsibility for revolving fund accounts should be transferred to GVs. Where appropriate, FWY should seek external advice and assistance in the design of simple accounts systems and procedures.

6.80 It is recommended that FWY identify the training necessary to enable GV treasurers to operate revolving fund accounts and take steps to ensure that such training is followed by the responsible officials. FWY should provide ongoing technical support to villages operating their own revolving funds.

6.81 It is recommended that Christian Aid request a formal investigation of literacy and market-gardening accounts, with the objective of identifying any further personnel training requirements and facilitating amendments to or revision of FWY systems and procedures. If required, additional in-service support and training should also be provided for FWY officials and other staff.

6.82 It is recommended that Christian Aid consider procedures for new southern partners to ensure that they fully understand CA reporting requirements, both financial and narrative, from the outset.

ANNEX A

TERMS OF REFERENCE

OBJECTIVES, ACTIVITIES AND RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE TEAM

These are presented below in tabular form.

a. Objectives proposed by Christian Aid

1ST OBJECTIVE: ATTAINABLE PROJECT OBJECTIVES

OBJECTIVES	ACTIVITIES	RECOMMENDATIONS
<p>To what extent are the project and/or organisations(') objectives attainable within the current economic, social and political context of the area?</p>	<p>*Consult background documents and relevant individuals about current economic, social and political context of the area.</p> <p>*Establish a socio-economic profile of the relevant communities, indicating the extent to which they are participants or non-participants in the project's work.</p> <p>*This should involve analysis of difference with regard to gender, ethnicity, language, age, subsistence base, socio-economic well-being and/or other issues (such as religious affiliation), which may be locally relevant to different perceived needs.</p> <p>*Establish what constraints different parties feel limit their achievement of project objectives. What - if any - potential solutions do different parties envisage?</p>	<p>Can and in what way could the project and/or organisation(s) modify (their) objectives, in order to make them more attainable?</p>

2ND OBJECTIVE: ACTIVITIES - OBJECTIVES?

OBJECTIVES	ACTIVITIES	RECOMMENDATIONS
<p>To what extent are the activities being undertaken by the partner project and/or organisation helping them to meet their original objectives?</p>	<p>*Establish various opinions of project staff and different sections of the communities regarding the extent to which they feel that current activities address project objectives.</p>	<p>How could the project and/or organisation modify the activities, in order to attain the modified objectives?</p>

3RD OBJECTIVE: OBJECTIVES/ACTIVITIES = NEEDS?

OBJECTIVES	ACTIVITIES	RECOMMENDATIONS

<p>To what extent do the project and/or organisations(') objectives encompass the needs of different sections of the communities concerned (including women, different ethnic groups, the poorest, younger people, artisans, etc)? Do the activities meet some of these needs, even if the objectives may not? What precisely is the relevance of the projects for the livelihood of the participating members?</p>	<p>*Establish the different perceived needs of all relevant sections of the community.</p> <p>*Determine the extent to which the people concerned consider that the project or organisations present objectives and/or activities address their needs.</p> <p>*Determine the project of organisation(s)' perceived needs of different section of the community; and the extent to which it considers that it addresses them.</p>	<p>Can and in what way could the project or organisation modify objectives, in order better to encompass the needs of different sections of communities?</p>
---	--	--

4TH OBJECTIVE: REPRESENTATION?

OBJECTIVES	ACTIVITIES	RECOMMENDATIONS
<p>To what extent does the project and/or organisations(') current management and administrative structure enable different groups to be represented?</p>	<p>*Establish the relevant importance of the project and/or organisation to local people. Do they own it: is it accountable to them, or vice-versa?</p> <p>*Establish the extent to which different sections of the community consider that they have been involved in the project inception, planning and implementation.</p> <p>*Establish the extent to which different sections of the community have in fact been represented on the governing committee of the organisation.</p>	<p>How could the current management and administrative structure be modified to increase the effectiveness of the organisation, ensuring representation of different sections of the communities?</p>

5TH OBJECTIVE: COSTS?

OBJECTIVES	ACTIVITIES	RECOMMENDATIONS

To what extent do different community sections and project staff consider that direct and indirect costs (such as money, time, labour etc) of the project are worth the project benefits?	<p>*The ODA economist and relevant project staff to make a costs assessment of the partner organisations.</p> <p>*The rest of the evaluation team to assess relative costs in time, labour, money etc to different sections of communities.</p>	If project and/or organisational costs need to be modified in order to balance better benefits, recommend ways in which this matter could be further addressed.
---	---	---

6TH OBJECTIVE: FUTURE?

OBJECTIVES	ACTIVITIES	RECOMMENDATIONS
What perspectives do leaders as well as members and others have of the organisation and its future?	*Identify different perspectives of possible future developments for the projects by consultation with different sections of communities, project staff and others.	Recommend an appropriate means of developing future plans for the project and/or organisation, which ensure that different perspectives are incorporated.

b. **Additional Objectives proposed by ACECO and Wend-Yam**

ACECO:

- training needs;
- animators' remuneration;
- further useful indicators of the progress of its work.

WEND-YAM

- animators' remuneration;
- how best it should accommodate its recent rapid growth within the necessary institutional constraints;
- possible ways and means of establishing its future independence from external agencies.

This needs to be discussed further by representatives of Christian Aid, partner organisations and ODA respectively.

Evaluators should feel free to recommend follow-up studies, wherever it considers them necessary.

ANNEX B**SOURCES OF INFORMATION ON COSTS**

1. The main sources of information used in Chapter 6 are semi-structured interviews (with FWY officials and staff and with village committee members and beneficiaries) and secondary data. The three sources of secondary data were a project history, which was made available prior to departure, Christian Aid files and FWY accounts. With the exception of the project history, all secondary data sources were written in French

and no translation was available to team members, who did not have an adequate grasp of this language. The project history, provided to the evaluation team by ODA and prepared in April 1993 from a review of Christian Aid files, gave details of FWY budgets and of funds transferred from Christian Aid to FWY. It contained no information on actual expenditure.

2. Search of the market-gardening files disclosed a first-year activity report to Christian Aid despatched on 10 January 1992. This report covered market-gardening and literacy programmes and included statements of figures of actual and budgeted expenditure. It did not cover the livestock programme, to which Christian Aid provided funds in 1991. Although the report refers to accompanying book-keeping documentation, this was not on the Christian Aid file. No other activity reports were on this file and none were provided by FWY, though it was stated by both FWY and Christian Aid that one subsequent report had been despatched and received.

3. At Christian Aid's request, FWY made available in Ziniare all the accounting documents relating to FWY/Christian Aid expenditure on the two current programmes. The market-garden project covers two villages, with budgeted capital expenditure at each village identified separately. The economist therefore decided to use the accounts to assess the level of actual expenditure relating to each of the two market-gardens, and hence unit costs per plot.

a. Although the book-keeper rendered every assistance, this did not prove possible in the time available at Ziniare. The accounts did not identify the village against items of expenditure. Furthermore whilst, as far as could be judged, records of FWY expenditure and supporting documentation were carefully and accurately maintained, the analytical breakdown of this expenditure did not always reflect its true nature.

4. Further study highlighted a number of problems, which arose at a time when FWY was without a suitably experienced or qualified bookkeeper. Shortcomings were identified in book-keeping procedures and systems currently in use at FWY and a lack of coordination between the person responsible for budget proposals, the book-keeper and treasurer, and those responsible for authorising expenditure. These problems are considered further in Section 5 below.

5. Problems of this nature, both very specific and very detailed, are not easily addressed in a participatory manner. The evaluation team appreciate the assistance provided by FWY and their cooperative spirit throughout the evaluation. FWY officials and staff have made considerable efforts to address these problems themselves, following the departure of the evaluation team. With the assistance of Christian Aid, the book-keeper subsequently attended a management course in Dakar run by l'Association Conseil Action. This has provided him with an appropriate NGO focus for his professional skills and all the necessary documents to install their recommended management system. Subsequent follow-up training in Ziniare is an essential component of this course.

6. The team were asked to evaluate three FWY programmes. By dividing time equally between FWY and ACECO there was inadequate time to consider each FWY programme in depth. Team time was targeted at village level rather than at FWY institutional level, a problem identified elsewhere by the team leader. The economist was, however, able to function independently of the rest of the team for two days. These days were spent with the FWY book-keeper (Comptable) and treasurer, "interviewing the books" in a participatory manner.

ANNEX C

FWY PROJECT ACTIVITIES: BUDGETS AND EXPENDITURES

TABLE 1: FWY Market-garden Budget

Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	CFA Francs Total
---------------	---------------	---------------	-----------------------------

Loumbila Natenga

Construction				
		2,578,500		2,578,500
Equipment		2,279,500		2,279,500
Personnel		440,000		440,000
Revolving Funds:				
- Pump		358,500		358,500
- Inputs		1,313,850		1,313,850
SUB TOTAL		6,970,350		6,970,350

Loumbila Pousghin

Construction				
	2,266,000		472,500	2,738,500
Equipment	2,163,100			2,163,100
Personnel	400,000			440,000
Revolving Funds:				
- Pump	358,500			358,500
- Inputs	829,800		829,800	1,659,600
SUB TOTAL	6,057,400		1,302,300	7,359,700

Both Villages

Equipment	2,181,700			2,181,700
Running Costs	961,300	870,500	718,000	2,549,800
Personnel	1,002,000	1,002,000	1,002,000	3,006,000
SUB TOTAL	4,145,000	1,872,500	1,720,000	7,737,500
<u>TOTAL</u>	10,202,400	8,842,850	3,022,300	22,067,550

NOTE:

1. The figures above were taken from FWY reports. Layout and totals do not correspond exactly with the budget given in the project history and prepared from other documents in Christian Aid files. This gives a year 1 budget of CFA 10,186,400 and a year 3 budget of CFA 3,006,300: a total of CFA 22,035,550.
2. FWY accounts do not specify villages against expenditure; cost apportionment has taken into account the order in which the project proceeded, starting with Natenga rather than with Pousghin.
3. There are a number of items in the budget which have not yet been provided, some of which may have subsequently proved unnecessary. These include a raised pumping base and a permanent shelter at Pousghin; iron security cages for the pumps (which are currently removed to the village each night for

security), and entrance gates at both sites. Donkey carts for Pousghin were on order at the time of the evaluation. With these minor exceptions, the construction and equipment at Natenga has been completed, whilst from a brief, unannounced visit, there would appear to be construction work outstanding at Pousghin.

TABLE 2: FWY MARKET-GARDEN ESTIMATED EXPENDITURE

	1991/92	1992/93*	CFA Francs Total
<u>Loumbila Natenga</u>			
Construction			
Equipment			
Running Costs	1,186,700	347,629	1,534,329
Personnel	1,777,100	40,000	1,817,100
Revolving Funds:	403,300	98,000	501,300
- Pump	100,000	232,500	332,500
- Inputs			
SUB TOTAL	3,467,100	718,129	4,185,229
<u>Loumbila Pousghin</u>			
Construction			
Equipment			
Running Costs		1,241,700	1,241,700
Personnel		196,900	1,713,400
Revolving Funds:	1,516,500	38,305	38,305
- Pump		432,500	432,500
- Inputs			
SUB TOTAL	1,516,500	1,909,405	3,425,905
<u>Both Villages</u>			
Equipment	557,170	1,745,000	2,302,170
Running Costs	674,259	558,216	1,232,475
Personnel	1,222,000	1,166,700	2,288,700
SUB TOTAL	2,353,429	3,469,916	5,823,345
<u>Other</u>		500,000	500,000
<u>TOTAL</u>	7,337,029	6,597,450	13,934,479

NOTES:

1. The expenditure year used is July/June (1991/92 and July/May (1992/93).
2. The balance of expenditure shown on the FWY cash analysis forms at May 1993 was:

Tranche I CFA 78,861

Tranche II CFA 5,042,910

Tranche III CFA 3,012,300

3. The figure of CFA 500,000 shown under "other" is expenditure on market-gardening tools, which was identified in the budget as "per memoire", i.e. beneficiaries' contribution.