

EVALUATION REPORT

EV586

GHANA LITERACY PROJECT

BY
MS D GRAPPER
DR S RODWELL
MS S JONES

CONTENTS

[Preface](#) - [Abbreviations](#) - [Evaluation Summary](#) - [Background](#) - [Identification, Design and Approval](#) - [Implementation](#) - [Impact and Sustainability](#) - [Main Findings](#) - [Table 1: Financial Summary](#) - [Table 2: Equipment Budget and Actual Amount Spent](#) - [Table 3: Statistics of PROJECT Training Areas](#) - [Table 4: Reported Data on School Attendance](#) - [Table 5: Local Training Workshops and Consultancies](#) - [Table 6: Summary of Consultancy Issues Raised Through EC](#) - [Table 7: Details of Consultancy Issues Raised By EC](#)

ANNEXES

[Annex A: Terms of Reference](#) - [Annex B: Library and Project Map](#) - [Annex C: The Education Sector and Literacy in Ghana](#) - [Annex D: Library Approaches, Strategies and Methods](#) - [Annex E: ODA Support for the Pilot Project](#) - [Annex F: Social Issues](#) - [Annex G: Survey of the Impact on Livestock](#) - [Annex H: The Effect of World Bank Policy Approaches on the Poor and Creditless Poor](#)

PREFACE

Each year the Overseas Development Administration (ODA) commissions a number of new evaluation studies. The purpose of the ODA's evaluation programme is to examine rigorously the implementation and impact of selected pilot projects and to generate the lessons learned from them so that these can be applied to current and future projects.

The ODA's Evaluation Department is independent of ODA's spending divisions and reports directly to the ODA's Principal Finance Officer.

Evaluation teams consist of an appropriate blend of specialist skills and are normally made up of a mixture of in-house staff, who are fully conversant with ODA's procedures, and independent external consultants, who bring a fresh perspective to the subject matter.

For this evaluation we have recruited the following:

Ms D Grapper - Economic Consultant - Team Leader
Dr S Rodwell - Educational Consultant
Ms S Jones - Social Development Consultant

The evaluation involved the following steps:

- initial desk study of relevant projects;
- consultations with institutions and organisations concerned with the literacy programme, including a field mission to collect data and interview those involved;
- preparation of a draft report which was circulated for comment to the individuals and organisations most closely concerned;
- meeting of ODA, literacy programme and Evaluation Committee with Evaluation Department and the field evaluators to discuss and agree the main conclusions and lessons to be learned from the study on the basis of a draft report;
- agreement with the evaluation team on the final report, which is published together with a summary sheet (EV586).

This process is designed to ensure the production of a high quality report which draws out the lessons.

After the Ghana Literacy Project was completed, a further 'Literacy and Functional Skills' Project was approved by ODA. This project is now under way. In parallel with a major World Bank investment, many of the key themes of the evaluation are pertinent to the new project and were incorporated in some way in its design. In monitoring and reviewing progress of the new project, particular attention will be paid to the lessons learned from this evaluation (paragraphs 17-27). The evaluation report will be forwarded to the relevant authorities in Ghana and to the World Bank.

ABBREVIATIONS

BC	British Council
ESL	Bureau of Ghana Languages
BHC	British High Commission
DCD	Department of Community Development
DFP	Donor Trust Fundings
EU	European Union
FILP	Functional Literacy programme
FM	Printing Machinery
GBC	Ghana Broadcasting Corporation
IGSLR	Ghana Institute of Languages, Literature and Bible Translation
GoG	Government of Ghana
IME	Institute of Adult Education
IEC	International Education College
IG	Income-Generation
MSLSP	Mass Literacy and Social Change Program
MS	Management Information System
NFEI	Non-Formal Education Division
NGO	Non-Government Organisation
ODA	Overseas Development Administration
PAMSCAD	Programme of Action to Mitigate the Social Costs of Adjustment
SCJ	Third Country Training (ie neither in home country nor UK)
UKF	Upper East Region
UK	United Kingdom
VSD	Voluntary Service Overseas
WID	Women in Development

EVALUATION SUMMARY

- The Ghana Literacy Project was part of a wider programme aimed at mitigating the social costs of economic adjustment in the 1980s. ODA support for this programme was intended to help finance an experimental pilot literacy project in two areas of Ghana, with the immediate objective of making 15,000 people literate. The longer-term objective was to help develop and test literacy materials, training programmes and administrative structures which could support an eventual expansion of the programme throughout the country. The pilot project started in September 1988. The ODA contribution of 1.4 million was to pay for UK equipment and vehicles, short-term UK consultants and UK training, and for local consultants and training courses. The project was implemented by the Division of Non-Formal Education (NFED), which was responsible for the design, implementation and monitoring of the project.
- In 1990, before the pilot project was fully under way, the Ghanaian Head of State announced the immediate launching of a national literacy campaign. As a result, ODA resources came to be used to support the setting up and running of a much larger-scale programme than intended. At the same time, Ghana was in negotiation with the World Bank, which wanted to make the ODA pilot project the basis for a literacy project of its own. The World Bank took over funding of the national programme from 1992, with a project worth \$17.4 million. (Paragraphs 3.2-3.4)

THE EVALUATION

- The UK pilot project was chosen by ODA as one suitable for export evaluation, primarily for its poverty alleviation relevance. The evaluation was undertaken by a team comprising consultants in economics, social development and education, which visited Ghana for two weeks from 25 September to 7 October 1994. In the absence of quantified information on project impact, the evaluators had to rely on a study of reports, discussions with the UK and Ghanaian agencies involved, and short field visits to the pilot areas. To supplement these sources, a social impact survey was commissioned covering 50 learners in the two pilot areas. (Paragraphs 3.1-3.14)

FINDINGS

- The impact of the national literacy programme at field level has, overall, been very positive. In particular, remote areas, in both rural and urban areas, and despite limited resources, learners and volunteer facilitators meet on a regular basis some three or four evenings every week. The programme has stimulated a strong demand for literacy, has retroacted large numbers of people to the educational process, and in the process has developed a strong community identity through the medium of the classes. (Paragraphs 4.3 and 4.26-4.27)
- ODA support for the project, and subsequently for the national programme, concentrated most on strengthening NFED at the central in Accra but at the field level in the Regions. There was, however, a great case for this during the initial years, when the programme delivery system could not cope with rapid expansion, resulting in shortages of printed and other materials, and the undermining of the training programme. (Paragraphs 4.4-4.6)
- The current national literacy programme was essentially the same model as was developed during the ODA pilot project, and to that extent ODA's long-term objective of influencing the national programme was met. Recent monitoring by the World Bank has shown improvement in a number of areas of implementation, which may reflect the solid basis on which the national campaign was built. (Paragraphs 4.4 and 4.6)
- In other respects, however, the impact of the ODA pilot project was less than might be expected. This was not only partly because the rapid expansion did not allow it to do so. More important than that no adequate Management Information System (MIS) was set up during the pilot phase to collect information on project performance. It would not therefore have been possible to evaluate its success and refine the model before applying it on a wider scale. Only in the last year has NFED started to collect reliable information and to carry out research into learner achievement. (Paragraphs 2.24 and 3.34-3.35)
- There was also a major problem in the implementation of the project, which was the failure of the UK-based International Education College (IEC) to project design, operational and implementation. In the event, the decision by the GoG not to give priority to the expansion of the network of IEC centres has meant that the goal of adult to primary and secondary education has not been fully engaged with classroom teaching. (Paragraphs 3.13-13 and 4.10)
- The original core strategy of the ODA project was to work as much as possible through the many agencies (private and public) with experience of running literacy programmes in Ghana, with NFED acting as a coordinator. Thus, a substantial proportion of the ODA resources - vehicles, equipment and UK training - was allocated to these partner agencies. In the event, however, NFED became the implementer rather than coordinator and the other agencies were neglected. (Paragraphs 3.5-3.6)
- There were more UK consultancy visits than could be managed effectively, and they exceeded NFED's capacity to absorb them. Their impact was in many cases less than expected, and even though most produced sound advice, it was often not followed up. One reason for this was that NFED considered that it had an insufficient staff to, or influence over, consultancy activities. Another problem was that since the time for the other ODA project components (equipment, local training and local consultants) had been spent, ODA had no leverage to insist on recommendations being followed. At that stage, the remaining consultancy inputs might have been better used in support of the main funding agency (the World Bank), rather than continuing as a separate ODA activity. (Paragraphs 3.11-3.13 and 4.16-4.20)
- The impact of the UK training visits was less than might have been. The majority of the awards went to employees of agencies which, in the end, played only a minor role in the programme. Another problem was the apparent reliability of the award system which discouraged the taking up of the shorter courses. (Paragraphs 3.20 and 4.10)
- UK project management arrangements took too long to set up and to become effective. In the early stages, too many agencies were involved, with heavily defined contracts and no single focus. The projects report might have been greater if there had been a full-time project manager, based in Ghana. (Paragraphs 3.37-3.39 and 4.26)
- As a part of PAMSCAD, the pilot project was intended to benefit the poorest and most vulnerable, especially women. However, as by definition disadvantaged, but the voluntary status of this project at field level (and existing classes and printed materials and equipment), which a crucial element in its success, precluded an effective focus on the poor. Most learners were probably not low income groups, in particular those who had been formerly educated, but socio-economic status was not monitored as part of the project. (Paragraphs 4.30-4.31)
- Large numbers of women, many of whom had no other access to education, have participated. Though the project was not always able to meet their varied expectations of it, their ability to benefit was also limited by the lack of child care facilities and competing claims on their time from agricultural and domestic duties. (Paragraphs 3.14-3.15 and 4.34-3.43)
- One important achievement, for sustainability, has been the establishment of some successful income-generation schemes, intended to pay for class running costs, some of which have developed into other community activities. (Paragraph 4.35)

LESSONS LEARNED

- Functional literacy programmes need to be designed to meet local conditions. This includes the choice of literacy methods, training materials, and the structure for delivering resources to field level. The choice of topics needs to be relevant to participants' everyday life and needs. Programme design and materials should also, as far as possible, be designed in partnership with learners. Programme design should also allow for flexibility to adapt during implementation. (Paragraphs 2.10-2.11)
- The main focus of aid for literacy programmes should be on institutional development in the managing agency. This should include support for efficient operations at both the HD and the field level - to ensure, on the one hand, that facilities are trained and printers and other materials are produced and delivered on time (the main focus of the ODA project); and, on the other, to provide short-term financial support (as the World Bank subsequently did) for establishing programme administration at regional and district level. (Paragraphs 4.5 to 4.20)
- Simple monitoring and reporting systems should be a central element in a pilot project, and should be in place from the start. They should be supplemented by periodic assessments of levels of literacy achieved, and by additional research, for instance into the extent to which disadvantaged groups are benefiting. (Paragraphs 2.24 and 3.34-3.35)
- When participation is voluntary, it is particularly important to take positive action to ensure that the disadvantaged are not discouraged from participating. For instance, class timings should suit women and encourage them to attend. Target groups should be defined, and practical steps for the network to be carried out and monitored. Where field workers are also volunteers, it is important that motivation is encouraged and maintained - provided incentive packages, for instance, may be helpful. (Paragraph 4.30-4.31)
- A WID strategy should be incorporated from the outset, both for women learners and for women staff in the implementing agency. (Paragraphs 4.34-4.35)
- Innovative consultancy inputs may not be appropriate and effective in a new and relatively unproven institutional implementing agency. Support of this kind needs to be identified jointly with the agency, and to match both its perceived needs and its absorptive capacity. On-the-spot management of the consultancy inputs is crucial to maximising their benefits. (Paragraphs 3.11-3.13 and 4.16-4.20)
- With a complex project in a new sector, where the implementing agency is untested, clear conditions need to be established and monitored carefully. Some flexibility to take up the maximum of conditions needs to be retained, for instance by not applying the full of the report too early in the project. The financing of some local costs, as well as being useful in improving effectiveness, also provides useful leverage to support project conditions. (Paragraphs 3.20-2.30 and 4.20-4.26)
- ODA should seek to establish in advance clear responsibility for overall project management arrangements. If more than one agency is involved, particular care needs to be taken in defining roles. The ideal solution is to select one agency as overall manager, with the others as sub-contractors. The major contractor should have an administrative/management presence in the country. (Paragraphs 3.37-3.39 and 4.26)
- The project manager should be involved in the high-level project management (and in the distribution and design stage). The fact that the project is primarily the responsibility of the discipline should not preclude the involvement of others. (Paragraph 3.26)
- Project managers should decide on the amount of overseas training to be offered. This should be governed by the funds available and the needs of the project, rather than being expressed as a fixed number of visits, as so not to discourage the taking up of shorter, more practical courses. (Paragraph 3.20)
- As the impact of the project on income-earning potential is not well enough established, it is not possible to calculate an economic cost return of such projects. For such cases, Project appraisal should at least include a target cost-effectiveness analysis, in this case an estimate of the average cost of making one learner literate, against which to monitor one aspect of project performance, and to provide a point of comparison with other poverty-focused projects. (Paragraphs 2.26-2.27 and 4.21-4.24)

OVERALL SUCCESS RATING

- The rapid reworking of the pilot project into a full-scale national programme makes it difficult to give a full assessment of the ODA project. The separate estimates were collected in the pilot areas to measure the achievement of the immediate objectives there, and the allocation to a national scale did not allow sufficient time to develop, test and refine the methodologies and infrastructure to meet the long-term objective of supporting an expanded programme.
- In terms of actual achievement against the stated scope of the project, the evaluators judge the ODA support project to have been **partly successful**.

EVALUATION SUCCESS RATINGS

The Overall Success Rating for a project is allocated on a scale from **A+** to **D** according to the following rating system:

Highly Successful (A+) - *excellent overall benefits in relation to costs*

Successful (A) - *very good overall benefits in relation to costs*

Partially Successful (B) - *some overall benefits in relation to costs*

Little Successful (C) - *limited overall benefits in relation to costs*

Unsuccessful (D) - *no overall benefits in relation to costs*

The judgement on the Overall Success Rating is informed by a combination of subjective and objective appraisals, including the project's contribution to achievement of ODA's **priority objectives** (listed in the upper section of the table). First an assessment is made of the relative response to the project of each objective, which may be **Principal** or **Significant**, or, if not applicable, **+** or **-**, as well as **'-'**. Where an objective objective is established as **applicable**, the judgement assessment is given in **boldface**. Each performance objective in this enabled a rating, based only on the **subjective** opinion of the four-panel criteria.

Project Performance Criteria	Relative Importance	Success Rating
Economic Liberalisation	-	-
Enhancing Productive Capacity	-	-
Good Governance	-	-
Poverty Impact	Principal	B
Human Resources: Education	Principal	B
Human Resources: Health	-	-
Human Resources: Children by Choice	-	-
Environmental Impact	-	-
Impact upon Women	WID relevant	B
Social Impact	Principal	B
Institutional Impact	Principal	C
Technical Success	Significant	B
Time Management within Schedule	Significant	C
Cost Management within Budget	(Significant)	A+
Adherence to Project Conditions	(Significant)	D
Cost Effectiveness	(Significant)	B
Financial Rate of Return	-	-
Economic Rate of Return	-	-
Financial Sustainability	-	-
Institutional Sustainability	Principal	C
Overall Sustainability	(Significant)	C
Overall SUCCESS RATING: ODA PROJECT		B

TC Equipment	422	121	248	791	18	300	104	175	997	72%
TC Consultants	54	107	54	255	87	125	52	168	452	177%
UC Training	21	42	42	108		23	56	1	80	19%
Book Supplies	1	1	2	2					0	0%
Project management	39	21	29	89	11	19	19		60	67%
Sub-total, eFinance	577	292	373	1242	95	467	272	355	0	118%
Local consultants	35	41	35	111						
Local training	16	16	48							(no translation available)
Sub-total, local	51	57	51	159	45	76	54	29	0	204
TOTAL B590 price	628	349	424	1401	140	543	326	384	0	1303
TOTAL (cash price)	628	353	427	1448						1320

TABLE 2
EQUIPMENT BUDGET AND ACTUAL AMOUNT SPENT

	ORIGINAL BUDGET	REVISED BUDGET	ACTUAL EXPEND	Percent of Total
	-	-	-	
Land Rovers	208000		198871	
Motorcycles	40000		27750	
Motor Cycles	81000		9364	
Bicycles	44000		40025	
Sub-total, Vehicles	379000		362100	95%
Computers	107000		28807	
Materials/Paper for GILLNET/GILLNET	100000		43451	
Misc Printing Equipment	88000			
Sub-total, Printing	202000		72348	36%
Audio Equipment	22000		4030	
Radio and Batteries	62000		498	
Radio station equipment	18000			
Sub-total, Radio	102000		53361	52%
Office Equipment etc	104000		44254	
Video Equipment	2000		1628	
Sub-total, Admin	106000	60000	60582	56%
	792700	60000	548400	70%

*Note: Original budget from original IEC report, revised budget from IEC review, 1993
Breakdown of actual expenditure from ODA questionnaire
Course items may exclude fees and height

TABLE 3
RECIPIENTS OF UNICT TRAINING AWARDS

NAME	AGENCY THEN	AGENCY NOW	COURSE	LENGTH
Mr Tapan	IAE Tutor	IAE	MA Manchester Covers/Health Education	15 months
Mr Piazas	IAE Tutor	IAE	MS: Edinburgh Community Education	12 months
Mr Flaglay	IAE Tutor	IAE	ME Glasgow Adult/Community Education	15 months
Mr Asimbika	GILLNET	GILLNET	IEC Distance Teaching	6 months
Ms Yash	GBC	GBC	IEC and IECB Distance Teaching	6 months
Mr Gopmanar	Natl Service	Natl Service	IAE, Davao-Saleem Diploma, Adult Education	24 months
Mr Akday	NFED	NFED	IEC with study tour to Kenya Distance Teaching	4 months
Ms Ashko	NFED	WLD, GUY	MA Manchester, Adult Education Literature for Rural Devt	12 months
Ms S Kuria	NFED	NFED	MA Manchester Covers/Health Education	12 months
Mr Harvey	NFED	NFED	Cover Agents Materials Management	4.5 months
Mr Anshah	GBC	GBC	Institute of Education Distance Teaching	3.5 months
Mr Anita	NFED	Private Business	IEC: Desk-Top publishing Funded directly by IEC	11

TABLE 4
REGIONAL DATA ON SCHOOL ATTENDANCE

(From 1984 Census)

REGION	POPULATION OVER 14 (000)	POPULATION OVER 14 WHO DO NOT ATTEND SCHOOL	%age
Ashanti	1136	446	39%
Bong Ahafo	646	342	53%
Central	628	312	50%
Eastern	954	350	37%
Greater Accra	836	298	37%
Northern	600	527	88%
Upper East	427	373	87%
Upper West	676	301	45%
Volta	232	199	86%
Western	620	293	47%
TOTALS	6754	3360	50%

ODA PILOT DISTRICTS			
Upper East			
Bolgatanga	84	68	81%
Bongo	56	52	94%
Buiha	35	34	98%
Krachi	85	71	82%
Central	76	45	59%
Gomna	50	27	55%
Winnema			

TABLE 5
ODA FUNDED LOCAL TRAINING WORKSHOPS AND CONSULTANCIES

Ref	Subject	Participants	IEC Rep	Cost (L)
1989				
1	Evaluation Systems Planning	30		1000
2	National Programme Planning	n/a		1200
3	Planning for International Literacy Day	n/a		880
4	Training of Trainers	150		11600
5	Rural Radio Production	16	J Thomas	3070
6	Literacy Materials	15	M Ryan	3960
7	Training of Trainers and Materials	120		10080
8	Thematic Work	50		2060
9	Management Systems	15	B Reeves	870
10	Monitoring and Evaluation	13	T Dodds	1325
11	New Year School	120	L Brown	9500
1990				
1	Regional Planning and Training	70		3420
2	Regional Planning and Training	70		3420
3	Plan Strategy leader training	100		7300
4	Management Systems	15	B Reeves	870
5	Exeter School - Training and Planning	180		14280
6	Regional Training Teams	15		2600
7	Material Development	12		3070
8	National Adult Networks	300		9000

10	Post-teracy Readers	50	3300
11	Theatre for Development	20	3300
12	Regional Training Teams	20	3200
13	Training Officers Supervisors	50	10200
14	Monitoring and Evaluation	20	2500
15	Post-teracy materials	40	5000
16	Community Radio Programmes	20	2840
17	Radio Training (led by DFID)	400	82000
18	Management Review	20	1400
1991			
1	Radio Training		2740
2	Radio Training	J Thomas	2074
3	Management Review	B Reeves	7000
4	Materials production		7000
1992			
1	Radio Training	J Thomas	18800
2	Theatre in Development		1879
1993			
Maintenance Payments to Governments			
1000			

TABLE 6 SUMMARY OF CONSULTANCY INPUTS PROVIDED THROUGH IEC

	Number of Days	% Share
Radio/Production	144	10%
Materials Development	147	10%
Training of Trainers	46	3%
Video Production	48	3%
Theatre in Development	27	2%
Monitoring and Evaluation	16	1%
Women in Development	45	3%
Management and Financial Systems	156	11%
Fleet Management	61	4%
MIS and End of Project Reviews	60	4%
Visits by Biery Reeves	165	12%
	940	100%
NOTE: In the original project document, the following was provided for:		
Management systems development	158	
External printing/GTP	24	
Unspecified training considerations	248	
Monitoring and Evaluation	36	
Project Reviews	46	
	522	

TABLE 7 DETAILS OF CONSULTANCY INPUTS MANAGED BY IEC

Date	Consultant	Subject	Days
1989			
Sept	B Reeves	Equipment specification	12
Oct	J Thomas	Radio Production Training	24
Oct/Nov	M Byram	Materials Production	18
Dec	B Reeves	Management Systems/Project Review	21
Dec	T Doble	Project Review	12
1990			
Jan/Feb	J Thomas	Radio Production Training	18
Jan/Feb	M Byram	Materials Production	9
Feb/Mar	B Reeves	Management Systems	12
Apr/May	B Reeves	Management Systems	15
Apr	M Byram	Training of Regional Training Teams	12
Jun	B Reeves	Management Systems	15
Jul	S Macdonald	Post-teracy Materials	12
Aug	M Byram	Training of Regional Training Teams	12
Aug/Sept	J Thomas	Radio Production	27
Sept	B Reeves	Management Systems	18
Oct	S Jolly	Video Production	48
Oct/Dec	J Inger	Office Management	48
Oct/Nov	M Kallappa	Review of Regional Training Teams	18
Oct/Nov	M Byram	Review of Regional Training Teams	6
Nov	B Reeves	Management Systems	15
1991			
Jan	Phil Taylor	Monitoring and Evaluation	18
Feb	T Doble	Materials Review	18
Feb/Mar	S Agnew	Women in Development	27
Apr	A Bule	Radio Training	9
Jul	J Thomas	Radio Production	24
Aug	B Reeves	Management Systems	12
Aug	S Agnew	Women in Development	18
Sept	M Byram	Materials Production	27
Oct/Nov	B Reeves	Management Systems	11
Nov	C Joubert	Management and Organisation	18
Nov	J Harrison	Management and Organisation	18
1992			
Feb	J Thomas	Radio Production	33
Mar	B Reeves	Management Systems	15
Mar	O Okagbue	Theatre in Development	27
Jun	B Reeves	Management Systems	18
Jun	N Gertsen	Financial MIS	36
Jul	C Bacon	Materials Development	27
Jul	M Alford	Mass Enrich	9
Aug	P Cohen	Print Production	18
Sept/Oct	J Wilson	Fleet Management	24
Nov/Dec	B Reeves	Management Systems	12
1993			
Feb	T Doble	End-of-project review	12
Feb	B Reeves	End-of-project review	13
Feb	R Yates	End-of-project review	14
Feb	R Carr-Hill	End-of-project review	10
Feb/Mar	J Brindley	Post-teracy materials	36
Mar	J Wilson	Fleet Management	28
Mar/Jun	J Wilson	Fleet Management (training Chris Takemoo)	12

ANNEX A

TERMS OF REFERENCE

A1. GENERAL APPROACH

A1.1 The evaluation will be carried out in accordance with the Guidance Notes provided by Evaluation Department.

A1.2 The scope of the evaluation will include the direct achievements of the project in the job/area, its influence on the design and implementation of the national literacy programme, and the impact of the national programme itself.

A2. OVERALL OBJECTIVES

A2.1 To assess the impact of the project in terms of its objectives, including the likely sustainability of benefits and the replicability of the methods used.

A2.2 To identify the main constraints on project implementation.

A2.3 To consider whether the costs of the project were justified by its benefits.

A2.4 To draw lessons for the planning and implementation of similar projects in future.

A3. IDENTIFICATION

A3.1 How was the project identified as a priority area for funding by DFID, and was it consistent with UK savings trends and to Ghana?

A3.2 Did the project fit in with the Ghana Government's policy priorities and strategies for PAMISQAD?

A4. DESIGN AND APPRAISAL

A4.1 Was the project adequately designed and appraised with respect to the definition of objectives, assumptions, outputs and inputs? Were alternative options examined?

A4.2 Were the literacy strategy and the methodology adopted, technically appropriate to the needs of the target group?

A4.3 Were project stakeholders (including national Ghanaian institutions, and potential beneficiaries within the target community) consulted about the design of the project?

A4.4 Did the appraisal take into account social and gender considerations?

file:///newpage2.htm

- AA.2 Did project design take adequate account of the policy environment within which it is operated?
- AA.3 Did project design adequately address the strengths and weaknesses of the local arrangements for managing the project, including the co-ordination of inputs from the various private and public sector agencies involved, and did it address the needs for institutional development?
- AA.4 Did project design make satisfactory arrangements for the management of the UK inputs into the project?
- AA.5 Was an economic appraisal undertaken, and what was the methodology used and the definition of specific benefits appraised?
- AA.6 Were adequate arrangements made for monitoring and reporting on project implementation, and for evaluating project progress?
- AA.10 Were the conditions (if any) of project approval appropriate?

AA IMPLEMENTATION

- AA.1 Did the project meet its implementation targets in the pilot areas, and if not, what were the reasons for under-achievement? Were the targets realistic?
- AA.2 How effective was the local management of the project, at the local and CD level, and how well co-ordinated were the activities of the various concerned partners?
- AA.3 Were the locally funded elements of the project (teaching materials, literacy trainers, etc.) made available as and when required?
- AA.4 How often adequate liaison with other literacy agency involved in literacy programming?
- AA.5 How effective were the arrangements for managing the UK contribution to the project?
- AA.6 How effective were procurement procedures in providing the UK equipment on time, and cost-effectively?
- AA.7 How effective was the selection and management of UK consultants?
- AA.8 How project implementation adequately monitored and reported on, and was data collected to enable the subsequent evaluation of project impact?
- AA.9 How effectively did ODA monitor the project? What use was made of reports, locally and by ODA, to review project design and implementation strategy?
- AA.10 Were project conditions suitable?

AA IMPACT

General

- AA.1 What impact has the ODA project had on levels of literacy in the pilot districts, and how sustainable is this impact?
- AA.2 How well selected and how effectively, has the national literacy campaign used the approach followed in the pilot areas, including the teaching methods and materials developed and the approach to programme management?
- AA.3 How well has the national literacy campaign brought relevant literacy needs?
- AA.4 If the impact is less than expected, the constraints should be identified and explained?

Technical

- AA.5 How effective were the UK consultancy inputs? What criteria were used to select consultants, and were the right consultants selected? Did they receive adequate cooperation from the support? Were their recommendations acted on?
- AA.6 How effectively were local consultants used?
- AA.7 Was the equipment supplied from the UK appropriate, and was it used as intended? Will it continue to be used?
- AA.8 Were locally sourced inputs used effectively?
- AA.9 Was the local and UK training appropriate and adequate, and how effectively did the literacy trainers perform?

AA.10 Were the quality of programme content, teaching methods and teaching materials used? How effective was the use of radio? Was it a correct decision to promote literacy in local languages as opposed to English? How sufficient local literacy material been made available?

Social

- AA.11 How has benefited from the project and were these the intended beneficiaries? How successful was the project in targeting and benefiting women, and people from lower income groups and from poorer regions of the country?
- AA.12 Did the project meet identified needs for literacy training, especially among women and poor people?
- AA.13 Was the literacy material appropriate to local circumstances and cultural context?
- AA.14 Were classes organized to fit in with local circumstances, eg the timing of women involvement in agricultural activities and household duties? Did participants involve additional care to potential beneficiaries and therefore attract attention?

AA.15 How the project helped to develop self-sustaining literacy centres which will continue after the project is completed?

Economic

- AA.16 How the costs of the project (including local costs paid by the Ghana Government), Delhi, and where possible, identify the economic and local benefits which have resulted from project activities.
- AA.17 Where the costs of the project justified by its benefits? If benefits cannot be quantified, assess whether the expenditure constituted a cost-effective means of achieving project objectives? Where possible, costs of similar programmes in Ghana and elsewhere should be used for comparative purposes.

ANNEX B

FINANCIAL AND PEOPLE'S MET

25 Sept	pm	Arrived in Accra
26 Sept	pm	Nana Kwame Premee, Project Officer, Literacy project, World Bank, David Harding, Education Staff Officer, ODA, Mike Wood, First Secretary, Ghana High Commission. Initial discussion with NPEED, Paa Moses Nana, Mr Aducci and Mr Nketia
27 Sept	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
28 Sept	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
29 Sept	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
30 Sept	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
1 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
2 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
3 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
4 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
5 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
6 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
7 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
8 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
9 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
10 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
11 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
12 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
13 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
14 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
15 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
16 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
17 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
18 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
19 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
20 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
21 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
22 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
23 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
24 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
25 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
26 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
27 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
28 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
29 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
30 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED
31 Oct	pm	Meeting with staff of NPEED

ANNEX C

THE EDUCATION SECTOR AND LITERACY IN GHANA

THE EDUCATION CONTEXT

- C1. Ghana's education system was generally held to have been relatively effective until the mid-1970s. With the onset of economic decline, there was a significant fall in education funding (from 6.4% of GDP in 1976 to 1.4% in 1983) and this, combined with an exodus of many of the best teachers, resulted in the virtual collapse of the education system by the mid 1980s. Indeed, despite some progress, it is still described as catastrophic by some observers.
- C2. The decline in resources and the loss of staff led to a situation in which the country of about 27% of the population in 1980 had, according to the Ghana Living Standards Survey, which measured reading, writing and numeracy skills, only 23% who could read and 45% who could write.
- C3. The sector's response to the rise of the military in 1982 was to establish a Technical and Adult Education Unit of Ghana (TAEU) which was established in the early 1980s to produce materials for a national deployed staff literacy centre and a network of adult literacy centres. The TAEU also has a history of literacy activity with a duty to service the community in its terms. Activities embrace non-formal education programmes, including training for adult literacy work. It is managed in turn by various departments at its regional centres and produces community newspapers.
- C4. Since 1982 the Ministry of Education has been the Ghana Institute of Linguistics, Literacy and Basic Education (GILLLE) which has developed programmes for 21 minority languages, primarily in the North, and publishes a journal of primary and post-primary materials in Ghanaian languages. Literacy in Ghanaian and is estimated to have made over 40,000 adult functionally literate since 1982.
- C5. In 1984, a national literacy campaign was launched in Ghana. This has made significant contributions towards improving literacy in the country, although there has been regression. This can partly be explained by the fact that their progress are somewhat disparate as are their patterns over some of the key issues surrounding literacy, particularly those of training methodology and the policy on language for literacy. Annex D provides additional background on literacy issues. It is important to realize that the key earlier projects addressed these matters and the decisions they reached are likely to have had some impact on the workings of the current FLTP, not least because many of the skilled Ghanaian literacy workers have been exposed to those earlier programmes and the different approaches which they applied.

ANNEX D

A GENERAL REVIEW OF LITERACY APPROACHES, STRATEGIES AND METHODS

APPROACHES

- D1. These main approaches have been identified to promote literacy - mass literacy campaigns, strategies integrating primary education with adult literacy programmes and selective literacy campaigns with a focus often linked to particular needs for skill and income-generation.
- D2. Mass literacy campaigns represent national efforts to involve some development partners assumed to be attributable to the levels of literacy and skills amongst adults. This technical view of literacy incorporated the notion of fundamental literacy, literacy which provides skills to enable the individual to participate in Ghanaian society with men and women other than as a peasant or an illiterate. It is below mentioned some lessons from past literacy campaigns.
- D3. The second approach to literacy has also been widely acknowledged. The Regional programme for the Extension of Literacy in Africa launched in 1984 argued for a regionally anchored campaign to move towards universal primary education and promotion of literacy for young people and adults. Such an approach has the advantage of being mutually reinforcing, one of its motives being to 'empower the poor'. Examples of the third approach are those selective literacy campaigns which have a narrow specification of both target groups and desirable outcomes and which the literacy is very particular needs for ill-generation and income-generation.
- D4. The fourth approach to literacy encompasses the mass literacy programmes of the states and emerging ones to be undertaken, in contrast, the mass literacy programmes in South America have emphasized the process of learning and literacy as a means of developing critical awareness and economic life. Literacy and empowerment have become the prevailing themes in the last decade. But there can be an unresolvable tension between the objectives of those who seek for social empowerment and the challenges of meeting power structures and the desire of governments to control situations which they are engineering. This key goal may be intractable. Finally, approach to literacy involving has been used worldwide, though not always in the spirit in which it was conceived. The designs centered on applying the methods superficially devoid of an understanding of literacy in the goal of critical awareness and liberation are also flawed (see paragraph D10).
- D5. An examination of the Ghanaian campaign shows that it is the reality more than the ideal. Consequently, I aimed to reinforce the objectives of as many actors involved in social and economic development as possible. NPEED's MFLSP policy document stresses the importance of functional literacy and the empowerment of the beneficiaries. The methodological approach adopted is described as a modified Freirean approach.

STRATEGIES AND METHODOLOGIES

- D6. The basic of literacy is often controversial. It is particularly apparent within the programme design of different agencies involved in literacy activities in Ghana, in elsewhere, hold quite strong beliefs about the best approach to teaching literacy. A variety of methodological foundations of teaching strategies have evolved over time. Some programmes use thematic subject matter as the entry point to the teaching activity, others adopt a key word or key sentence approach, while still others advocate the use of symbolic drills. The actual methods used will range from the didactic to the more participatory Freirean approach. The differences between the various points are not only reflected in the end and in a combination of strategies and methods is used. Often, too, the disagreements about strategies and methods are more ideological and political than pedagogical.
- D7. The main categories of methods in other fields, with less heated camps being identified, one of which applies to the more traditional didactic teaching methods, the other has been based on innovative practices. Discussion of literacy methods, however, is distinguished by the fact that the Freirean perspective on adult learning derives directly from Freire's own experience of literacy among oppressed peasants. Literacy, he maintained, should develop peasants' consciousness of their world and to use in non-formal education programme is particularly favourable. Freirean didactic to adults for non-formal education being seen as being something that is difficult to do any other way, they can reach large numbers of geographically dispersed people relatively cheaply.
- D8. The lesson from experience with didactic approaches to literacy is somewhat mixed and very complex, particularly in the use of educational materials. Radio has a rather better track record. There are, however, few comprehensive evaluation studies of distance education programmes and drawing conclusions about their effectiveness is difficult.
- D9. The most of the broadcast media range from recording tapes to radio. The use of audio-visual aids by the teacher to improve quality and complement the teacher by releasing the teacher altogether. These methods are used for public and mobilization purposes.
- D10. Discussions concerning the overall literacy strategy, both with respect to the selection of media combinations and their mode of use are likely to be determined by a range of factors, particularly the overall teaching-learning objectives, the literacy methodology, learner characteristics, environmental factors, media infrastructure and distribution patterns, and the organization structure to deliver. The last mentioned is particularly important for the programme's effective running. The organizational model adopted for literacy programmes usually involves administration in a hierarchical and regionalized basis, with the field being provided training, support and supervision of the group leaders and literacy classes. Achieving a balance, however, between grass roots organization and top-down organizational structures presents a problem under all circumstances.

LANGUAGE POLICIES

- D14. The key policy decision in the design of literacy programmes concerns the language of literacy. There are two issues here. First, whether the programme should focus on promoting literacy in the vernacular or in an international language, and second, if the choice is for the vernacular, which one. Prevaling wisdom argues for promoting literacy in the mother tongue and then enabling the transfer of the acquired skills to other languages at post-literacy stage.
- D15. Language policy remains a topic of continuing debate in both primary and adult education in Ghana where there are any distinct language groups, spoken by almost 15 million people. Only seven of the languages are used for political and administrative purposes. English is the official language and the language of instruction from Primary level 3 (prior to which is mother-tongue teaching). These days appear to have been general consensus about the decision to focus on vernacular language, at least during the early phase of the FLTP where there was specific targeting to reasonably clearly defined language groups in the two pilot areas. The language policy, however, in the formal education system is not followed strictly and the lesson environment throughout most of Ghana does appear to be predominantly English.

FOCUS/PRI: MASS LITERACY CAMPAIGNS, LESSONS FROM EXPERIENCE

- D16. Numerous reviews of adult literacy programmes appear in the literature - some of the lessons from experience are summarized below.
 - a. primary self and individualism: the essential element is to provide leadership and vision, which in turn can secure the mobilization of resources (Fuchs and Pannozzi).
 - b. Administrative structure: there is a need to balance centralized leadership and decentralized implementation, and to develop local and suitable structures to promote horizontal cooperation between a variety of agencies.
 - c. Pilot literacy: literacy campaigns must be beyond literacy itself, moving towards the concept of lifelong learning. The planning and implementation of post-literacy education is essential to ensure literacy can be sustained.
 - d. Literacy: The most important was on literacy capabilities personnel and the training of voluntary teachers. The main lesson to emerge is that political and psychological training appear to have important effects on formal teacher training - commitment, political awareness, sensitivity to programme goals and equality with the learning group are key factors.
 - D17. Campaign design: The basic curricula and materials are those which can be produced constructively by relatively unskilled teachers, with materials related to the practical realities which the campaign faces.
- #### Effective Literacy Practice - Stakeholder Guided Guidelines
- i. ensuring the centrality of learners in the literacy process;
 - ii. building on previous initiatives and allowing a long lead-in period to prepare for programme to begin;
 - iii. providing flexibility of provision to participants with access:
 - a. choosing an appropriate curricular content and who carries local report;
 - b. providing an organizational commitment which includes an understanding of the length of time needed to reach sustainable literacy levels;
 - c. developing local learning materials as part of the programme, including local newspapers and local writing;
 - d. working in single and mixed gender groups;
 - e. using a variety of teaching forms, eg storytelling, dialogue, debate, tape-recording, etc.

ANNEX E

ODA SUPPORT FOR THE PILOT PROJECT

INTRODUCTION

- E1. The ODA support project was designed to help NPEED build the necessary in place management and organization, coordination, materials development (textbook and guide), group leader training, monitoring and evaluation.
- E2. The inputs were of four types: consultation (see Tables 6 and 7); procurement and supply of materials and equipment (Table 4); support for local consultants (Table 5); and UK training assets (Table 3).
- E3. The seven projects are sections of project implementation in view of the key operational areas, training of trainers and implementation of books at both the pilot area and the national campaign and identifies the specific contributions of ODA inputs in each area.

TRAINING OF TRAINERS (TOT)

