[redacted]

From: [redacted]
Sent: 15 June 2012 09:30
To: PS/Jim Paice (Secretariat); PS/Jim Paice (Secretariat)
Subject: FW: Syngenta - [redacted] - Cruiser OSR
Importance: High

Please find a corrected version of the letter attached. This version supersedes the original version sent a few minutes ago and has the correct title details and address for the Minister.

Regards,

[redacted]

Syngenta
Jealott's Hill International Research Centre
Bracknell, Berks RG42 6EY
[redacted]

From: [redacted]
Sent: 15 June 2012 09:22
To: 'PS/Jim Paice (Secretariat)'; 'PS.James.Paice@defra.gsi.gov.uk'
Cc: [redacted]
Subject: Syngenta - [redacted] - Cruiser OSR
Importance: High

Dear Minister,

Further to recent communications please find attached a letter from [redacted] at Syngenta, in regard to the recent statement from the French government that they intend to suspend the use of the neonicotinoid seed treatment Cruiser OSR.

Given the profile of this issue it is reasonable to expect that there may be discussion in the Agriculture Council meeting next week in Luxembourg. On that basis I hope that the points raised in the letter will be noted by the department and the Ministers and officials attending.

Regards,

Syngenta
Jealott's Hill International Research Centre
Bracknell, Berks RG42 6EY

This message may contain confidential information. If you are not the designated recipient, please notify the sender immediately, and delete the original and any copies. Any use of the message by you is prohibited.

[redacted]

Syngenta Crop Protection UK Ltd
CPC4, Capital Park
Fulbourn
CAMBRIDGE
CB21 5XE
www.syngenta-crop.co.uk

[redacted]
Email:
[redacted]

syngenta

14 June 2012

James Paice MP
Minister of State for Agriculture and Food
Department of Environment, Food and Rural Affairs
Nobel House
17 Smith Square
London
SW1P 3JR

Dear Minister,

I write with respect to the intention of the French Ministry of Agriculture to suspend a neonicotinoid-based seed treatment, CRUISER® OSR, because of doubt about the product's impact on bee health. This technology is essential for the protection of the oilseed rape crop.

This subject may be discussed on the fringes of next week's Agriculture Council in Luxembourg.

The decision of the French Ministry lacks a credible scientific basis and we want to ensure that you have some important facts to defend the continued use of this essential and safe technology by farmers in your country. The French have made clear their intention to persuade other Member States to support an EU-wide suspension of all neonicotinoid seed treatments.

Neonicotinoid-based seed treatments for oilseed rape, (which includes CRUISER® OSR), have been used safely for over 10 years on approximately seven million hectares across the EU without any bee incidents, avoiding yield losses which can be up to 30%. The loss of this technology will cost farmers and consumers up to €1 billion, undermining the production of safe and affordable food.

The proposal to suspend CRUISER® OSR is based on a single, experimental study, authored by Michael Henry, which used a high and unrealistic dose rate which, not surprisingly, impaired the ability of bees to return to their hives.

The Henry study is also at odds with very similar research conducted nearly 10 years ago by Werner von der Ohe, a respected researcher into bee health, which found no impact on the ability of bees to return to their hives at realistic exposure levels.

Furthermore, if you read the written report from the French safety agency, ANSES, you will see that the decision of the Minister in France is not supported by their conclusions. EFSA also warns against drawing definitive conclusions from the Henry study.

If CRUISER® OSR is suspended, you should be in no doubt that <u>there are no other seed treatment alternatives for oilseed rape</u> which means farmers will be forced to spray more insecticides which are less effective in controlling pests.

If this subject is discussed during next week's Agriculture Council, I would urge you to resist any pressure for an EU-wide suspension of neonicotinoid-based seed treatments. EFSA has an ongoing review of the risk assessment framework for pesticides and bees and should complete this by the end of 2012. Any action to suspend or ban neonicotinoid-based seed treatments before this review is complete would be entirely premature and completely undermine the robustness of the EU regulatory process.
It would also severely and unnecessarily disadvantage your farmers.

Finally, let me assure you that Syngenta is absolutely committed to sustainable agriculture and the essential role played by pollinating insects like bees. We have done more than most to scientifically understand bee health in the context of productive agriculture and have already put in place substantive solutions, including the provision of habitat and nutrition for bees, which are today making a real difference to their well-being.

I remain at your disposal should you wish to discuss this matter further.

Yours sincerely

[redacted]