

UKCCIS Executive Board Meeting Minutes
14:00 – 16:00, 8 December 2015
Lords Committee Room 2A, House of Lords
Chair: Baroness Joanna Shields

Attendees:

Baroness Joanna Shields	Minister for Internet Safety and Security
Karen Bradley, MP	Minister for Preventing Abuse and Exploitation
Edward Timpson, MP	Minister for Children and Families
John Carr	CHIS
David Austin	BBFC
Will Gardner	Safer Internet Centre
Jonathan Baggaley	CEOP (in place of Jonny Gwynn)
Susie Hargreaves	IWF
Aleyne Johnson	Samsung
Adam Kinsley	Sky
Alan Wardle	NSPCC
Catherine Duggan	Scottish Executive
Dave Miles	FOSI
Katie O'Donovan	Google
Claudio Pollack	Ofcom
Paul Cording	Vodafone (in place of Cindy Rose)
Rishi Saha	Facebook
Vicki Shotbolt	ParentZone
Jo Twist	UKIE
Dr Julia Davidson	Middlesex University (in place of Sonia Livingstone)
Rachel O'Connell	Trust Elevate (Age Verification Working Group Chair)
Anne Longfield*	Children's Commissioner
Mohini Morris*, Ed Walkington*	Department for Health
Martin Wrigley*	Application Developers Alliance
Anna Payne	UKCCIS Secretariat

(*attended full meeting, presented agenda item)

Apologies received from:

Nicola Hodson	Microsoft
Dr Sonia Livingstone	LSE
Tink Palmer	Marie Collins Foundation
Emilie Boman	Virgin Media
Iain Wood	TalkTalk

Observers:

Sam Sharps	Apple	Ellie Mond	DCMS
Michael Bell	DfE	Samantha Kelly	DCMS
Anna Strudwick	Home Office	Stephen Balkam	FOSI
Silvia Fukuoka	Ofcom	Emily Mulder	FOSI
Sarah Andrew	Ofcom	Henry Anderton	DCMS
Annie Mullins	Ask FM	Stephen Bell	Home Office
Tamara Walker	Home Office	PS Edward Timpson	Jason Morris
PS Karen Bradley	Sean McGarry	PS Baroness Shields	Bradley Finn

Item 1 - Welcome, introductions, apologies and declaring interests

1. The Chair opened the meeting and welcomed attendees. She noted that she was incredibly proud of the work being done across the UK, and that there were many incredible initiatives underway. She was grateful to be part of this group and thanked members for their contributions.
2. She reminded Board members of their responsibilities and to declare any interests.
3. The Chair updated the action points from the previous meeting: the secretariat has circulated research from the BBFC as well as an update on ParentInfo from ParentZone.

Item 2 - Anne Longfield, the Children's Commissioner for England, on the work of her Growing Up Digital Taskforce

4. Anne Longfield thanked Baroness Shields for inviting her to attend. She has been the Children's Commissioner since March. Early on, she had conversations with children and experts about the new digital existence that children are growing up in. They highlighted not only their fears and worries, but also their sense that so much is possible online.
5. The Children's Commissioner hopes to build on the good work of iRights. Beeban Kidron, Liam Hackett (Ditch the Label), Alice Webb (BBC), Jenny Afia (Schillings), Sonia Livingstone (LSE and a UKCCIS Board member), Jon Drori (Ravensbourne College) and Alice Miles (Children's policy adviser) are also part of the taskforce. The taskforce aims not only to understand children's digital experience, but also to explore how this can be harnessed for good, and what growing up as a digital native means in relation to children's behaviour. Children and young people will also be key contributors to its work.
6. One meeting has been held so far. Members of the taskforce will consider questions including what it's like growing up in a digital age and how it shapes the way we think and act, whether laws need to change, whether there's more that parents need to do, and whether technological changes are needed. The taskforce intends to report at the end of 2016 – UKCCIS members' input at that stage would be welcomed.
7. Discussion followed, with these points raised:
 - i. It's great that the taskforce will be child-led. The age of children inputting into the taskforce is 15-18, but there's also a wider group of younger children will also advise.
 - ii. The report's findings will be addressed to whoever is relevant – including industry, parents, and wider society.
 - iii. For children, developments over the last five years have made a huge difference to their lives, but the speed of this change is not always sufficiently recognised.
 - iv. How will the taskforce interact with the UN Convention of the Rights of the Child, and enshrine within the UK the rights of children? The speed of change is so fast that legislation often can't keep up – it is important to look at principles and build them into our approaches.

- v. Commissioners in the UK's other nations are not looking at this issue at the same time or in the same order, but the Children's Commissioner would encourage them to do so.
- vi. On children's participation - Sky is developing a product with iRights which is being tested and developed by children.
- vii. The taskforce will also seek to reflect other countries' best practice.

Item 3 – Update from the Department of Health *Edward Walkington and Mohini Morris*

8. Department of Health (DH) officials provided an update about their department's work around children and young people's mental health and wellbeing, and the digital world. In particular, they spoke about the development of an online learning module for professionals, and the Government's response to recommendations from a recent youth select committee.
9. Key challenges in this area include a high prevalence of mental health problems in children and rising demand for services; the complexities of service commissioning and provision; and three key identified gaps - a data gap, a treatment gap and an acceptance gap (i.e. due to fear and stigma).
10. Risks here include a lack of safe space for children online, dangerous sites (e.g. cyberbullying, pro-ana), (lack of) digital connectivity, increasing isolation, and a lack of understanding by adults. Opportunities include easier access to help and information online, peer support online and champions to help reduce stigma.
11. In March 2015, the Children and Young People's Mental Health Taskforce set out 49 proposals to transform services. Two of these related to digital issues:
 - i. Incentivise development of new apps and digital tools, and consider the need for a kite marking scheme in respect of the quality of the different offers;
 - ii. Enable clear and safe access to high quality information and online support for children, young people, parents and carers, for example through a national, branded web-based portal.
12. Responding to this opportunity, DH has set up a youth mental health hub on NHS Choices, bringing information together in one place. This has been live since October 2015, and is in ongoing development. Additionally, DH is funding two innovation opportunities: a Small Business Research Initiative (SBRI) Competition which included children mental health products; and a targeted Children and Young People Mental Health Innovation Fund in 2016/17.
13. DH has also developed a new MindEd resource to train professionals to tackle risks - this includes topics on, for example, self-esteem and identity. This resource will be launched as part of Safer Internet Day at the Eden project.
14. DfE is funding an expansion to MindEd for parents, to inform them about how to deal with online risks and resilience.
15. The Youth Select Committee put forward three key digital recommendations:
 - 14: Government to facilitate a roundtable for charities, tech companies, young people and Government to talk about cyber bullying and self-harm sites
 - 15: Endorsement system for online resources, informed by young people.

- 16: Develop a trusted app with NHS branding including a mental health first aid kit and signposts to mental health services and online resources. Suggestions for how UKCCIS could help with this includes – cross-promotion of work, involvement in a roundtable with young people, keeping each other informed of relevant work.

16. Discussion followed with these points raised:

- i. There is a BSI standard relevant to assessing the safety of mental health apps. There may be opportunities to link with Rachel O’Connell’s work on age checking.
- ii. The online module is not currently live but UKCCIS members will be able to see it once it’s up - it will include lots of resources around mental health, including games.
- iii. The Future in Mind report also contains a proposal for bringing schools and services together through a pilot. 22 areas across 250 schools are part of this pilot, along with Child and Adolescent Mental Health Services (CAMHS). It would be useful to explore whether there is a digital element to this, and to consider whether training with teachers and CAMHS team would impact on risk and digital opportunity. DfE is also looking at whether to include a reference in new safeguarding guidance for schools.
- iv. The UKCCIS Evidence Working Group has a very good series of research highlights that summarises evidence in this area.
- v. It was acknowledged that there might be a need to promote the work of UKCCIS more proactively through wider networks, and it may be that DH can support this. Could the DH be incorporated into UKCCIS in some form? It was noted that DH regularly observes UKCCIS Executive Board meetings. The Secretariat will also request DH input into the UKCCIS newsletter to help inform members about developments in the health arena.
- vi. The IWF Board expressed an interest in information around impact of mental health on sexual abuse online. Also it was noted that the NSPCC’s Childline is regularly contacted by children about mental health.
- vii. Children under care or protection orders are afforded extra protections offline - does this apply online too?

Action: The UKCCIS Secretariat will forward on contact details for Mohini Morris and Edward Walkington. Members who want to engage further on these issues should contact DH directly.

Item 4 - Findings of UKCCIS Education Group’s ‘State of the Nation’ report *Jonathan Baggaley, CEOP and Chair of Education Working Group*

17. David Brown from Ofsted was due to attend but sends his apologies as floods have affected his plans.
18. This year has seen a refocused education working group – specifically the group is looking at how schools are responding to the challenges of online safety and how

well they are meeting expectations. The group was helped by two useful reports. The first, the South West Grid for Learning's State of the Nation report, takes data from the 360 degree safe audit tool with about 7,000 registered schools. Although there is a possibility that this is a self-selecting group, the size of the sample and the fact that some schools scored themselves very badly indicates that it is a solid set of data. The second useful report is Ofsted's online safety inspection data, with which schools were required to participate. The group looked at the findings of both and decided to focus on i) what schools should be doing, ii) what's actually happening, iii) how UKCCIS could usefully contribute.

19. Until three years ago, when Ofsted introduced guidelines for inspectors, there were few fixed expectations in this area. In DfE's guidance Keeping Children Safe in Education, it now notes (in relation to online safety) that schools should:

- i. Provide training and continuous professional development opportunities to all staff;
- ii. Develop incident reporting mechanisms, together with policies and procedure;
- iii. Deliver online safety education to their pupils;
- iv. Engage leadership and ensure good governance arrangements around online safety.

20. It is important firstly to note that overall, the report points to a positive picture – things really have improved.

21. The Working Group put forward the following recommendations:

- i. *The UKCCIS Education Group to explore in more detail the assessment that online safety training is a weakness for schools*
Training - most schools are aware that training is an area of weakness. This is supported by NSPCC research.
- ii. *The UKCCIS Education Group to review current reporting guidance available to schools and update reporting flow charts*
Policies and procedure - most schools have policies, there is some evidence of these being developed with young people and some evidence that these are being updated. There is a need to unpick which guidance schools are getting, and determine how and when to involve national organisations.
- iii. *The UKCCIS Education Group to work with stakeholders to produce a detailed framework for teachers to identify the learning pupils should have received by the end of each key stage*
Delivering online safety education - one-off assemblies are not going to suffice. Lots of resources are available but there is a lack of clarity about what young people know, understand, feel, and are able to say at end of each key stage.
- iv. *The UKCCIS Education Group should work with stakeholders, including the National Governors' Association, to raise awareness of online safety with governors and provide tools to support governing bodies in addressing issues with schools.*

Leadership - the group found that there was a weakness around the role of Governors.

- v. *The UKCCIS Education Group should produce guidance for schools on working with external organisations providing online safety services.*
Supporting schools - a range of independent organisations provide information and services to schools - there has been a growth in this market.
- vi. *The UKCCIS Education Group to convene a roundtable to explore the implications of future technology for online safety*
Tomorrow's challenges - we tend to focus on today's challenges, but need to be aware of what might happen in the future.

22. Discussion followed and these points were raised:

- i. DfE has been part of the working group. It was noted that the UK is doing quite well compared to other parts of the world, but we're still in a catch-up phase. Instilling character and resilience cannot only help academic performance, but also prepares children for the new world. The Department is keen to work on these recommendations and use its networks to push schools in the right direction.
- ii. There are some schools that are excellent when it comes to use of Internet filtering technologies, but many could improve. The statutory guidance on Keeping Children Safe could be clearer about the use of filters in schools.
- iii. It may be helpful to set out expectations at each key stage to give teachers confidence that what they're doing to teach about online safety works.
- iv. DfE might give out stronger messages to help make sure online safety in schools is being taught and addressed effectively, and to better encapsulate current knowledge.
- v. Peer to peer learning is very important in education. Civil society can also develop peer-to-peer models, as well as developing top down approaches. The working group has so far focused on a top down approach, as it believes it is worth looking at what we can do together centrally.
- vi. The group could look at the 'how I use the internet' questionnaire from a few years ago which tested levels of experience, guidelines and risk taking behaviour (funded by Becta).
- vii. It was noted that when surveyed, many private schools in Scotland stated that online safety wasn't considered to be an issue. It was also noted that differences in the way online safety is addressed across schools also exist in England, but that statutory guidance applies to all schools.

Action: The Secretariat to circulate the Education Working Group's report to the Executive Board.

Action: The Education Working Group to come back to the board at the next meeting with a plan for how to take forward the recommendations - this will include a work plan including proposed actions, and an estimated timeline for delivery.

Item 5 - App Developers Alliance (Martin Wrigley and Beverly Eve)

23. The Alliance is a not for profit global membership organisation founded in the USA in 2012 to support app developers; it has been operating in the UK and Europe since 2014. It has over 200 industry members, and engages with around 12,000 developers across Europe. The Alliance aims to help developers' voices be heard, raises awareness of policy issues, hosts app strategy workshops, and undertakes research and publications. The Alliance can assist with conversations with regulators - it was initially set up to address concerns about privacy in apps. The Alliance is working with the European Commission on mobile health apps, and with the BSI on kitemarks.
24. The Alliance contributed to the UKCCIS social media guide for social media and interactive services, and will add the guide to its resources for developers.
25. A question was raised about whether the Alliance had cooperated with IARC (the International Age Rating Coalition).

<p>Action: The Alliance to let board members know whether they have cooperated with IARC.</p>
--

Item 6 - UKCCIS Guide for providers of social media and interactive services (Claudio Pollock)

26. Baroness Shield introduced this item, noting that the guide represented an outstanding collaborative achievement, and will be incredibly useful. It will be launched prior to Christmas, and the group is keen that all members support this with quotes and through awareness raising.
27. Claudio Pollock spoke. Ofcom was asked in December last year to lead a working group. The expertise around the table, and strong desire to deliver, meant that the group was able to achieve consensus and deliver the product. It was hoped that the guide's use of the ICT principles would resonate internationally. Safety by design is a key principle of the guide. Claudio gave his thanks to all who came together to produce this fantastic resource, and particularly to Silvia Fukuoka and Sarah Andrew at Ofcom.
28. For the guide to have impact, it must reach people who can benefit from its messages and translate this into improved services. It will be launched later this month and it would be helpful if everyone can commit time, resource and expertise for the outreach.
29. There is a big community of different types of developers and we need to find a way to help them build child safety into everything they do. There is also a need to keep the guide fresh and to review it every one or two years.
30. The UKCCIS Moderation Guidance is now out of date, and Ofcom suggests that UKCCIS focuses on this challenge as a natural and constructive next step.

Action: The Secretariat to ensure the guide is reviewed and updated as necessary every one or two years.

Action: The Secretariat to discuss with Ofcom the potential for its continued involvement. Members interested in chairing, or engaging with, a review of the Moderation Guidelines to approach the Secretariat.

31. Ofcom recommends identifying an industry advocate for child safety - TechCity has been mentioned in this regard. In the meantime, Ofcom will continue to chair the working group and bring together outreach activities.
32. Discussion followed and the following points were raised:
- i. Baroness Shields noted that many big companies have strong developer programmes, and the guidance must be disseminated to these. A national approach (for example, engaging a national advocate) as well as a global approach (using international networks to spread the guide's messages) is needed.
 - ii. The guidance will only be available in the current format for now, but if the outreach efforts indicate that a different format is needed, the social media working group is open to considering alternative formats.
 - iii. Baroness Shields suggested that a member of the group might write a blog to talk about their experiences as part of the working group, especially if they have a background as developer.
 - iv. Other suggestions for an industry advocate included Coadec and TechUK.
 - v. Karen Bradley asked about creating apps for online safety, e.g. to combat online bullying. Martin Wrigley said that there are apps for everything, and that financial incentives are the best way to drive the creation of new apps. Initiatives such as SBRI can be used to fund this sort of development

Action: Request for the tech companies to promulgate the guide through their developer programmes and networks. The social media working group to pursue this request.

Action: Request for members of the social media working group to write a blog about the process and to contact the Secretariat if interested.

Action: Baroness Shields endorsed exploring outreach possibilities with TechCity and TechUK, as well as others in the field.

33. Anna Payne updated the board about plans to promote the guide, alongside other initiatives on online safety, prior to Christmas. She noted that a number of UKCCIS Board Members have over the past two months worked together to create a digestible 'companion' social media leaflet aimed at parents. Thanks were given to Internet Matters, the NSPCC, Parentzone, and the Safer Internet Centre for their excellent contributions to this project. A draft had been circulated to all members with the meeting papers. Members were asked to feed in any comments on the draft within the week.

7. Q&A on update papers provided by the Age Verification, Filters and Evidence Working Groups

34. Baroness Shields introduced this item by providing a brief update on the Government's position on filtering following Net Neutrality developments in Europe. The Prime Minister has been clear that we will do all we can to ensure this does not negatively affect the UK's current filters regime. The Government is still determining its approach, but Baroness Shields confirmed that it will develop a solution that won't run foul of the European Regulation by the deadline of 31st December 2016 and that we are nearly there in terms of making a firm decision.

<p>Action: DCMS officials to reach out to industry and consult them as the Government draws up and finalises its approach.</p>

35. Baroness Shields asked if the board had any questions about the update papers from the working groups. None were raised.

36. A question was raised about the Goddard Enquiry which will be considering child abuse images. Julia Davidson is on the academic advisory board and volunteered to act as a link with UKCCIS.

37. Karen Bradley noted that she had met Justice Goddard recently and confirmed that the enquiry will be entirely independent of Government.

Item 7 - The risk to children and vulnerable communities of extremist content online

38. Baroness Shields informed the Board of her new role within the Home Office - she is now a joint DCMS/ Home Office Minister. One issue she will look at is online content radicalisation material and its impact in the UK. The Home Office has also been working with industry to disrupt terrorist groups and industry has been working with police to take down content. This needs to be addressed as part of a global state, with many cross country initiatives. Everyone needs to play their part.

39. Many vulnerable people can't discern the content of this material from fact. A programme of digital resilience is needed and Baroness Shields suggested bringing this into the UKCCIS forum.

40. There have been great developments – for instance, proactive work undertaken with industry as part of the EU counter terrorism working group.

41. Discussion followed and these points were raised:

- i. Julia Davidson mentioned that Europol, the European Cybercrime Centre (EC3), will make available funding next year for research into the pathways to radicalisation.
- ii. Dave Miles mentioned that FOSI has been active in this area for a while. For instance they led a workshop in Brussels in May. This is an interesting but challenging space – with a wide spectrum of content brought into frame. In the summer, FOSI convened an expert workshop with people who work on this at the front line. It is difficult to know what normative behaviour is. Participants are not just victims, but are very drawn to this content and seek

- it out. Evidence in this area is very thin. FOSI would be happy to share findings of that workshop
- iii. Baroness Shields noted that this work involves belonging, and reconnecting people with being British. Tolerance, and making people feel connected, is as important a tool as harder interventions. UKCCIS is unique as multi stakeholder organisation and multi-stakeholder working will be necessary for us to address this problem. We need to protect civil liberties, and our way of life.
 - iv. Karen Bradley noted that people often focus on Islamic extremism but there are many different forms of extremism, so we must talk about our shared values, not on the things that drive us apart.
 - v. There was a suggestion that UKCCIS set up a specific working group.
 - vi. Rishi Saha said that Facebook have looked at the effectiveness of counter narratives (see links on the Demos website from last October). We need to curb the appeal of such content - not simply remove it from the Internet. He would be happy to showcase some of this work at the next meeting. There is lots of practical work here – it not a theoretical discussion.
 - vii. Edward Timpson noted that this discussion was also relevant to schools – the Department for Education has done research with the Home Office looking at where kids have accessed extremist content at school, and then travelled to Syria.
 - viii. John Carr noted that historically this topic is outside anything people in this room have addressed. If there’s going to be a sub-group, we will need new people with the right expertise to be part of it.
 - ix. Karen Bradley noted that there may be parallels with the work of the Lucy Faithfull Foundation in diverting people away from harmful content. It will be important to consider whether similar methodology might be used in this field.
 - x. Rishi noted that there are some parallels with online CSE ‘grooming’ approaches, however CSE is clear-cut, whereas extremism is necessarily more contextual.

Action: Members to provide feedback to the Secretariat about the proposal to make extremism a part of UKCCIS work and/or setting up a working group. The question of whether to establish a working group will be considered at the next meeting.

Item 8 – Any Other Business

42. Will Gardner noted that Safer Internet Day is on 9th February.
43. Paul Cording suggested a review of the UKCCIS process for approving Associate Members, in order to provide a clearer criteria/framework for approvals.

Action: The approval process for applications presented at the 8th December

meeting was deferred. The Secretariat to inform applicants that their applications will be considered at the next meeting.

Action: The Secretariat to consider the existing process for approving applications for UKCCIS associate membership, and propose potential alternative approaches. The Board will be consulted on this at next Board meeting.

44. Claudio Pollock highlighted Ofcom's Children's Media Use and Attitudes research, published on 20th November, which offers a good evaluation of parental attitudes and effectiveness:

<http://stakeholders.ofcom.org.uk/market-data-research/other/research-publications/childrens/children-parents-nov-15/>).

Ofcom's upcoming fourth report on parental controls will draw on this research.