

# Migration Advisory Committee

Annual Report 2014/15

Migration Advisory Committee

November 2015



Migration Advisory Committee,  
3rd Floor, Seacole Building,  
2 Marsham Street,  
London,  
SW1P 4DF

[www.gov.uk/government/organisations/migration-advisory-committee](http://www.gov.uk/government/organisations/migration-advisory-committee)  
email: MAC@homeoffice.gsi.gov.uk

# **Migration Advisory Committee:**

## **Annual Report 2014/15**

**Migration Advisory Committee**

**November 2015**



# Contents

Foreword by Professor Sir David Metcalf CBE .....	1
The Migration Advisory Committee .....	3
Introduction .....	5
Terms of reference.....	5
Relationship with the Home Office .....	5
MAC meetings held during 2014-15.....	5
Appointments .....	5
Corporate partner engagement.....	5
The secretariat .....	6
MAC work plan.....	7
Work of the Migration Advisory Committee in 2014-15 .....	7
Migrants in low-skilled work: the growth of EU and non-EU labour in low-skilled jobs and its impact on the UK (reported July 2014) .....	7
Partial review of the shortage occupation lists for the UK and Scotland (reported February 2015).....	9
The economic impact of the Tier 1 (Entrepreneur) route (due to report in autumn 2015).....	12
Other work and publications .....	14
Budget and expenditure .....	15
Research programme .....	16
Appendix 1: Profiles of the Migration Advisory Committee .....	17
Chair .....	17
Professor Sir David Metcalf CBE .....	17
Members .....	17
Professor Alan Manning .....	17
Dr Martin Ruhs.....	17
Dr Jennifer C Smith .....	18
Professor Jonathan Wadsworth.....	18

Professor Jackline Wahba .....	19
Appendix 2: Migration Advisory Committee reports and publications (in reverse chronological order) .....	20
MAC Contact details .....	22

## **Foreword by Professor Sir David Metcalf CBE**

The reports we have completed this year have looked at issues of real concern. We reported on the impact of migrants in low-skilled work and on shortages in occupations in the health service and the digital technology sector. The Government paid close attention to these reports and has taken action which mirrors many of our recommendations.

Our examination of the impacts of migrants in low-skilled work found that the impact is mainly concentrated in localised areas. Within these areas the concern of local partners was often more about the impact on the migrant, specifically on exploitation of the migrant, than it was about the impact on wages or jobs or housing, for instance. We found increased and improved enforcement to be a key element in tackling these problems and in protecting all workers from exploitation and undercutting. We were pleased, therefore, to note the Prime Minister's announcement in May of the creation of a new enforcement agency.

We carried out a partial review of the shortage occupation list focussing on jobs in the health service, in digital technology and overhead linesworkers.

Following productive meetings with both the Home Secretary and the Cabinet Secretary, at which they were both very receptive to what the MAC can offer in terms of evidence gathering and analysis, and in the immediate aftermath of the election, the MAC has received a substantial commission in two parts to conduct a wide review of Tier 2. The main report will be produced by mid-December 2015.

We also recently completed a commission to look at the economic benefits of the Tier 1 (Entrepreneur) route, analogous to the report we produced last year on the Tier 1 (Investor) route. We look forward to producing reports on other commissions during this present year.

I have suggested to Home Office Ministers that the MAC should be given a longer term work plan setting out a number of commissions for it to consider. This would help the MAC plan its work and also help the MAC's partners prepare their evidence. A related point is that appointments to the Committee are taking an increasingly lengthy time to complete. Again, this does not help the Committee to best carry out its work.

We also said goodbye during the year to Dr Martin Ruhs who had served on the MAC since 2007 and had significant input into the MAC's work during his time on the Committee. By recompense, we welcome Professor Alan Manning to the MAC, who will add significantly to the MAC's knowledge.



Professor Sir David Metcalf CBE  
Chair, Migration Advisory Committee



## The Migration Advisory Committee

The Migration Advisory Committee (MAC) is a non-statutory, non-time limited, non-departmental public body (NDPB) which was established in 2007 and is funded by the Home Office. The MAC is comprised of economists and migration experts who are publicly appointed in line with guidance published by the Office of the Commissioner for Public Appointments, along with ex-officio representatives of the UK Commission for Employment and Skills and the Home Office.

### Chair



Professor Sir David  
Metcalf CBE  
(from August 2007)

### Members



Professor Alan  
Manning  
(from March 2015)



Dr Jennifer Smith  
(from November  
2012)



Dr Martin Ruhs  
(from December 2007  
to November 2014)



Professor Jonathan  
Wadsworth  
(from December  
2007)



Professor Jackline  
Wahba  
(from November  
2012)

### UK Commission for Employment and Skills representative



Lesley Giles

### Home Office representative



John Thompson



## **Introduction**

This is our third annual Report and:

- provides an overview of the Committee's work;
- confirms the MAC's Terms of Reference and membership; and
- gives a summary of the issues the Committee considered between April 2014 and March 2015.

## **Terms of reference**

The MAC is tasked with providing transparent, independent, evidence-based advice to Government. Its purpose is to deliver high-quality evidence-based reports and policy advice in accordance with the work plan set by the Government. In addition, the MAC is tasked with helping to ensure that Government policy and strategy in relation to migration and employment is based on the best possible evidence and analysis.

## **Relationship with the Home Office**

The MAC is an advisory non-departmental public body sponsored by the Home Office. Further information on the MAC's relationship with the Home Office is set out in its Framework Document, which is published on the MAC's website. The MAC's secretariat is comprised of Home Office civil servants who are operationally independent from the Home Office. Its corporate functions such as finance, IT and HR support are provided by the Home Office.

## **MAC meetings held during 2014-15**

Between 1 April 2014 and 31 March 2015 the MAC held 10 full Committee meetings. The minutes of all Committee meetings are published on the MAC website at <https://www.gov.uk/government/organisations/migration-advisory-committee/about/our-governance>.

## **Appointments**

Dr Martin Ruhs was first appointed to the MAC in 2007 and his latest term of office came to an end in November 2014. Following an open competition in accordance with guidance issued by the Office of the Commissioner for Public Appointments (OCPA), the Minister for Immigration appointed Professor Alan Manning to the MAC in March 2015.

## **Corporate partner engagement**

The MAC combines detailed analysis of national level data with in-depth knowledge of, and evidence from, employers and other partners involved in the UK labour market. A key feature of the MAC's work, therefore, is the development of full and effective engagement with a wide variety of partners from

within business, central and local government, sector skills councils, trade unions, academia and individual employers.

Partner engagement is actively pursued by the MAC through a number of different fora. A small, focussed panel comprising representatives from the Trade Union Congress, the Confederation of British Industry, British Chambers of Commerce and NHS Employers provides immediate reaction to the MAC's proposals and a sounding board for its ideas. The panel has not been called into action in recent times as a distinct body due to a lack of commissions to the MAC. But the MAC has had engagement with each of the panel members separately on a commission by commission basis.

A larger, more representative, corporate partner forum offers other groups the chance to interact directly with the MAC. This has a non-fixed membership, with all partners being invited to attend a forum in London each time the MAC is consulting on a specific issue. In addition, meetings for individual sectors such as engineering, health, education, social care, finance and IT and the creative sector are held when necessary. The MAC hosted five Open Forums during the year covered by this report.

The MAC also visits partners in their workplaces to see specific jobs in action and attends a number of regional and national fora across the UK as well as meetings with partners and representatives from a wide range of organisations. The Committee values engagement with partners from across the whole of the UK, while recognising that many bodies have headquarters or main offices in London. The MAC has had engagement with over 113 separate bodies during this reporting year. The MAC and its secretariat have undertaken visits to Scotland (twice), Boston, Derby, Kingston Upon Hull, Manchester, Needham Market, Peterborough, Southampton and Wisbech.

There has also been a demand internationally for the MAC to feed into international debates on migration. Members of the MAC attended conferences in Washington and Malaysia during the year.

## **The secretariat**

The MAC's small secretariat comprises representatives from different disciplines across the civil service and draws on experience of different government departments. Represented within the team are experts in the fields of economics, policy development, corporate partner engagement and administrative skills. All economists are members of the Government Economic Service (GES) and are recruited following GES rules and processes.

The secretariat's policy and administrative staff are all assessed against the professional skills for government standards and have been recruited from across Government. The secretariat supports the Committee and, more generally, helps to ensure that Government policy and strategy in relation to migration and employment is based on robust evidence and analysis.

The secretariat respects the MAC's independence at all times. It is responsible to the MAC and takes its lead from what the MAC wants it to do. However, the

secretariat also has a responsibility to ensure that the MAC is operating with due regard to all relevant legislation, rules and procedures and in full compliance with the expectations incumbent upon it as a public body.

39 members of the secretariat have worked on the MAC's published reports over the course of the MAC's existence. As with any organisation, there is a managed throughput of staff with the average number of personnel at any one time numbering between 10 and 12. The secretariat also annually employs a summer intern economist.

The secretariat has been slightly reconfigured to reflect a rebalancing in terms of emphasis on increased analysis and research. This is to reflect a shift to heightened use of analysis given the nature of the commissions the MAC has received. Joint Heads of the Research and Analysis Team have been recruited along with a new team of assistant economists following the normal process of annual rotation for this grade in the Civil Service. There has also been a reconfiguring of the Policy Team to reflect the fact that there are now well-established procedures in place to deliver effective engagement on behalf of the MAC and also provision of finance and governance services to the Committee.

## **MAC work plan**

During 2014-15 the MAC experienced considerable difficulty in securing from Government either a work plan or a regular stream of commissions.

This in part explains the underspend in the MAC's budget (by £99,387 or more than 13 per cent of the overall annual budget), especially as the MAC's external research programme is largely steered by the Government commissions the MAC receives. At the same time, the MAC was, in line with the rest of the Home Office, asked to contribute to in-year savings.

For 2015-16, the MAC is keen to ensure that problems in securing a work plan are not repeated and that it is given a clear programme of work as soon as is practically possible after the May 2015 General Election. With this in mind, the Government may wish to set out a multi-year work programme for the MAC over, say, two or three years, though the MAC fully recognises the need to retain some capacity and flexibility to allow more pressing commissions to be taken forward at shorter notice.

The work the MAC was asked to do during this reporting period is detailed in the next section.

## **Work of the Migration Advisory Committee in 2014-15**

### **Migrants in low-skilled work: the growth of EU and non-EU labour in low-skilled jobs and its impact on the UK (reported July 2014)**

In July 2014, the MAC published a report on migrants in low-skilled work. This was in response to a commission from the government asking that the MAC:

*“consider the labour market, economic and social impacts on the UK and specifically on British workers, drawing on and updating earlier work in this area. In particular, the MAC is asked to research the growth of migrant labour, distinguishing where possible between EEA and non-EEA migrants, in low skilled sectors of the UK economy and the factors driving this.*

*In doing this, the research should address:*

- (i) The extent to which, and the reasons why, employers actively choose to recruit migrant workers and through which channels.*
- (ii) Why these migrant workers are attracted to coming to work in the UK, and how the UK compares with other countries in this context.*
- (iii) The extent to which migrant labour fills gaps in the UK domestic labour supply for low-skilled work and whether the work they find is a match for the skills they bring.*
- (iv) Whether there are structural or cultural issues which inhibit the recruitment of UK-born workers, including issues such as motivations and attitudes to work. Consideration should also be given to the interaction of factors including skills, housing, education provision, the benefits system and the labour market regulation, with a view to making recommendations as to possible actions here.”*

The MAC took evidence in relation to this commission from its stakeholder panel and representatives from the skills sector, local authorities, trade unions, government departments, employers and other bodies. The Committee identified a number of local authorities to use as focus areas to explore in greater depth the impact of migrant workers in low-skilled work and visited Boston, Kingston upon Hull, Newham, Peterborough, Southampton and Wisbech. The MAC also visited Scotland and met with representatives from the Scottish Government, the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities, an employer and an immigration adviser. The MAC used these visits to gather local information about the impact of migration on areas such as economic development, education, housing, public service provision, recruitment agencies, job centres, and employers.

The MAC received 66 written submissions of evidence and commissioned a number of pieces of research. The Committee held a workshop involving, among others, leading academics in the field of education, training and labour markets, to present to them the emerging findings from this research and discussed with them the implications for this report. The research has also been published and is available on the MAC website.

Overall, the MAC found that migrant workers over the last 20 years have not had a major impact on the pay of British workers, on UK employment, the wider UK economy, or areas such as housing, healthcare, crime, education and welfare benefits. But migrants in low-skilled jobs have had a much greater impact at a local level as most are concentrated in a relatively small number of areas across the UK.

The MAC found the arrival of one million migrants in low-skilled jobs during the last 10 years has left local authorities struggling to cope with rapid population change and identified a number of themes that the government should take account of in developing future policy. These concerned the need for increased enforcement of labour market regulations, improved skills for young British people, more assistance for local areas affected by immigration and careful planning for any future enlargement of the European Union.

The Prime Minister announced in his speech in May 2015 reforms to immigration and labour market rules to reduce demand for skilled workers and end exploitation. These include creating 3 million more apprenticeships and a new enforcement agency to crack down on the worst cases of exploitation.

### **Partial review of the shortage occupation lists for the UK and Scotland (reported February 2015)**

The Minister for Immigration asked the MAC to conduct a partial review of a small list of occupations and job titles on the shortage occupation list.

The Government's commission asked the MAC to consider the following:

*"Following the MAC's comprehensive review of the SOL, published in February 2013, the Government has been made aware of a small number of occupations where there may be a case for inclusion on or removal from the SOL. These occupations are:*

- *graduate occupations within the health sector including consultant roles, nurses and training grades;*
- *graduate occupations in the digital technology sector; and*
- *linesworkers in the energy industry.*

*The MAC is asked to review the above occupations to determine whether there is a shortage of labour in the occupation, or in relation to specific jobs within that occupation, that it would be sensible to fill using labour from outside the EEA, and which therefore merits inclusion on the SOL for the UK or the additional SOL for Scotland.*

*In doing so, the MAC is asked to have regard to the Government's policy that Tier 2 is now reserved for occupations skilled to at least NQF level 6 and in general the SOL should be aligned with that policy.*

*If there are further occupations (or job titles) where the MAC considers the labour market has changed since 2013, such that those roles now merit inclusion on or removal from the SOL, the Government would welcome the MAC's advice on those occupations also."*

The MAC published a call for evidence on 29 September 2014 and closed it on 5 December 2014. The call set out the Government's commission and identified those sub-questions on which the MAC wished to receive corporate partners'

views. Partners were asked for evidence relevant to the MAC's skilled, shortage and sensible criteria for any occupation or job title they wished to see included on the shortage occupation list. The MAC asked partners to provide information on:

- typical earnings, or ranges of earnings, in the job title;
- the proportion of individuals qualified at various levels (particularly at NQF6+);
- minimum qualifications required (either informally or on a regulatory basis) to be a skilled practitioner in a particular job title;
- any required or compulsory level or duration of on the job training or experience required to become a skilled practitioner;
- any required innate ability, of a level or rarity which exceeds such requirements in a typical NQF6+ job title; and
- opinion on the applicability of the MAC's skilled indicators to particular job titles.

The MAC also asked for evidence of labour shortages in support of all proposals for occupations and job titles to be included on the recommended shortage occupation list.

Partners were asked to provide evidence on whether it is sensible to employ migrants from outside the European Economic Area (EEA) as opposed to whatever alternative courses of action there may be. The MAC asked to be given information on:

- the use of alternatives to non-EEA migrant labour, including investment in technology and machinery, and efforts to recruit from within the EEA;
- current activity to train and up-skill the resident labour force, including timings, projected volumes of those who will exit such schemes and enter the occupation, and estimates of how this is likely to help meet demand;
- whether migrants are likely to take jobs that would otherwise have been filled by resident workers or, conversely, whether employment of migrants will help to create employment conditions that allow the additional recruitment of resident workers; and
- suggested additional sensible indicators for particular occupations or job titles, with an explanation of their relevance.

In addition, the MAC sought information on minimum pay thresholds for those job titles skilled at NQF6+, but which fell within occupations not skilled to this level, such as:

- How different is the pay of the job title from the parent occupation?

- What are the levels of pay within this job title for:
  - new entrants; and
  - experienced workers?

During October and November 2014, the MAC hosted and attended a number of meetings with partners to discuss this commission. Three Open Forum events were held with representatives from each of the three sectors being looked at, and the MAC and its secretariat attended meetings in London, Manchester, and Scotland and met with employers, trade unions, representative bodies and government departments. In total, representatives from over 50 different organisations were engaged with directly and 109 written submissions of evidence were received from organisations and individuals.

In relation to jobs in the health sector, the MAC recommended a number of additions to and deletions from the shortage list. In particular, although the occupation of paramedic was not previously skilled to level NQF6 level, the introduction by Health Education England of a Bachelor of Science degree qualification for paramedics along with a requirement that new entrants to this occupation hold this qualification, led the MAC to conclude that paramedics now meet the NQF6 and above skill threshold, and to recommend that this occupation be added to the list of NQF6 occupations for the purposes of the Points Based System. Further, the MAC considered that, on balance, there was sufficient evidence of a national shortage of paramedics and that current efforts to increase the supply are unlikely to be fully effective at filling this shortage in the short-term. Therefore, the MAC recommended adding paramedic to the shortage occupation list while the transition to graduate recruits runs its course.

Among the other health jobs that the MAC considered were nurses and General Practitioners (GPs). Although the MAC received evidence from a number of partners identifying shortages in nursing jobs, particularly adult nurses, the evidence on behalf of the Department of Health did not recommend adding adult nurses to the shortage occupation list. The MAC put most weight on the view that more should be done within existing mechanisms to fill nursing vacancies. In relation to GPs, the MAC received evidence of a relatively large estimated annual shortage of GPs, this represented only a small percentage of the total GP workforce. The evidence on behalf of the Department of Health asked that GPs be added to the shortage list but the MAC did not see any evidence suggesting that there is a shortage of medical students who could continue into general practice. Therefore, the MAC considered that any shortage of GPs could potentially be overcome by changing the incentive structure of GPs compared with other medical roles, in order to encourage more take up on GP training programmes. Overall, the MAC considered that more should be done to recruit GPs from within existing routes. The MAC, therefore, did not recommend adding either adult nurses or GPs to the shortage occupation list.

In relation to other health jobs, the MAC recommended adding jobs including clinical radiology consultants, and non-consultant, non-training roles in paediatrics. Jobs recommended for removal from the list included haematology consultants, non-consultant non-training roles in anaesthetics, and therapeutic

radiographers. Jobs recommended for retention on the list included emergency medicine consultants, nuclear medicine scientists, and sonographers. Health sector jobs that were rejected for inclusion on the list included geriatric medicine consultants and sleep physiologists.

In relation to digital technology occupations, the MAC had excellent engagement with a number of employers, incubators, accelerators and venture capitalists from across the sector. The MAC was given a long list of job titles to consider for inclusion on the shortage list containing quite specific roles. The MAC was concerned about the length of time these jobs would remain in shortage on the basis that the digital technology area is fast moving and demand for skills can change at very short notice. The MAC's engagement with employers and other partners helped identify broader digital technology roles that encompassed many of the smaller roles nominated by employers. The roles that the MAC recommended for inclusion on the list were:

- Product manager
- Data scientist
- Senior developer
- Cyber security specialist

The MAC recommended that the job titles identified should only be in relation to persons with a minimum of five years' relevant experience and who have demonstrable experience of having led a team with regard to including them on the shortage list. The MAC also suggested that the Government restrict the category of sponsor able to use this route to start-up and scale-up firms in the digital technology sector and identified some ways in which the Government could do this.

The MAC was also asked to look at the occupation of overhead linesworker. This had previously been recommended for removal from the shortage list in relation to those working on low voltage lines. The evidence this time round was that this distinction between those working on high and low voltage lines was unhelpful and clarification was provided in relation to pay rates and skill levels such that the MAC recommended that the whole of this occupation be included on the shortage list. The MAC also recommended a small number of changes to health occupations on the Scotland shortage list.

The government accepted all of the MAC's recommendations and made the relevant changes to the shortage occupation lists except for the digital technology sector where the government is considering the MAC's suggestions about restricting the category of sponsor.

### **The economic impact of the Tier 1 (Entrepreneur) route (due to report in autumn 2015)**

The commission to the MAC asks that the Committee consider the following question:

*“The MAC is asked to consider whether the existing design of the Tier 1 (Entrepreneur) route is appropriate to deliver significant economic benefits for the UK and in particular whether:*

- a) *the initial eligibility criterion of access to funds is a sufficient determinant of entrepreneurial ability and whether other criteria, for example, assessment of previous entrepreneurial activity and/or testing the purpose of the investment, should be applied;*
- b) *the existing eligibility and extension criteria are aligned sufficiently with entrepreneurial and early stage business life-cycles, including consideration of the role angel investors and crowd-funding can play;*
- c) *the route utilises international best practice. As part of this, the MAC is requested to consider route design and incentives to ensure competitiveness.”*

The MAC published a call for evidence in relation to this commission on 24 March 2015 with a request to receive evidence by 12 June 2015. The MAC sought evidence on issues including:

- what are the economic benefits of the Tier 1 (Entrepreneur) route, particularly for UK residents?
- Can these benefits be monetised?
- Are there more dynamic impacts that may be identified and captured?
- Do migrant entrepreneurs impose costs on the UK?
- How should migrants be incentivised to start up businesses in sectors offering greatest added value?
- How should migrant entrepreneurs be identified, targeted and admitted to the UK? Should entry be limited to particular sectors?
- Should the permitted sources of funding be broadened?
- What criteria should be used for visa extension and settlement?
- Is the Tier 1 (Entrepreneur) route operating as originally intended?
- Are the rules and enforcement adequate to minimise the potential for abuse of this route?
- Which countries have similar routes, how do these work and how have these evolved over time?
- Who are the migrant entrepreneurs and what is their entrepreneurial experience?
- Why did they choose the UK and what visa route did they follow?

- What was the source and scale of their funding and in which sector did they establish their business?
- How should the government ensure the route is being monitored properly and how, and when, should the entrepreneur be deemed to be successful?
- With typically high rates of new business failure, how should the route take this into account?

The MAC held two Open Forum events to allow partners to present evidence to the Committee and to seek clarification on the questions. Meetings and roundtables with other government departments, Tier 1 entrepreneurs, accelerator programmes, financial institutions, law firms and interest groups were also held.

The MAC will report to the Government by the end of September 2015.

## **Other work and publications**

As well as overseeing and supervising in-house research and analysis by members of the Secretariat, the MAC also spent time during the reporting year preparing for prospective commissions from the Government.

### (i) International engagement

Committee members have also advised other governments on the MAC and its approach to providing evidence-based advice on migration policy. Members have met with and advised representatives from governments in Malaysia, Mexico and South Africa under the auspices of the World Bank.

### (ii) Externally-commissioned research

Other items published by the MAC were two studies carried out under a commission from the MAC as part of its programme of independent research:

- Tommaso Frattini, formerly of UCL and now Assistant Professor at the Department of Economics at the University of Milan, authored a report on the impact of migration on UK consumer prices which analysed the effect of immigration on prices of goods and services in the UK between 1997 and 2012.
- The Warwick Institute for Employment Research produced a report looking at determinants of the composition of the workforce in low skilled sectors of the UK economy, in particular the social care and retail sectors. This looked at developing further understanding of the supply and demand side factors that affect the composition of the low-skilled labour market. Both of these reports were commissioned as part of the MAC's work looking into migrants in low-skilled work.

### (iii) Triennial review of the Migration Advisory Committee

Also published in 2014, albeit by the Home Office rather than the MAC, was a report on a review of the MAC carried out under the auspices of the government's triennial review programme. This followed the Guidance on Reviews of Non-departmental Public Bodies published by the Cabinet Office. Conversations were held with representatives of a range of companies, trade organisations and government departments with an interest in the MAC's work and/or affected by its outputs. The Chair of the MAC and the Head of the MAC Secretariat were interviewed and the MAC's published output and press coverage examined.

The review found that the function performed by the MAC needed to continue and that an NDPB is the most appropriate form in which it can carry out its role effectively. The governance arrangements were found to be in line with good corporate governance principles although there were some shortcomings in this respect which had been addressed through action by the Home Office to put in place a Framework Document for the MAC's work.

## Budget and expenditure

The MAC's 2014-15 budget covered the secretariat administrative costs for 11 staffing posts, Committee members' fees (per diem rates and travel costs) and external research. The budget is set by the Home Office and is managed by the MAC secretariat.

The overall MAC budget for 2014-15 was £740,000. Of this £629,000 was pay-related (secretariat and Chair salaries, plus Committee member fees) and £111,000 was non-pay (Table 1).

An amount of £56,500 was set aside for Committee members' fees, of which approximately £42,000 was for the Chair, who is paid for two days' work per week. MAC members are expected to work two days a month on MAC business at a rate of £275 per day.

The majority of the non-pay budget (£80,000) was allocated to the MAC's research programme of which only £41,570 was spent. The research project commissioned by the MAC and its cost is provided in the discussion below about the MAC's research programme. However, it is important to state again that the MAC's external research programme is largely determined by the commissions it receives from the Government. Therefore, the underspend in this budget was wholly due to the difficulty the MAC had in securing from Government either a work plan or a regular stream of commissions.

**Table 1: 2014-15 Budget and Expenditure**

	Budget [£]	Expenditure [£]	Difference [£]
<b>Pay</b>			
Secretariat salaries	572,500	520,288	52,212
Chair salary	42,000	42,000	-
Committee members' fees	14,500	13,036	1,464
<b>Non-pay</b>			
Travel and subsistence	5,000	7,034	(2,034)
Research	80,000	41,570	38,430
Staff training	6,500	4,542	1,958
Other office costs	19,500	12,143	7,357
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>740,000</b>	<b>640,613</b>	<b>99,387</b>

## Research programme

The MAC commissions research from external consultancies or academics on an annual basis. Research is procured according to Home Office Science guidelines and tenders are evaluated by a panel of labour market experts and economists. The research we commission must meet at least one of the following two objectives:

- **Relevance to Committee work:** Does the research have relevance to existing commissions or anticipated commissions?
- **Improving the relevant knowledge base:** Would research fill gaps in the literature or obtain data or information that would not otherwise be available in relation to material that is of relevance to the Committee's work?

During 2014-15 the MAC commissioned one external research project covering a fee value of £41,570:

- **Evaluation of existing migration forecasting methods and models** (to be published in autumn 2015). This project was awarded to Southampton University. The aim of the research is to examine and assess the various analytical approaches to modelling migration flows and to evaluate their explanatory power in explaining past and potentially future migration flows.

## **Appendix 1: Profiles of the Migration Advisory Committee**

### **Chair**

#### **Professor Sir David Metcalf CBE**

Professor Sir David Metcalf is Emeritus Professor at the Centre for Economic Performance at the London School of Economics and has been a visiting professor at Princeton University and the Australian National University.

He has been Chair of the Migration Advisory Committee (MAC) since its establishment in 2007. During this time MAC has produced twenty three major reports for the Government. These analyse, for example, the impact of immigration, limits on skilled worker immigration and labour shortages.

Sir David was a member of the Low Pay Commission (LPC) from its formation in 1997 until 2007. The LPC recommends the level of the national minimum wage to Government. He was a member of the Senior Salaries Review Body which recommends pay for judges, top military personnel, senior civil servants, and senior NHS managers, from 2009 – 2015.

He was awarded the CBE in the 2008 New Year Honours list and a Knighthood in the 2013 Birthday Honours for services to Immigration.

<i>Appointed</i>	<i>August 2007 to August 2010</i>
<i>Reappointed</i>	<i>August 2010 to August 2013</i>
<i>Reappointed</i>	<i>August 2013 to August 2016</i>

### **Members**

#### **Professor Alan Manning**

Alan Manning is professor of economics at the London School of Economics and is director of the Centre for Economic Performance's research programme on Community. From 2009 to 2012 he was Head of the Economics department at LSE and from 2004 to 2011 he was a member of the NHS Pay Review Body. His expertise is on labour markets, including but not confined to the impact of migration.

<i>Appointed</i>	<i>March 2015 to March 2018</i>
------------------	---------------------------------

#### **Dr Martin Ruhs**

Martin Ruhs is University Lecturer in Political Economy at Oxford University, where he is also Director of Studies in Economics at the Department for Continuing Education; Senior Research Fellow at the Centre on Migration, Policy and Society (COMPAS); and a Fellow of Kellogg College. Martin's research focuses on the economics and politics of international labour

migration, with a strong international comparative dimension. Publications include 'The Price of Rights. Regulating International Labor Migration' (Princeton University Press, Aug 2013) and 'Who Needs Migrant Workers? Labour Shortages, Immigration and Public Policy' (co-edited with Bridget Anderson, Oxford University Press, 2010 and 2012).

Martin has provided policy analysis and advice for various national governments and international institutions including the International Labour Organisation (ILO), the International Organisation for Migration (IOM), the Global Commission on International Migration (GCIM), the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), the European Commission and the Swedish Presidency of the European Union. In 2008-09, he was Specialist Adviser to an inquiry by the Economic Affairs Committee of the House of Lords into the economic impacts of migration. Martin is a regular commentator on migration issues in the media.

<i>Appointed</i>	<i>December 2007 to November 2010</i>
<i>Reappointed</i>	<i>December 2010 to November 2013</i>
<i>Reappointed</i>	<i>December 2013 to November 2014</i>

Dr Jennifer C Smith

Dr Jennifer C Smith is Associate Professor in the Economics Department at Warwick University and Associate Researcher at the Centre for Competitive Advantage in the Global Economy (CAGE). Her research focuses on UK labour market dynamics. Her past work has looked at wage setting, local labour markets, pay comparisons, job satisfaction, nominal and real wage rigidity, unions, unemployment, and labour market mismatch. Jennifer is a Regular Academic Visitor at the Bank of England, having previously acted as Academic Consultant to the Bank on wage rigidity. Before moving to Warwick University, Jennifer worked for 5 years as a Bank of England economist, having previously lectured at Queen's University, Canada, and studied at the Universities of Oxford and Cambridge.

*Appointed November 2012 to November 2015*

## **Professor Jonathan Wadsworth**

Professor Jonathan Wadsworth of the Economics Department at Royal Holloway College, University of London has accumulated over 20 years' experience of academic-related work on labour market issues after studying first at the University of Hull and then at the London School of Economics.

His main area of interest is applied labour economics, focusing on issues of immigration, inequality, unemployment compensation schemes, job search, labour mobility, job tenure, wages, unions, health, economic inactivity and labour markets in Eastern Europe.

Professor Wadsworth co-developed the concept of workless households and its measurement and is the co-editor of The State of Working Britain volumes, a

publication aimed at academics and policy makers, which highlights and comments on significant developments in the labour market.

<i>Appointed</i>	<i>November 2007 to November 2010</i>
<i>Reappointed</i>	<i>November 2010 to November 2013</i>
<i>Reappointed</i>	<i>November 2013 to November 2014</i>
<i>Reappointed</i>	<i>November 2014 to November 2015</i>

## **Professor Jackline Wahba**

Jackline Wahba is Professor of Economics at the University of Southampton. She has vast experience of academic-related work on international migration and labour market issues. She leads the migration research in the ESRC Centre for Population Change at the University of Southampton. Her main areas of research are in applied labour economics and international migration in particular. Her work on return migration was one of the first to highlight the positive impact of temporary migration on entrepreneurship in the home country. She has wide experience in the impact of international migration, the determinants of return migration and the labour market experience of immigrants in host countries.

She has advised various national governments and international organisations including the World Bank, the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), the International Labour Organisation (ILO), the International Organisation for Migration (IOM), the European Training Foundation (ETF) and the European Commission (EC).

*Appointed November 2012 to November 2015*

## **Appendix 2: Migration Advisory Committee reports and publications (in reverse chronological order)**

All our reports are published on the MAC's website and can be accessed at <https://www.gov.uk/government/organisations/migration-advisory-committee>

Partial review of the shortage occupation lists for the UK and Scotland (February 2015) Available [here](#)

Migrants in low-skilled work: the growth of EU and non-EU labour in low-skilled jobs and its impact on the UK - full report (July 2014) Available [here](#)

Migrants in low-skilled work: the growth of EU and non-EU labour in low-skilled jobs and its impact on the UK - summary report (July 2014) Available [here](#)

Tier 1 (Investors) route: Investment thresholds and economic benefits (February 2014) Available [here](#)

Migrant Seasonal Workers. The impact on the horticulture and food processing sectors of closing the Seasonal Agricultural Workers Scheme and the Sectors Based Scheme (May 2013) Available [here](#).

Full review of the recommended shortage occupation lists for the UK and Scotland, a sunset clause and the creative occupations (February 2013) Available [here](#)

Analysis of the Points Based System – List of occupations skilled at NQF level 6 and above and review of the Tier 2 codes of practice (October 2012) Available [here](#)

Limits on Migration – Limit on Tier 2 (General) for 2012-13 and associated policies (28 February 2012) Available [here](#)

Analysis of the Impacts of Migration (January 2012) Available [here](#).

Review of the minimum income requirement for sponsorship under the family migration route (November 2011) Available [here](#)

Review of the transitional restrictions on access of Bulgarian and Romanian nationals to the UK labour market (November 2011) Available [here](#)

Analysis of the Points Based System: Settlement rights of migrants in Tier 1 and Tier 2 (November 2011) Available [here](#)

Fourth review of the recommended shortage occupation lists for the UK and Scotland (September 2011) Available [here](#)

Analysis of the points-based system – revised UK shortage occupation list for Tier 2 comprising jobs skilled to NQF level 4 and above (February 2011) Available [here](#)

Report on analysis of the points-based system – list of occupations skilled to NQF level 4 and above for Tier 2 (February 2011) Available [here](#).

Limits on Tier 1 and Tier 2 for 2011/12 and supporting policies (November 2010) Available [here](#)

Analysis of the Points Based System: London Weighting (August 2010) Available [here](#)

Third review of recommended shortage occupation lists for the UK and Scotland (March 2010) Available [here](#)

Skilled, shortage, sensible: Review of the Methodology (March 2010) Available [here](#)

Second review of recommended shortage occupation lists for the UK and Scotland (October 2009) Available [here](#)

Analysis of Tier 2 and dependants under the Points-Based System (August 2009) Available [here](#)

Analysis of Tier 1 under the Points-Based System (December 2009) Available [here](#)

Review of transitional measures for A8 nationals (April 2009) Available [here](#).

The labour market impact of relaxing restrictions on employment of A2 nationals (December 2008) Available [here](#)

First recommended shortage occupation lists for the United Kingdom and Scotland (September 2008) Available [here](#)

Identifying skilled occupations where migration can sensibly help to fill labour shortages (February 2008) Available [here](#)

## **MAC Contact details**

Any enquires about this Annual Report or any aspect of the MAC's work should be addressed to:

Migration Advisory Committee Secretariat  
3rd Floor, Seacole Building  
2 Marsham Street  
London SW1P 4DF

Tel: 020 7035 1764  
Email: [MAC@homeoffice.gsi.gov.uk](mailto:MAC@homeoffice.gsi.gov.uk)





Migration Advisory Committee Report  
November 2015  
<https://www.gov.uk/government/organisations/migration-advisory-committee>

© Crown copyright.  
ISBN: 978-1-911194-08-8