

UKCCIS Executive Board
17th June, 14:00-16:00
DCMS
Chair: Ed Vaizey, MP

Attendees:

Chair, Ed Vaizey MP

Minister for Culture, Communications and the Creative Industries

Damian Green MP	Minister for Policing and Criminal Justice
Julian Ashworth	BT
Jonathan Baggeley	CEOP
Carolyn Bunting	Internet Matters
Daniel Butler	Virgin Media
John Carr	CHIS
David Cooke	BBFC
Naomi Gummer	Google
Will Gardner	Safer Internet Centre
Anne Heal	Openreach
Nicola Hodson	Microsoft
Adam Kinsley	BskyB
Pete Johnson	ATVOD
Aleyne Johnson	Samsung
Peter Liver	NSPCC
Prof Sonia Livingstone,	London School of Economics
Dave Miles	FOSI
Rachel O'Connell	Age verification project lead
Tink Palmer	Marie Collins Foundation
Claudio Pollack	Ofcom
David Rennie	Cabinet Office
Paddy Toyne Sewell	Vodafone
Vicki Shotbolt	Parentzone
Jo Twist	UKIE
Andrew Uden	Tesco
Iain Wood	TalkTalk

Nb. the Minister had to leave the meeting for a short while to attend a vote in Parliament, Damian Green stood in as Chair in his absence.

Observers:

Anna Lucas	Ofcom
Claire Thwaites	Apple
Anne Steele	Dept Of Health
Sophie Bolsover	Claire Perry MP's Office
James Freeland	Claire Perry MP's Office
Isabel Evans	PS/Edward Timpson
Laura Humes	PS/Edward Timpson
Natalie Brazil	PS/Damian Green

Item 1 – Welcome, introductions, apologies and declaring interests

1. The Chair opened the meeting, welcomed new Executive Board members and thanked previous members for their involvement. New members are:
 - Daniel Butler – Virgin Media (replacing Tony Pilch)
2. The Chair passed on apologies on behalf of: Simon Milner, Facebook and Susie Hargreaves, IWF. Edward Timpson, Minister for Children and Families, had also been detained by business in the House. He also reminded members to declare interests, where appropriate, in advance of discussion on agenda items and reminded Executive Board members of their responsibilities to represent their wider sectors. Continuing the Chair also announced a new UKCCIS Council member;
 - New Associate Member: Mr Jon Tarrant, Dept for Education, Sport and Culture, States of Jersey

Item 2 – First theme - Effective Controls

Common Media Standards – Claudio Pollock

3. Ofcom has begun work to develop a common framework for media standards as set out in last year's Connectivity, Content and Consumers paper. Audiences continue to wish for certain fundamental protections and the safeguarding of critical freedoms. Protection of children should be the starting point of any debate about protections across media. Future protection frameworks should include a mix of regulation, self-regulation and self-imposed standards and measures that empower people to manage their and their families' access to media. Ofcom is planning to carry out research and analysis and develop options for Government.
4. The Chair thanked Claudio and invited the Board to feedback their thoughts and considerations. The following points were made:
 - This work needs to be future proofed to ensure the systems work in a changing landscape. Consider how technology can adapt, e.g. cyberbullying.
 - Regulation vs voluntary action - how would enforcement work?
 - Which media platforms will be included, e.g. games? Claudio confirmed that the starting point was TV, but will think about other platforms/anything used to access content whether in the home or on the move.
 - In order to make progress, we must say what we think are acceptable standards and technology should conform to these, rather than the other way around.
 - What do consumers want? Consumers don't always know what is available and need to be educated. People are unclear about where services start and end. Drawing lines for where common standards should apply would be welcome.
 - Pragmatism is needed about what could be achieved, but at the start of this process you shouldn't rule a type of content out. Identify what's achievable after identifying the gap. UKCCIS could be a good vehicle for moving the debate on, rather than legislation.
 - In terms of timescales, the review will come back at the end the year and there will be seminars and discussions ahead of this – Ofcom will ask UKCCIS to feed into the review and young people will be involved.
 - Clarity on wording - terms like minimum standards, community standards and common standards are used interchangeably in this discussion, but these actually mean different things.

Over-blocking - Dave Miles

5. Dave Miles, Chair of the over blocking working group gave an update on the work of the group which is looking at the issue of potential over blocking by filters being deployed by the UK's four leading ISPs. He confirmed that a centralised process will be in place by the end of July at the latest (one of the group's key deliverables). The over blocking working groups terms of reference are continuing to be refined.
6. The NSPCC commissioned a survey of children's attitudes to filters. This will be shared with over blocking working group members at the next meeting on 11 July. We will also discuss whether more detailed research is required, particularly amongst young people. Ofcom are already including questions on over blocking to parents in their September report.
7. Discussion followed and the following points were made:
 - No one else in Europe is using the same whole home filter model as the UK. However, there is great interest in the UK filtering approach, including over blocking and Internet Matters. A number of European countries are taking a keen interest.
 - In Germany any form of network-level home filtering is for the most part culturally unacceptable. They already have a Statutory Commission established by treaty that decides if legal material is inappropriate and if so, it is removed (e.g. pro-anorexia sites).
 - The over blocking reporting process will be accessed via Internet Matters and web site owners can use this single location to reach BT, BskyB, TalkTalk and Virgin Media. Details about how it will be publicised will be discussed on 11th July.
 - Members of the public are already able to report when they think a website has been unfairly blocked - when they attempt to access a blocked site, a splash page comes up explaining that it has been blocked and there is a link allowing the user to report. This is currently in place with all four ISPs.

Age Verification – David Rennie, IDAP

8. David spoke about the work of Identity Assurance Programme (IDAP) for citizens to create a 'digital identity' as part of the 'digital by default' agenda led by the Government Digital Service. Cabinet Office has contracts in place with a number of identity providers, e.g. the Post Office, Verizon, Experian. Individuals can choose an organisation they trust and prove their identity to a government standard. This can then be used to access government services and, potentially in the long-term, private sector services. Government has aggregated demand across central Government public sector to create the initial market for the private sector services. There are many challenges in the arena of digital identity. IDAP is working with the Identity Providers and the wider industry to address them collaboratively as the benefits of a trust infrastructure for digital transactions apply to both the public and private sector
9. Cabinet Office is an Open Identity Exchange (OIX) member, along with companies such as Google and Microsoft. Mobile phones could be used as part of an authentication method. This has been an alpha project on this subject and it is hoped it will be developed into a beta service soon.

Age Verification – Rachel O'Connell, UKCCIS working group lead

10. Rachel then spoke about the age verification working group and her recent briefing paper, *Age Verification: New Possibilities*. E-ID provides a method to verify age and is starting to be introduced across Europe. There is an opportunity to revisit age verification – it is a big commercial opportunity and could provide an opportunity for big savings. Age is an attribute of ID – if you've proven your age with your bank, or your mobile phone company for instance, you should be able to use this so you only have to verify your age once. Rachel recommended fostering children's participation without stifling innovation.
11. Rachel continued that there is a strong assumption that mobile, and mobile payments will drive demand for E-ID. Vocalink for example, is introducing an app that will check age. Rachel recommended that banks are asked to start collecting data on the age of those 17 and under with bank cards - when a user makes a card payment, as well as checking that the money is available in their account, the system should also check the user's age is appropriate to purchase the product or service. Rachel felt that this would also be a priority for retail – as age verification is a fundamental need for development of online lockers, and the potential for federated age verification token would cut costs phenomenally.
12. Finally Rachel recommended that UKCCIS/DCMS should take a leadership role with response to age verification and it should be part of the future UKCCIS strategy. There is a community of interest of businesses that require age verification, such as banks, mobile companies, ID providers, skills funding agency and DCMS should consider working with them on a trial.
13. Discussion followed and the following points were made:

- There's a difference between proving you are under or over 18 years old. Potential for problems with paedophiles and misuse of the data of under-18 year olds.
- No central evidence base, but rather pseudo-anonymous age-verification. You can build privacy into systems.
- Under the 2005 Gambling Act, it became a legal requirement for online gambling sites to validate ID of every user. Since this came in we've not heard of any child getting around this process. Gambling sites didn't choose to do this, it's because the law required them to. There's already a solution to this problem in place, it's not a question of technology. For US companies there is no incentive for them to join in. In US law, provided you don't know that a user is below age, you don't have to act and the EU is adopting the same law – it provides a disincentive.
- IDAP are at capacity and much work has already been done, therefore they suggest a group focused on children and young people should be overseen by UKCCIS/DCMS.

Action Point 1:

UKCCIS Secretariat to consider recommendations from the Age Verification Working Group

Action Point 2:

DCMS officials to provide note to Ed Vaizey on EU age verification proposals

ATVOD Research – Pete Johnson

14. Pete Johnson updated the Board on the work of ATVOD in preventing under 18s accessing hard-core pornography via the internet. He also outlined the research paper '*For Adults Only? Underage access to online porn*' published in March. The methodology used is similar to how TV figures are collected – software automatically records actual use, although tablets and smartphones weren't included. Key findings included: in Dec 2013 473,000 UK children and young people aged 6 – 17 visited an adult website from a laptop or PC; one in twenty UK visitors to an adult website from a PC or laptop was underage; and 23 of the top 25 adult websites visited by UK internet users provide instant, free and unrestricted access to hard-core pornographic videos and still images.
15. ATVOD supports existing initiatives to improve take up of parental controls and the legislation to remove any doubt that material that would be rated R18 by the British Board of Film Classification must be put behind access controls on regulated UK-based services. There is work to be done at an EU and international level. The payments industry have made clear that they would prevent UK payments to foreign websites which allow children to view hard-core porn if it was clear that such websites were operating in breach of UK law.
16. Discussion followed and the following points were made:
 - ATVOD doesn't have figures of users' spend on porn sites.
 - No legislation announced to support proposal to prevent payments to sites that provide adult content without age verification, although Government keeps legislation under review.

Item 3 - Second Theme: Education and Awareness

EU Kids Online – Sonia Livingstone

17. Sonia Livingstone updated the Board on two briefing papers that examine child online safety across Europe: *Policy Influences and Country Clusters* and *New Evidence, New Challenges*. Research identified that: there has been a sharp rise in the number of young people using handheld devices to access the internet; use of social networks is dropping, especially for girls and 11-12 year olds; the number of social contacts online is dropping and not all friend requests are accepted; the number of hate messages has increased from 13 – 23% but there has been a decrease in the number of sexual messages.
18. British parents are more restrictive than the EU average and children are getting safer, but this doesn't mean that the job is complete. Children are aware of the dangers - parents and awareness raisers should therefore treat children a bit more subtly. Britain is defined as 'protected by restrictions' - so children are protected but are perhaps missing out on the good opportunities that the internet can provide. UKCCIS is highlighted as a model for engagement around the world.
19. Discussion followed and the following points were made:
- Freedom to explore - the UK has been successful in developing a culture of concern and care. The next stage is to call for a shift, now that filters are in place, to say 'now you are safe, go out and explore the web'.
 - Funding for the research ends in October 2014, not clear what will happen after then. Funding is part of DG Connect.

Action Point 3:

DCMS officials (UKCCIS Secretariat) to update the Minister on future funding for EU Kids Online research and to work with Sonia Livingstone on securing funding post-October 2014

‘Internet Matters’ awareness campaign for parents - Carolyn Bunting

20. Carolyn Bunting updated the Board on the ‘Internet Matters’ awareness campaign for parents after a successful launch in May. She thanked Executive Board members for their support. The launch received a good media response with over 400 media mentions, including a piece in the Sunday Times, and up to 20 million people reached on day one. This was followed up by £1million worth of pre-booked media, including radio, digital and press coverage. ISPs were fantastic, and reached many homes with articles, emails, leaflets and ubiquitous logos on sales communications. The website has received 188,000 unique visitors, 13% of which are repeat visitors.

21. Discussion followed and the following points were made:

- Board members congratulated Carolyn on the work she had done.
- The campaign is a UKCCIS initiative, not just ISPs. All Board members should now pitch-in to provide content and ensure it is a success in the future.
- The Expert Advisory Panel will help set the strategic direction and the Editorial Board will continue to help with content development.

Action Point 4:

UKCCIS members to consider joining the editorial board of Internet Matters and contributing original content to the site.

Action Point 5:

UKCCIS Secretariat to work with ISPs to organise demonstrations of filters for Board members.

Item 4 - AOB and next steps

22. The next Executive Board meeting will take place on 9th September, Chaired by Edward Timpson. Potential agenda items include:

- Harmful, but not illegal extremist material.
- Ofsted to be invited to talk about what they are doing on e-safety in schools.
- EU net neutrality legislation.