4G/TV Co-existence Oversight Board Members Meeting Chair's report to Ministers and Ofcom   Meeting date: 18 June 2014

Attendees

David Hendon, Chair	Ian Dewhurst (DCMS)
Paul Rosbotham (Vodafone)	Sue Ramroop (DCMS)
Robin Vernon (O2)	
Inge Hansen (EE)	**Apologies**
Alan Boyle (BBC)	William Webb (Non-Executive)
Roger Darlington (Non-Executive)	Michelle Brownrigg (DUK)
Jane Humphreys (DCMS)	Peter Couch (Arqiva)
Ben Roome (DMSL)	Khalid Hayat (ITV)
Mark Caines (Ofcom)	Kim Chua (Channel 4)
Andrew Dumbreck (Technical Advisor)	Phil Sheppard (Three)

1. Executive Summary

1.1   The meeting held on Wednesday 18 June was not quorate due to conflicting appointments for some Board members. Therefore a Board Members' meeting was held rather than a Board meeting. The provisional decisions made at the meeting have since been ratified via correspondence.

1.2   The position on interference remains lower than expected with 1982 confirmed cases as of the end of May, excluding the 35 cases during the pilots.

1.3   There were minor failures in the trial KPI regime. For KPIA, there was a 99.29% pass against the target of 100% service restoration within 10 working days where a household is a primary DTT user. This was due to two breaches taking longer than 10 days to resolve. The Board members agreed with at800 that the first case was not strictly within the remit of the KPI measure as the original 4G diagnosis was overturned. For the second case, the delays were due to a combination of internal operation and communication issues which at800 have addressed. There is no requirement for the Board to recommend Operational Conditions, which would be disproportionate in the circumstances. The remaining sub-KPIs were passed.

1.4   The Board Members agreed that the current trial period should be extended beyond 31 July until the end of the year as there is not sufficient comparable data at this stage to assess whether the risk-based targeted mitigation model has been

successful. Ofcom are content to extend the trial period to 1 October. They will consider the extension proposal beyond that date at their Policy Executive and confirm their position to the Board.

1.5   The Policy sub-group will be reconvened to review the KPI trial regime and present their proposals to the Board at the August meeting (19 August).

2. at800 update

Roll-out

2.1   As of the end of April, there were 1982 confirmed cases of DTT interference caused by 4G at 800MHz, excluding the 35 cases found within the pilots. There were 866 installer visits to unique addresses in May; to date, there have been a total of 7082 installer appointments, including repeat visits.

Mast Analysis

2.2   The increase in cumulative number of confirmed cases per mast from 0.73 in April to 0.79 in May reflects the rise in the pace of mast activations.

2.3   The rolling average of confirmed cases per activated mast across a 3-month period continues to decrease with 1.84 in the three months to May from 1.89 in the three months to April. The number of cumulative cases reported within 28 days of mast activation for distances of 900m was 0.16 and for 1.5km, 0.22. The monthly cases were 0.26 and 0.47 for 900m and 1.5km respectively.

Audit Summary

2.4   From the 792 audits that have been completed in total, 135 overturned the original installer diagnosis of which 115 were at locations diagnosed as having 4G interference and 20 at locations diagnosed as non-4G interference. In May, 81 audits were undertaken which examined installer visits first completed since the operating trial began in February.

2.5   at800 noted that the whilst both overturn rates of original diagnosis of 4G and non-4G interference continue to improve, it is technically more challenging for the installers to make correct assessments in the initial diagnosis on whether the issue is purely caused by 4G interference and is not just one of many contributing factors which may include the standard of the household's aerial installation and/or equipment and/or pre-existing DTT reception problems in cases where a 4G signal is present.

2.6   at800 continue to invest in ensuring that installers are up to date with the latest information by expanding on their training programme with the provision of refresher courses to renew skills and knowledge as well as regular feedback with auditors.

Data Operations

2.7   Following formal adoption of the LS Telcom prediction model after Board approval was given in May, at800 has used the tool to process the August mailings as the first batch to be run without parallel operation with the previous Punch model.

2.8   at800 are continuing to develop their Management Information database, which will be automatically populated with data from various sources including information from installer visits and audits and the contact centre. The data will be collated into dashboards and reports on forecasting and trending activities that will assist with overall improvements of the business operation.

Viewer Experience Management

2.9   at800 have introduced a new function within their operation to enhance the interaction and experience of the viewer from the point they first make contact, whether via a telephone call to the centre, the website/email or other means including referrals from the press or local MPs, until the case is closed.

2.10   Aside from tracking cases to ensure that services are restored within the first visit as per business policy (where an issue has been identified as related to 4G interference), at800 will monitor the progress of particular cases including those where an installer visit has been booked past the four working day guideline, has not yet been closed on the system, where an original non-4G interference diagnosis was overturned by auditors, a complaint has been made or dissatisfaction expressed or where there has been a request for compensation.

2.11   Whilst ensuring that Key Performance Indictors and Service Level Agreements are being achieved, this approach also helps the organisation to identify process improvements by avoiding repetition of activities, potential training / awareness gaps and how to fill those which, in turn, raise and maintain good standards of service to viewers.

2.12   at800 expects to be able to report on some trends of cases within the Viewer Experience Management function for the August Oversight Board. This will include updates on the first two cases lodged with the organisation's arbitration service,

CISAS (Communications and Internet Services Adjudication Scheme), which relate to compensation claims for work undertaken by installers not contracted by at800.

<u>Research update</u>

2.13 The 4G Insight project to build an understanding of levels of DTT reception signals in Channel 60 area pre and post mast activation continues. Testing has been taking place at sample sites and data loggers are now installed in four households to record DTT and LTE signal levels before, during and post mast activation. It is anticipated that at800 will continue to work closely with the technical representatives of the Coexistence Technical Working Group as this project progresses.

2.14 The datasets obtained from those data loggers that were previously located in households at various locations around England are being processed for review. at800 intends to recruit an external consultant to analyse the data and assess its wider value to inform the LST Telcom model for future interference predications. It is expected that the analysis will also build at800's understanding of DTT and LTE signals as one of the project benefits.

3. KPI report

3.1 at800 reported a 99.29% failure against the KPI A target of 100% service restoration within 10 working days where a household is a primary DTT user. This was due to two reported breaches from a total of 282 resolved cases of confirmed 4G interference.

3.2 In the first case, although 4G signals were mitigated on an initial installer visit, a second visit was required to remove an unnecessary amplifier not identified at the first visit. This visit took place more than 10 days after the initial call.

3.3 at800 stated that this was not strictly a breach as it was established that the interference issue was non-4G. In light of the explanation of the issue and the actions taken, it was agreed by the Board members that at800 should not be held accountable for the time taken to resolve a problem as it was outside their formal remit.

3.4 The second case took a longer than 10 days to resolve as a follow-up audit overturned an original non-4G diagnosis, and there were subsequent operational and communication failures in providing an eventual resolution.

3.5   In line with the trial regime agreements, at800 have already addressed the issues this case flagged. They have also developed additional internal procedures, such as the Viewer Experience Management function (see paras. 2.9 to 2.12) which will assist in identifying similar potential oversights in the future, and the implementation of continuous improvement programmes including ongoing contact centre advisor training, particularly when conducting triage assessments, the use of the Mast Activation Lookup tool and installer awareness via feedback with auditors and refresher training.

3.6   There is no requirement for the Board to recommend Operational Conditions at this stage, which would be disproportionate in the circumstances.

4. Trial of new operating model

4.1   In the May report, I noted my concern that due to a lack of available comparable data through the relatively low mast activations to date, I felt it would not be possible for the Board to assess the success or otherwise of the new operating model by conclusion of the trial at the end of July.

4.2   As such, the Board members considered and agreed my proposal to extend the trial period to the end of 2014 to allow for more data to be gathered. The provisional decision has since been approved by the rest of the Board members via correspondence.

4.3   Mark Caines, the Board's Ofcom representative, will be approaching the Ofcom Policy Executive to seek approval to forbear Operational Conditions beyond 1 October (as currently agreed) and has asked the Board to consider how they wish to address the future position on forbearance of Operational Conditions beyond the end of the trial period.   The Board will consider the options to either recommend that Ofcom amend the Notice/Licence agreement for a permanent change or forebear the Conditions indefinitely, allowing for flexibility in revising the Key Performance Indicator framework.   I expect the Board to make their recommendations to Ofcom after the August meeting. It will be for Ofcom to decide how to act on the Board's advice of course.

4.4   As part of the trial for the risk-based targeted operating model, a revised supporting KPI and Service Level Agreement regime has been in effect. As an overarching KPI, at800 is required to achieve a 100% target of service restoration within 10 working days where the household is a primary DTT user. Since the trial began in February,

there have been minor breaches in a small number of cases, which, if Operational Conditions had been enforced, would have been disproportionate.

4.5   On the evidence of the scale and scope of the few breaches, the Board are in agreement that the trial KPI regime does not provide a balanced indicator of at800's performance. I have asked Roger Darlington to reconvene his Policy sub-group to review the trial KPI regime.   The outcome will be presented to the Board at the August meeting.

5. AOB & Next Meeting

5.1   at800 proposed a change to the Code of Service to clearly state the position regarding the refund of work conducted by non-at800 accredited installers to resolve DTT reception issues.

5.2   The Board members agreed the wording in principle and advised at800 that if they wish to make further changes, they should seek agreement from the Board via email for clearance by exception.

5.3   The next scheduled meeting is due on Wednesday 23 July. However, I have agreed with the Board that we may cancel this meeting and will take a decision on that closer to the date. The August meeting is set for Tuesday 19 August.

David Hendon
Chair
4G/TV Co-existence Oversight Board