

Making automatic enrolment work

A review for the Department for Work and Pensions

Paul Johnson, Frontier Economics and Institute for Fiscal Studies
David Yeandle, Engineering Employers' Federation
Adrian Boulding, Legal & General

October 2010



Making automatic enrolment work

A review for the Department for Work and Pensions

**Paul Johnson, Frontier Economics and Institute for Fiscal Studies
David Yeandle, Engineering Employers' Federation
Adrian Boulding, Legal & General**

Presented to Parliament by the Secretary of State
for Work and Pensions by Command of Her Majesty
October 2010

Cm 7954

£35.50

© Crown copyright 2010

You may re-use this information (not including logos) free of charge in any format or medium, under the terms of the Open Government Licence. To view this licence, visit <http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/> or write to the Information Policy Team, The National Archives, Kew, London TW9 4DU, or e-mail: psi@nationalarchives.gsi.gov.uk.

This publication is also available on <http://www.official-documents.gov.uk/>

ISBN: 9780101795425

Printed in the UK by The Stationery Office Limited
on behalf of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office

ID 2395679 10/10 5763

Printed on paper containing 75% recycled fibre content minimum

This publication can be accessed online at:

www.dwp.gov.uk/automatic-enrolment

For more information about this publication,
contact:

**Workplace Pension Reform
Department for Work and Pensions
7th Floor
Caxton House
Tothill St
London
SW1H 9NA**

Tel: 020 7449 7275

Email: caxtonhouse.auto-enrolmentreview@dwp.gsi.gov.uk

Copies of this publication can be made available
in alternate formats if required.

Contents

Acknowledgements	1
The Review Team	1
Executive Summary	2
Summary of recommendations	9
1 Background to the review	11
1.1 Introduction	12
1.2 The Pensions Commission	12
1.3 Developments since the Pensions Commission reported	15
1.4 The current policy	16
1.5 The review	19
1.6 Report structure	22
2 Individuals	23
2.1 Introduction	24
2.2 Characteristics of those with and without workplace pension provision	25
2.3 The value of pension saving and the role of automatic enrolment	27
2.4 Does everyone actually need to save?	29
2.5 Incentives to save	35
2.6 What does it all mean for the earnings level that triggers automatic enrolment?	42
2.7 Consequences of changes to the State Pension system	42
2.8 Conclusion	43
3 Employers	44
3.1 Introduction	45
3.2 Implications of the reforms for employers	45
3.3 Administrative costs for employers of complying with the reforms	57
3.4 Contribution costs for employers	60
3.5 Ensuring employer compliance with the reforms	64
3.6 Evaluating the regulatory burden	65
3.7 Conclusions	66

4	The role for NEST in the pensions market under automatic enrolment	67
4.1	Introduction	68
4.2	The supply gap in the pensions market	68
4.3	How will automatic enrolment affect profitability in the market?	71
4.4	Stakeholder pension schemes	76
4.5	Meeting the demand created by automatic enrolment: learning from other countries and history	76
4.6	Meeting the demand created by automatic enrolment: our appraisal	79
4.7	Conclusion	92
5	Target group	94
5.1	Introduction	95
5.2	The Earnings Threshold	96
5.3	Introducing waiting periods prior to automatic enrolment	101
5.4	Excluding smaller employers	106
5.5	Excluding older workers	110
5.6	Conclusion	112
6	Reducing regulatory burden	113
6.1	Introduction	114
6.2	Staging	115
6.3	Joining and opt out	118
6.4	Re-enrolment	121
6.5	Qualifying earnings	124
6.6	Supporting small employers	128
6.7	NEST	129
7	Private pension provision under changes to the automatic enrolment policy	133
7.1	Introduction	134
7.2	Profitability and viability under changes to the target group or simplifications to automatic enrolment	134
7.3	Effects of combined options	143
7.4	Conclusions	149

8 Trade-offs and recommendations	151
8.1 Introduction	153
8.2 Ensuring the ‘right’ individuals are automatically enrolled	153
8.3 Options to reduce burdens on small employers	156
8.4 Further deregulatory options for reducing burdens on employers	159
8.5 Impacts of the package of recommendations	165
8.6 Alternative models for delivering pension reform	166
8.7 Further considerations for Government	171
Annex A	174
Annex B	176
Annex C	179

Acknowledgements

We are very grateful to the many people across the pensions industry, amongst employers and their representative groups and amongst employee and consumer representatives, who have given so freely of their time, energy and ideas. We hope we have done them justice.

We would also like to thank Jos Joures, David Haigh and the team of officials at the Department for Work and Pensions for the huge amount of work they have done to support us in completing this review, and for their unwavering enthusiasm, professionalism and commitment. We could not have done it without them.

The Review Team

The review team were:

Paul Johnson – Paul is a senior associate at Frontier Economics and a Research Fellow at the Institute for Fiscal Studies (IFS). He has worked in the economics of public policy for 20 years, including as a director at HM Treasury, Chief Economist at the Department for Education and Skills, and Deputy Director at the IFS. Paul has been deputy head of the Government Economic Service and a council member of the Economic and Social Research Council. He has also researched and published widely on pensions and is a member of the Council of the Pensions Policy Institute.

David Yeandle – David is the Head of Employment Policy of the Engineering Employers' Federation [EEF], the manufacturers' organisation, and his main responsibilities are representing EEF's policies on employment and pensions to the Government and European Union. Before joining EEF in 1995, David worked for the Eastern Electricity Board and Pirelli Cables where he held a number of personnel roles and was Personnel Director from 1989. David is on the Council of the Pension Policy Institute (PPI) and was a member of the independent Pension Provision Group.

Adrian Boulding – Adrian is an actuary with 30 years experience in the field of retirement provision, including working on all types of pension schemes. Currently, he is Pensions Strategy Director at Legal & General. He sits on the Pensions Committee at the Association of British Insurers, the Retirement Council at the Tax Incentivised Savings Association and the External Affairs Committee at the Pensions Management Institute. Adrian is also a member of the independent Advisory Panel of the Pension Quality Mark.