

Music Education in England

The Government Response to
Darren Henley's Review of
Music Education

“Music gives a soul to the universe, wings to the mind, and life to everything.” Plato

Music is an enriching and valuable academic subject. Research evidence shows that a quality music education can improve self-confidence, behaviour and social skills, as well as improve academic attainment in areas such as numeracy, literacy and language.

This is why it is vital that a quality music education is available to all children and young people across the country. It must not become the preserve of those children whose families can afford to pay for tuition and ensemble opportunities.

In asking Darren Henley to carry out a review into music education, the Government sought to establish what is needed to make sure that inequalities in provision across the country are addressed, and that public funding is used to further Government priorities – that every child should experience a rounded cultural education, including the opportunity to learn a musical instrument and to sing.

We are hugely grateful to Darren Henley for his in depth consideration of the issues and for the realistic and practical measures which he has put forward. Some of the recommendations are for others to comment on. Some will need further work and consideration before the government can provide a more substantive response. But we have set out below those issues that we will address immediately.

Over the coming months we will develop and consult on a National Plan for Music Education, which will address the remaining recommendations for Government from the Henley review. The first priority is to announce the amount of funding that the government will make available for local authority music services in 2011-12.

Department for Education funding for music education for 2011-12 will be £82.5m. This will be used as a basis for transforming the way that music education is provided across the country – drawing on our knowledge of what the best music educators already achieve; ensuring that providers work together to plan the best possible music education for every student; and to work to ensure that future funding provided from central government is distributed on an equitable basis; and that the services provided are sustainable.

The Department will start the move towards a national formula for music education funding from 2011-12. It will also look at how best to open up the provision of music education, so that schools and parents have greater choice locally, while improving the accountability of those organisations that receive central funding.

The funding should be used primarily to support front line music education. We know, however, that schools and teachers value highly the resources provided by Sing Up, and that those resources have enabled many classroom teachers to lead singing in their classes and schools. We therefore intend to provide some funding in 2011-12 to enable Sing Up to develop a sustainable future, and the Department shall work closely with the Sing Up Consortium to achieve this.

We have been impressed by the early indications of success from the three pilot *In Harmony* projects. It is early days for the children in these projects and it is important that government

consolidates and learns the lessons from them. We have a clearer idea now of what constitutes a programme that can truly make a difference to the children and communities, and have drawn up criteria for such a programme. The government will therefore commit a further year's funding of up to £500k in total for the existing *In Harmony* projects, providing they can meet, or demonstrate that they will move quickly towards meeting, those criteria.

The review flags up the need for more specialism and expertise amongst music educators. At the heart of our vision for school improvement is identifying excellent practitioners such as National and Local Leaders of Education to provide support and raise standards in neighbouring schools. Building on the success of National and Local Leaders of Education, we intend to identify the best subject and specialist leaders working in schools and to designate them as Specialist Leaders of Education. These will be serving middle and senior school leaders who are outstanding at what they do and who are willing and able to play a role beyond their school supporting others to improve. We consider that these school-to-school approaches can play a key role in enhancing music education.

We intend to invest in the music educators of the future. We will work with the charity Teach First to develop ways in which some of our best young musicians, from Conservatoires and elsewhere, can be encouraged into teaching in some of our most challenging schools.

Many of the students in Conservatoires come through the highly successful Music and Dance Scheme. It is right that the government should both support and be proud of the young people that progress to real excellence through the specialist schools and centres of advanced training. And to ensure that young people continue to benefit from the very highest levels of training, the Department will continue funding the Scheme. As the Henley Review has signalled, we shall of course want to secure value for money and accountability from public funds.

In the 2010 Schools White paper we recognise that children need to be provided with a broad spectrum of cultural experiences and to help us achieve this vision we have asked Darren Henley to undertake a further review looking at cultural education in the round, working closely with key partners in the field. We will provide further details of the remit of this review shortly.

A very great deal of really excellent music education is already available, both locally and nationally, provided by schools, music service, orchestras and community organisations. However, improvements from which all children can benefit have been too slow in some areas, with a danger that a whole generation of young people will miss out on the joy and benefits of music education. Darren Henley's Review, and our response, are designed to ensure that that does not happen.

Detailed below are the Government's initial responses to each of Darren Henley's recommendations. When the National Plan for Music Education is published later this year we will address those recommendations which we need to consider further.

Michael Gove
Secretary of State for Education

Ed Vaizey
Minister for State for Culture and Creative
Industries

Recommendation 1:

Schools should provide children with a broad Music Education, which includes performing, composing, listening, reviewing and evaluating

We will produce a clear statement of the national ambition for music education. The 2010 Schools White Paper “The Importance of Teaching” states that children should expect to be given a rich menu of cultural experiences.

Recommendation 2:

Singing should be an important part of every child’s school life from Early Years through until at least Key Stage 3.

Singing is important for all children and young people. We know that teachers value the resources provided through Sing Up, the National Singing Programme. We intend to support that programme for a further year so that it can continue to provide those resources whilst working towards a position of self-sustainability. The National Plan for Music Education will also strengthen our support for singing for all children and young people.

Recommendation 3:

All children at Key Stage 2 should have the opportunity to learn an instrument through whole class ensemble teaching. Ideally, this would be for a period of one year, but at the barest minimum, one term of weekly tuition should be offered.

The coalition government believes every child should have the opportunity to learn a musical instrument. We are providing continued funding to music services so they can support and extend the whole class ensemble teaching programmes that have been developed. We will say more in due course about what we expect to be delivered through public funding.

Recommendation 4:

There should be a clear progression route for children after the initial free opportunity for instrumental tuition is made available. This route would be means tested, with parents above an agreed income level expected to fund, or part fund, tuition.

Schools and local authorities cannot charge for the initial period of access to instrumental tuition. After that, charges can be made for instrumental lessons that take place during the school day. Schools and local authorities are expected to have a policy for waiving or reducing charges for families on low income. We will examine how effective those policies are in ensuring continuing instrumental tuition for all those children and young people who choose to continue and will act to spread best practice from those areas which provide for those students in most need.

Recommendation 5:

Music should continue to be offered by schools at Key Stage 4 and beyond, allowing pupils to gain GCSE, BTEC and A level qualifications in the subject.

Students are entitled to study an arts subject in Key Stage 4. Our National Curriculum Review will look at how we can extend the space for all students to pursue music and arts qualifications.

Recommendation 6:

Schools should facilitate live music making opportunities and performances for children and young people. Arts Council England funded organisations and other recognised Music Education organisations should be encouraged to play a meaningful role in providing these opportunities, however they should link more closely to curriculum objectives

It is really important that children and young people experience live music making – both as performers and audiences and many of our flagship cultural organisations, orchestras and community musicians, are already providing truly inspirational experiences which benefit thousands of children every year. Schools, in conjunction with the organisations that can provide these opportunities, are best placed to decide what to provide. We will discuss with the Arts Council England what more needs to be done to maximise and improve the quality of the offer from music organisation and to ensure that the opportunities on offer link closely to school priorities.

Recommendation 7:

Beyond the classroom, children should have the opportunity to take part in vocal and instrumental ensembles. These should either be offered in schools or by bringing pupils together from schools in a wider locality.

Yes, children should have opportunities to play in ensembles from an early stage so that they will reap the benefits of music in terms of social skills, team work, concentration and cooperation.

Recommendation 8:

The best model for Music Education includes a combination of classroom teaching, instrumental and vocal music tuition and input from professional musicians. Partnership between organisations is the key to success.

No single organisation can hope to provide the full range of tuition and experiences that constitute a sound music education. We will work over the next six months to lay out how partnerships can develop.

Recommendation 9:

The provision of Music Education should remain a statutory requirement as part of the National Curriculum.

We will be interested to see the views of the music sector on music's place in the National Curriculum. We will ask Darren Henley to send evidence to the Review panel and we urge people and organisations to respond to the National Curriculum Review consultation. We will not, however, pre-empt the outcome of that review.

Recommendation 10:

The Department for Education and the Department for Culture, Media and Sport should work together to develop a national plan for Music Education in England (The National Music Plan).

Both Departments will work with Arts Council England and key stakeholders to develop a National Plan for Music Education which will clearly set out the aspiration for music education; the funding available for the Spending Review period; the National Funding Formula we will adopt to allocate Department for Education funding to each area; and the mechanisms we will adopt to distribute that funding and hold organisations to account for their funding.

Recommendation 11:

Ofsted's remit should be expanded to include the reviewing of standards in Music Education provided in schools by Local Authority Music Services, Arts Council England client organisations or other recognised music delivery organisations. The focus for Ofsted's work in this area should be on the quality of teaching, leadership and management, with the aim of raising standards and increasing levels of achievement among pupils.

We will work with Ofsted to consider an appropriate system for assessing the quality of music education which is bought in by schools.

Recommendation 12:

Arts Council England should fund its client organisations to deliver Music Education programmes in accordance with the National Music Plan. All of these programmes should operate under the same quality framework, inspected by Ofsted.

We will work with Arts Council England and with Ofsted to develop a robust and consistent quality framework for music education programmes.

Recommendation 13:

Music Education in school and out of school should continue to be funded through a mixed economic model. This should include ring fenced funding from central government, funding from Arts Council England, funding from Local Authorities, funding from the National Lottery and through fees from parents. In addition, it is anticipated

that funding will also come for national and local projects from private sources, including charities and foundations and through sponsorship from industry and from philanthropists.

For 2011-12 £82.5m of funding from Department for Education is being allocated to music education. We will distribute this to Local Authorities for the purpose of spending on music education. As part of our work on the National Plan for Music Education we will agree a National Funding Formula which will, over time, even out the largest inequalities in music education funding to local authorities over the last 10 years or more. We shall take the first steps in 2011-12.

We will look to the Arts Council England and other funders to support the vision for music that we will create together through the National Plan for Music Education.

Recommendation 14:

Schools, Local Authority Music Services, Arts Council England client organisations and other recognised delivery organisations should work together to create Music Education Hubs in each Local Authority area. These Hubs should receive ring fenced central government funding to deliver Music Education in each area following an open, advertised bidding process. It is anticipated that there would be a lead organisation (which is likely to be a Local Authority Music Service in almost all cases, but in some cases could also be an Arts Council England client organisation or other recognised delivery organisation). This lead organisation would be directly funded to undertake the leading role in each Hub. The Department for Education should ensure that public funds are invested to provide the highest quality Music Education for children and young people efficiently and with the greatest accountability for the money spent.

In order that all organisations delivering music education work together to provide the best possible opportunities and experiences for children and young people in an area, we will develop a system that makes sure that the best mix of organisations accesses the funding available for an area and is then held to account for the services provided. The National Plan for Music Education will contain more detail.

Recommendation 15:

All partner organisations working together in Music Education Hubs should be encouraged to make back office cost savings. It may also be possible to make savings across a number of local areas through the development of wider partnerships. This could include the merger of senior management and support functions over a number of Local Authority areas. It may also be appropriate for particularly successful Local Authority Music Services to undertake to offer Music Education provision in neighbouring areas.

In the current economic climate our focus is on ensuring that public funding is targeted

primarily at providing front line services and that administration and management costs are kept to a minimum. It will be for the organisations concerned to consider how best to make these savings, but from 2012-13 we will welcome streamlined consortia of organisations bidding to provide services in local areas.

Recommendation 16:

Currently, musical instruments are purchased on an ad hoc basis by music services and schools. This should be replaced by one centralised national purchasing system, building on the recommendations of Sir Philip Green in his recent report to the Cabinet Office about government procurement.

This is a very logical and attractive recommendation. In developing the National Plan for Music Education we will develop a procurement strategy for musical instruments.

Recommendation 17:

Youth Music should operate under a set of tightly targeted objectives, defined and monitored by the Department for Education, the Department for Culture, Media and Sport and Arts Council England. Its administration costs should be in line with other lottery distributors and, like these other bodies, Youth Music should be prevented from spending any government or lottery funds on lobbying and public affairs activities.

English and UK-wide Lottery distributors have already agreed to limit their public affairs activities, to cap total non grant expenditure (that is, total Lottery operating costs) to below 8% of income, and grant administration expenditure to below 5% of income. It is however for the Arts Council England to implement this recommendation and ACE has already been asked by the Lottery Minister, along with the other lottery distributors, to consider how the cost reductions will apply to delegates such as Youth Music

Recommendation 18:

Youth Music should be required to maintain the central resources of the Sing Up programme (the Song Bank and website), which should be made available to schools to use on an on going basis. Funding for the four year Sing Up initiative has always been scheduled to end in March 2011. However, as part of the transition funding in the 2011 12 financial year, a slimmed down Sing Up should receive some funding to help it to ensure that the legacy of the initial four years of investment remains in place.

Through written and verbal submissions to this review, teachers and many people and organisations across the music sector have indicated how valuable the Sing Up website and Songbank are. It is, however, for Arts Council England and Youth Music to decide the extent to which Sing Up could be supported in the future. For 2011-12 we will provide funding to enable Sing Up to develop a sustainable future. We will work closely with the Sing Up

Consortium to achieve this.

Recommendation 19:

Both Arts Council England and Youth Music may wish to examine the possibility of supporting an In Harmony style model moving forwards, perhaps through the development of a standalone charitable trust. Although In Harmony is an expensive initiative, early evidence suggests that whole school provision in a single school with a single lead cultural organisation creates radical improvements in educational attainment for the children involved. It is recommended that existing projects be funded for a further transition year against the membership criteria currently being developed by the Department for Education and the Department for Culture, Media and Sport. If these projects fail to meet the minimum criteria, they should not receive further public funds.

The three In Harmony projects have helped to show how music can have a truly transformational effect on children and their communities and we have developed a clearer understanding of the criteria which transform In Harmony from a good music experience into a regeneration programme. It will be for Arts Council England and Youth Music to decide whether to fund the programme in the future, but for 2011-12 we will provide up to £500k in total to the existing projects, providing they can demonstrate the projects meet those criteria or that they can develop quickly to meet them.

Recommendation 20:

The Music and Dance Scheme and the National Youth Music Organisations should continue to receive funding from the Department for Education, from Arts Council England and from Youth Music. We should acknowledge their role in showcasing the high level of talent that our Music Education system can foster. The public funding for these organisations from the Department for Education, Arts Council England and Youth Music should be directed towards developing young people's musical performance to the highest level. Gaining a place in one of our National Youth Music ensembles is a considerable achievement both for the young person concerned and for the teachers who have helped them to get there. It should be celebrated as such. Given the considerable investment in the Music and Dance Scheme, the Department for Education should ensure that this continues to offer the best possible value for money.

We agree the importance of celebrating our elite musicians as we do our elite sportspeople. The Music and Dance Scheme and the National Youth Music Organisations act as the pinnacle of musical achievement to which all children and young people can aspire. It is important that we continue to support the young people who reach these levels of musical excellence. We will work with Arts Council England and Youth Music to agree future funding priorities for the National Youth Music Organisations that support this recommendation.

We will continue to fund the Music and Dance Scheme. We will work with the providers to ensure that it is securing places for the maximum number of young people at the best value for money.

Recommendation 21: Much primary school classroom teaching of music is provided by non specialist teachers. The amount of time dedicated to music in most Initial Teacher Training courses is inadequate to create a workforce that is confident in its own ability to teach the subject in the classroom. It is recommended that a new minimum number of hours of ITT for primary music teachers be spent on the delivery of Music Education.

Successive Ofsted reports on music have indicated that the confidence and skill levels of primary class teachers prevents the delivery of a sound music education. As part of our overhaul of teacher training we will see how we can embed a greater level of musical knowledge.

Recommendation 22: All primary schools should have access to a specialist music teacher.

Our reforms of initial teacher training (ITT) will look at this.

Recommendation 23: Secondary school music teachers should be allowed the time to work closely with their local Music Education Hubs and feeder primaries.

We will consult head teachers on how this might be achieved.

Recommendation 24: A new qualification should be developed for music educators, which would professionalise and acknowledge their role in and out of school. Primarily delivered through in post training and continuous professional development, musicians who gain this new qualification would be regarded as Qualified Music Educators. It would be as applicable to peripatetic music teachers as it would be to orchestral musicians who carry out Music Education as part of their working lives.

Professionalising the music education workforce would provide to music educators the status they deserve and would enable schools to identify those whose music education practice has been properly assessed. We will talk to the Training and Development Agency for Schools (TDA), Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) and other ITT providers about this.

Recommendation 25:

Conservatoires should be recognised as playing a greater part in the development of a performance led Music Education workforce of the future. All graduates from Conservatoires should study the necessary components within their undergraduate courses to enable them to leave with the Qualified Music Educator award.

We will talk to the Training and Development Agency for Schools (TDA), Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) and other ITT providers about this.

Recommendation 26:

The Conservatoires should work with Teach First to create a Teach Music First programme, which enables our best musicians to spend two years teaching in schools before they move onto their performance career.

Encouraging our best young musicians to consider teaching as a profession or as part of their portfolio career could bring the transformational power of music into many more schools. We will work with the charity Teach First to develop ways in which some of our best young musicians, from Conservatoires and elsewhere, can be encouraged into teaching in some of our most challenging schools.

Recommendation 27:

Leadership training among the Music Education workforce is at best patchy. It is recommended that a credible and experienced management training provider be commissioned to provide a nationwide management development scheme targeted specifically at music educators.

The people who lead the music education workforce must have the necessary skills to do so. In developing the National Plan for Music Education we will discuss this recommendation with Arts Council England, the TDA, the National College, Creative and Cultural Skills and a range of credible training providers to consider what might be done.

Recommendation 28:

All music teachers should be encouraged to register on a national database, which allows them to use a kite mark. This would provide parents with a base level of quality assurance.

We will discuss with the Musicians' Union, Incorporated Society of Musicians and others how such a database might be set up.

Recommendation 29:

The existing place of graded examinations in school performance tables should be better communicated to pupils, parents, schools, Further and Higher Education providers and employers.

We agree.

Recommendation 30:

To make it easier for parents to understand the full breadth of music making opportunities for their children, schools should be encouraged to use their websites to communicate to parents and carers the totality of Music Education opportunities in their local area.

We agree.

Recommendation 31:

Arts Council England's *Take It Away* scheme, which provides loans for the purchase of instruments, should continue. However, it should be focused on providing loans for those in full time education of any age.

It is important that young people are able to learn on good quality instruments; schemes such as *Take It Away* are therefore very important. It is, however, for Arts Council England to decide on this recommendation.

Recommendation 32:

It is recommended that the Department for Education examines how learning from the *Sing Up* and *In Harmony* projects might be developed as a model for narrowing the gap in attainment through the use of the pupil premium.

The Department for Education intends to make evidence available to schools generally about the interventions which are effective in supporting the achievement of disadvantaged children. This evidence is intended to help inform the decisions made by schools about how to use the Pupil Premium to boost attainment. We will actively promote access to successful initiatives in music education which have demonstrably narrowed the gap in attainment between rich and poor.

Recommendation 33:

As part of the National Music Plan, further work should be undertaken to develop a national plan for the use of technology in the delivery of Music Education and to ensure that the workforce is up to date with latest developments. This review should examine how technology could enable better teaching of music (particularly in rural communities) as well as ways in which new methods of creating music that embrace technological innovation

are taught in the classroom.

We agree.

Recommendation 34: The Music Education world is fragmented and uncoordinated. There are too many organisations that have overlapping areas of interest. These organisations need to join together to create one single body.

It is often much more straightforward to interact with a single organisation that represents the views of the sector and can talk to us across the issues. This is, of course, for the sector to decide.

Recommendation 35: A review of charitable organisations working in the Music Education sector should be undertaken with the aim of ensuring that money donated to these charities is being spent in the most efficient and effective way.

It is important that all of the money available to support music education is used in the most efficient and effective way, especially in tight economic times. The Cabinet Office is currently consulting on its Giving Green Paper and the Department is contributing to the Green Paper in a number of ways. We will ensure that the challenges facing charitable music organisations are factored into its development.

Recommendation 36: As suggested in the recent White Paper, *The Importance of Teaching*, it is recommended that the lessons from this Review be applied to other areas of Cultural Education including Dance, Drama, Film, the Visual Arts, Museums, the Built Environment and Heritage.

There is much to be drawn from this Review that will help inform our thinking on how we ensure that every child receives a solid cultural education. There are, however, some specific sectoral issues that we feel need to be addressed. We have, therefore, asked Darren Henley to consider cultural education more widely through a further review. The terms of reference for that review will be drawn up in due course.

You can download this booklet online at: <http://publications.education.gov.uk/>

Search using the ref: DfE-00012-2011

© Crown Copyright 2011

The text in this document (excluding the Royal Arms and departmental or agency logos) may be reproduced free of charge in any format or medium under the terms of the Open Government Licence.

For more information about this licence, visit
<http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/>
or e-mail: psi@nationalarchives.gsi.gov.uk.

The material must be reproduced accurately and not used in a misleading context and acknowledged as Crown copyright.

The title of the source material must also be specified wherever reused.

Where we have identified any third party copyright material, you will need to obtain permission from the copyright holders concerned.